



United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
1849 C Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240



November 13, 2020

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Property: **517 Catherine Street, Richmond, VA**
Project Number: **41336**

Dear [REDACTED]

I have concluded my review of your representative [REDACTED] appeal of the January 10, 2020 Decision of the National Register of Historic Places, National Park Service, denying your request for certification of significance for the property referenced above (the Decision). The appeal was made in accordance with Department of the Interior regulations [36 CFR Part 67] governing certifications for the Federal income tax incentives for historic preservation as specified in the Internal Revenue Code of 1986.

After carefully considering the complete record and all available documentation, I have determined that at the time of your application for certification of significance, the building at 517 Catherine Street did not contribute to the Jackson Ward Historic District in which it is located. Despite having seven months to pursue your appeal, you have not provided additional information to support your position despite multiple requests to do so, nor have you scheduled a meeting to discuss the appeal. Consequently, this decision is based on my review of the information provided in the Part 1 – Evaluation of Significance application, the original 1976 nomination form for the Jackson Ward Historic District, the National Register’s review of the Part 1 application, and additional research I conducted.

The National Register’s review of the nomination form for the Jackson Ward Historic District determined that the written description of 517 Catherine Street in the nomination did not match the photograph of 517 in the Part 1 application. And, although the photograph labeled as 517 Catherine Street in the nomination matched the written description, it also did not match the photograph of the subject property. Thus, the contributing property identified as 517 Catherine

Street in the National Register nomination is not, in fact, the subject house. Rather, it was 515 Catherine Street, which has been subsequently demolished and replaced with two houses constructed in 1990 according to City of Richmond property records.

My research in the Jackson Ward Historic District files in the VCU Libraries Digital Collections confirmed the National Register's analysis. The Assessors Property Card for 517 Catherine Street named the property as the Everett House and listed pertinent information as, "*Ante-bellum, 1854. Flats with novelty siding. 'remodeled' interior and exterior in 1963. Built by Peter Everett who had a butter stall in 6th St. Market.*" The Assessors Property Card for 515 Catherine Street did not give a historic name for the property and listed pertinent information as, "*Ante-bellum, 1854. Double balcony; wooden house; has furnace; 2 side chimneys.*"

The Architectural Survey form for 515 Catherine does not note any significant architectural features. However, the Architectural Survey form for 517 Catherine notes significant architectural features as, "*covered w/asphalt shingles – windows changed*" and in a different handwriting, "*2 story porch, brick end chimney flush w/wall. Peter Everett.*" Thus, it appears that the pertinent information on the Assessors Property Card for 515 Catherine was erroneously copied onto the Architectural Survey form for 517 Catherine and was subsequently included in the National Register nomination.

The Richmond Commission of Architectural Review took color slides of 515 Catherine Street in 1988, presumably because the property was proposed for demolition. The slides clearly show the two-story porch and two side chimneys on 515 and confirm that it and the adjacent 517 had not changed since the survey photographs taken in the early 1970s but not published until 1978. Contemporary photographs in City of Richmond property records show that 517 Catherine is little changed from its 1970s appearance, but there are two new townhomes where 515 Catherine once stood.

The street facade of 517 Catherine Street has been significantly altered from that of an 1850s townhome by having its historically vertical window openings converted to a horizontal orientation with aluminum slider windows, which is consistent with the annotation on the Assessors Property Card and Architectural Survey forms that the house was remodeled inside and out in 1963, the windows altered, and the entire house covered in asphalt shingles. Thus, the house currently identified as 517 Catherine Street in the Part 1 application has had alterations inconsistent with the historic character of the district, its significance, and its period of significance. Accordingly, the January 10, 2020 Decision issued by National Register denying "certified historic structure" status for this building is hereby affirmed.

As Department of Interior regulations provide, my decision is the final administrative decision regarding certifications of significance. A copy of this decision will be provided to the Internal Revenue Service. Questions concerning specific tax consequences of this decision, or interpretations of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986 should be addressed to the appropriate office of the Internal Revenue Service.

Sincerely,



John A. Burns, FAIA, FAPT
Chief Appeals Officer
Cultural Resources

cc: SHPO-VA
IRS

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]