

4 Suitability



The Milpitas Hacienda, Richard Crusius photo; oak savanna, Brenda Tharp photo

Suitability

Introduction

An area is considered suitable for addition to the national park system if it represents a natural or cultural resource type that is not already adequately represented in the system, or is not comparably represented and protected for public enjoyment by another land managing entity, including the private sector, other federal agencies, Tribal, state, or local governments.

Adequacy of representation is determined on a case-by-case basis by comparing the potential addition to other comparably managed areas representing the same resource type, while considering differences or similarities in the character, quality, quantity, or combination of resource values. The comparative analysis also addresses rarity of the resources, interpretive and educational potential, and similar resources already protected in the national park system or by another land managing entity. The comparison results in a determination of whether the proposed new area would expand, enhance, or duplicate resource protection or visitor use opportunities found in other comparably managed areas.

Adequacy of Representation of Themes

The National Park Service has developed a thematic framework for evaluating potential and existing units within the national park system. The basic thematic framework includes a series of natural and cultural themes. This section (1) describes how the resources fit into the thematic framework and (2) evaluates the suitability of including the resources in the national park system by examining existing park units and other sites in public ownership throughout the country to determine the extent to which the story and themes of resources considered by this study are told elsewhere.

CULTURAL THEMES

The NPS thematic framework provides guidance on:

1. evaluating the significance of resources for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, for designation as national historic landmarks, or for potential addition to the national park system
2. assessing how well the themes are currently represented in existing units of the national park system and in other recognized areas; and,
3. expanding and enhancing the interpretive programs at existing units of the national park system to provide a fuller understanding of our nation's past. (NPS 2000)

Cultural Themes and Topics Represented in Fort Hunter Liggett:

- **Expressing Cultural Values**
 - architecture, landscape architecture, and urban design
 - mass media
- **Developing the American Economy**
 - transportation and communication
- **Peopling Places**
 - encounters, conflicts, and colonization

Expressing Cultural Values

The theme “expressing cultural values” covers expressions of culture – people's beliefs about themselves and the world they inhabit. This theme also encompasses the ways that people communicate their moral and aesthetic values (NPS 2000). The Milpitas Hacienda at Fort Hunter Liggett represents cultural values through the topics “architecture” and “mass media.” As described in the “Significance” chapter of this report, the national significance of the Milpitas Hacienda lies in its association with architect Julia Morgan and media magnate William Randolph Hearst.

Architecture. The Milpitas Hacienda represents the theme “expressing cultural values” as part of an American country house complex owned and commissioned by a powerful media magnate of the early 20th century. Country houses were built in locations away from cities, closer to nature. These estates provided an expansive approach to architecture, entertainment, and landscape (Kastner 2000).

The Central California estate that includes La Cuesta Encantada (Hearst Castle®) and the Milpitas Hacienda was the most expansive and elaborate of Hearst’s country estates. While La Cuesta Encantada is the most distinctive feature of the estate and the Hearst/Morgan collaboration, the landscape and its many supporting structures complete Hearst’s romantic vision of country estate that included many other amenities and supporting structures. Agricultural use of the land, siting of structures and amenities in the landscape, architectural styles and execution of construction were all carefully planned by Hearst and Morgan.

As supporting structures on Hearst’s estate, the Milpitas Hacienda, the San Simeon Village houses, the concrete mission warehouse, and the poultry ranch were all designed by Morgan and Hearst in an architectural style that Hearst referred to as “the early California style.” The Milpitas Hacienda is the most elaborate among these supporting structures because of its scale, masterful design, ornamentation, skilled use of reinforced concrete, and integrity.



William Randolph Hearst, DN-0052955, *Chicago Daily News negatives collection*, Chicago Historical Society.

The integrity of the cultural landscape of Hearst’s 250,000-acre historic estate has largely been preserved through the ownership and management of the Hearst Corporation and the US Army. Continued protection is expected through US Army management of Fort Hunter Liggett lands and a conservation easement on the Hearst Corporation lands.

Mass Media. The Milpitas Hacienda represents the topic “mass media” through its relationship to the media empire of William Randolph Hearst. Through his media empire, Hearst played an important role in many events of national importance. He popularized “yellow journalism,” aiming for mass appeal, emphasizing sensation, sex, scandals, crusades, crime, and human interest. Hearst used his newspapers to voice his views and played a highly influential role in the national and international events of his era. He played a part in bringing about the Spanish - American War by taking up the cause of Cuban independence and he opposed American entrance into World Wars I and II. Hearst also used his newspapers to gain public acceptance of reforms such as regulation of big business and the graduated income tax (NPS 1972).

