



United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

1849 C Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240



December 16, 2022




PROPERTY: Fayetteville Methodist Church, 120 High Street, Fayetteville, WV

PROJECT NUMBER: 45232, Part 1

APPEAL NUMBER: 1660

ACTION: Final Administrative Decision

Dear 

I have concluded my review of your appeal of the August 18, 2022 Decision of National Park Service that the property cited above does not contribute to the significance of the Fayetteville Historic District (the Decision). The appeal was initiated and conducted in accordance with Department of the Interior regulations [36 CFR Part 67] governing certifications for Federal income tax incentives for historic preservation as specified in the Internal Revenue Code. I thank your representative,  for meeting with me via videoconference on November 17, 2022, and for providing a detailed account of the project.

After careful review of the complete record for this project, including the additional information provided during our video conference, I have determined that the Fayetteville Methodist Church is not a contributing resource within the Fayetteville Historic District and therefore does not qualify as a “certified historic structure” for purposes of Federal tax laws. The denial of certification issued by the National Park Service on August 18, 2022, is hereby affirmed.

The Fayetteville Historic District was listed in the National Register in 1990, with a period of significance from 1843 to 1940. The nomination noted that the Fayetteville Methodist Church was constructed c. 1930 and stated that, “*This masonry building has been the home church of Methodists in Fayetteville for over half a century.*” Accordingly, at the time of the district’s listing, the Fayetteville Methodist Church was considered a contributing building. The historic district was amended in 1997 but the church was still listed as contributing based on the construction date in the original nomination.

The Part 1 application states that the original configuration of the brick masonry church consisted of a shallow truncated hip-roofed sanctuary with the primary entrance in a projecting

gabled portico facing High Street. Due to the terrain of the lot, the rear of the church was two-stories with a coursed ashlar stone lower level. Although the district nomination gives a construction date of c. 1930, a plaque on the church indicates a building date of 1924.

In 1954, a two-story masonry, flat-roofed school and fellowship hall were added to the rear of the church. It is simply detailed, with its mass rising to the bottom of the cornice of the sanctuary and matches the brick over ashlar stone materials of the original church. In 1961, the main entrance façade on High Street was modernized and extended with a narthex, tower, and steeple. These changes significantly altered the primary facade of the building, and together with the 1954 addition, left only the center section of the original church intact. Thus, at the time of listing, the remaining section of the church dating from within the 1843-1940 period of significance of the district had been substantially altered by two additions constructed after the period of significance. The National Register found that the church no longer retains basic design features that convey its historic appearance prior to 1940, and consequently determined that it does not contribute to the significance of the Fayetteville Historic District

As a result of the cumulative impact of the alterations, I have determined that the Fayetteville Methodist Church now reads as a contemporary church building primarily due to its 1960s modernized front façade. Based on its current appearance, it is outside the 1843-1940 period of significance for the Fayetteville Historic District because it does not retain sufficient integrity of its pre-1940 configuration to remain listed as a contributing resource under any criteria. Accordingly, I affirm the August 18, 2022 Decision of National Park Service that the property does not contribute to the significance of the Fayetteville Historic District.

Although I have affirmed the denial of “certified historic structure” status for the property, it may be possible to use the extensive documentation Mr. Gioulis has prepared and work with the West Virginia SHPO to either extend the period of significance for the Fayetteville Historic District or to prepare a nomination for individual listing of the property in the National Register of Historic Places.

As Department of the Interior regulations state, my decision is the final administrative decision with respect to historic structure certifications. A copy of this decision will be provided to the Internal Revenue Service. Questions regarding specific tax consequences of this decision or interpretations of the Internal Revenue Code should be addressed to the appropriate office of the internal Revenue Service.

Sincerely,



John A. Burns, FAIA, FAPT
Chief Appeals Officer
Cultural Resources

cc: SHPO-WV
IRS