Hearst’s building of his country estate mirrored the empire building of his massive media conglomerate. He amassed land, buildings, and artwork in the same way that he acquired and controlled newspapers. The Milpitas Hacienda, as the northern ranching headquarters for his estate and a distant recreational destination for Hearst and his guests, illustrates the vast scale of his holdings. The prominent siting of La Cuesta Encantada on a hill 1,600 feet above the Pacific Ocean illustrates Hearst’s quest for power and control.

Developing the American Economy

The theme “developing the American economy” reflects the ways Americans have worked, including slavery, servitude, and non-wage as well as paid labor. It also reflects the ways they have materially sustained themselves by the processes of extraction, agriculture, production, distribution, and consumption of goods and

services. In examining the diverse working experiences of the American people, this theme encompasses the activities of farmers, workers, entrepreneurs, and managers, as well as the technology around them (NPS 2000). The Milpitas Hacienda represents the theme “developing the American economy” and the topic “transportation and communication” through Hearst’s media businesses and his massive California landholdings, described above under “mass media.”

Peopling Places

The theme “peopling places” examines human population movement and change through prehistoric and historic times. Life in America began with migrations many thousands of years ago. Centuries of migrations and encounters have resulted in diverse forms of individual and group interaction, from peaceful accommodation to warfare and extermination through exposure to new diseases. Communities, too, have evolved according to cultural norms, historical circumstances, and environmental contingencies. The nature of communities is varied, dynamic, and complex (NPS 2000). The Fort Hunter Liggett study area has cultural resources including remains of Spanish settlement that represent the theme “peopling places” and the topic “encounters, conflicts, and colonization.”

Encounters, Conflicts, and Colonization. The topic “encounters, conflicts, and colonization,” in relation to Spanish exploration and settlement, refers to “all activities by Spain within the present continental and overseas territory of the United States from Columbus’ landing on it (NPS 2000).” The story of Mission life, the Salinans, and the Anza expedition can be told through the study area’s oak savanna landscape and the archeological resources associated with the Mission and the Salinans.

Mission San Antonio de Padua, an inholding within Fort Hunter Liggett is evaluated because of the important connections of the Mission to the resources that are on Fort Hunter Liggett land. It was the third of the 21 missions established in California. A working community was established

at the Mission, including hundreds of Salinans living at the site, raising cattle, corn, wheat, quarrying building materials, in addition to the religious activities of the church. Unlike most of the other missions, no larger community grew surrounding the Mission. The characteristic oak savanna landscape surrounding the Mission remains one of the most historically intact landscape settings of all the California Missions.

The Juan Bautista de Anza National Historic Trail commemorates the route followed by Anza, a Spanish commander, in 1775–76 when he led a contingent of 30 soldiers and their families to found a presidio and mission near the San Francisco Bay. The historic route of the Anza Trail follows the San Antonio River upstream to the Mission San Antonio de Padua. The soldiers and families that Anza escorted brought with them their language, traditions, and diverse New World Hispanic culture. Almost all the expedition members were born on this continent and had mixed European, African or Indian parentage. These influences changed the lives of the indigenous peoples and shaped the development of Arizona and California.



Reenactment of the Anza Trail expedition, NPS photo

Comparisons to Similar Resources Managed by the National Park Service and by Other Entities

Expressing Cultural Values

There are no National Park Service units that represent the combination of themes of the Milpitas Hacienda and La Cuesta Encantada (Hearst Castle®) — “expressing cultural values” through architecture and mass media and “developing the American economy” through communications businesses. There are no properties associated with William Randolph Hearst or Julia Morgan represented in the national park system. The National Park Service includes units that represent the theme “expressing cultural values” through architecture in the form of mansions and country estates, but few are located on the west coast.

The following discussion compares character, quality, quantity, or combination of resources and opportunities for public enjoyment of the

Milpitas Hacienda and Hearst San Simeon Estate NHL to these other sites. These sites serve to illustrate distinctions between Hearst’s Milpitas Hacienda as part of his larger estate to other similar country estates.

National Park Service Sites

- **The Vanderbilt Mansion National Historic Site (NHS)** at Hyde Park, New York is a palatial estate built in the Italian Renaissance style in the 1890s by tycoon Frederick William Vanderbilt. The Vanderbilt family amassed an immense fortune in the newly developing railroad industry. The Vanderbilt Mansion represents the types of country estates constructed by wealthy industrialists. Beaux-Arts architects, including the firm of McKim, Mead, and White and Richard Morris Hunt were hired by the Vanderbilt family to design the mansion.

The Vanderbilt Estate at Hyde Park was built on a grand scale using limestone facing and



Vanderbilt Mansion National Historic Site, NPS photos

Scotty's Castle, NPS photo and illustration

modern steel and concrete supports. It has detailed ornamentation including carved wood ceilings. Other buildings and amenities at the estate include guest houses, gardens, a pergola, and ranch lands. The Vanderbilts used their mansion for entertaining the elite. The Vanderbilt Estate is perhaps the best, most intact example of this type of estate on the east coast. Except for some of the family's belongings, the mansion and its contents remain unchanged from the time the Vanderbilts lived here.

Visitor opportunities provided at the Vanderbilt Mansion NHS include ranger-guided tours, theme-based programs that include the lifestyle of the Vanderbilts and their contemporaries, and a visitor center with exhibits and a bookstore. The grounds feature breathtaking views of the Hudson River and Catskill Mountains. The formal gardens, once abandoned, have been restored. No lodging or camping is available in the park (NPS 2004a).

- **Scotty's Castle in Death Valley National Park** was built by gold prospector and teller-of-tall-tales Walter Scott (Death Valley Scotty) and Chicago insurance magnate Albert Johnson during the same period as the Milpitas Hacienda. Scotty's Castle showcases technological innovation and unequaled craftsmanship in a remote desert location. The resulting structure is a beautiful example of Spanish-Mediterranean styling filled with unique hand-wrought iron and tile, custom-made furniture, hand-selected tapestries and many European antiques.

Scotty's Castle was part of a 1,500-acre estate with very little landscaping because of its desert location. Construction of Scotty's Castle was halted in 1931 due to a land dispute, and even today the Castle remains unfinished.

Visitor opportunities are provided at Scotty's Castle as part of Death Valley National Park. More than 100,000 visitors come to Scotty's Castle each year. Park rangers conduct tours

on a daily basis for hundreds of visitors using living history interpretation, house tours, and technology tours (focused on the technology that Johnson used in building and living in his castle). Scotty's Castle is a day-use area only. Lodging and camping are available at other locations within the park (NPS 2004b).

Sites Managed by Other Entities

There are other examples of estates and country houses that represent the theme expressing cultural values through architecture that are owned by other agencies and private organizations.

- The most notable of these estates is George Washington Vanderbilt's **Biltmore Estate** in Asheville, North Carolina. The Biltmore, inspired by the country houses of the French Renaissance, is the largest private residence in the United States and is a national historic landmark. The 250-room late Gothic French chateau and surrounding structures were designed by Beaux-Arts architect Richard Morris Hunt. Vanderbilt and Hunt traveled throughout Europe to collect furniture, artwork, and architectural pieces for the property. The house has been preserved and is filled with thousands of original furnishings. "From the opulent living quarters enjoyed by family and friends to the downstairs domain of the domestic staff, Biltmore House presents a detailed portrait of life on a great 19th-century country estate (The Biltmore Company 2003)." The gardens were designed by America's premier landscape architect, Frederick Olmsted. His plans and many of the original plants have been preserved. The estate was originally comprised of 125,000 acres. Today it comprises 8,000 acres.

The estate is owned and managed today by descendants of George Vanderbilt under the Biltmore Company. It remains a self-sufficient, working estate, with preservation and maintenance of the estate funded by ticket sales to 900,000 visitors annually, retail,

and restaurant purchases. Visitor opportunities include a school program, self-guided tour of Biltmore House, specialty guided tours, gardens, and a winery. Outdoor activities include biking, horseback riding, rafting, and more. The estate includes an equestrian center and extensive trail system.

- International Harvester vice president James Deering's **Villa Vizcaya** in Coral Gables, Florida, was designed by architect F. Burrall Hoffman and designer Paul Chalfin, and completed in 1916. It is a national historic landmark that preserves in its historical context a romantic Italian villa on Biscayne Bay. The designers used various styles of architecture to have the villa appear as if it had stood for 400 years and had been occupied by several generations of a family. Vizcaya is constructed of reinforced concrete with the exterior walls stuccoed and painted to appear weathered. Originally comprising 180 acres, Vizcaya was designed to resemble a typical Italian villa, self-sufficient, with a dairy, poultry house, mule stable, greenhouse, and staff residences. All decorative elements of Vizcaya including furniture, lighting fixtures, doors, wall panels, ceilings, paintings, and fireplaces were purchased by Deering and Chalfin on expeditions throughout Europe.

Miami-Dade County opened Vizcaya as a museum in 1952 and extensive restoration has brought the house and the remaining 50 acres back to the way they appeared during Deering's day. Nearly 200,000 people visit Vizcaya each year. The museum offers general guided tours, specialized tours, and school group tours. Vizcaya's inner courtyard, outside terraces and formal Italian gardens are also available for rent for special events (Vizcaya Museum and Gardens 2004).

- **Olana** is a 250-acre estate in Hudson, New York. Designed by Hudson River School artist Frederic Edwin Church, the estate includes a cottage designed by Richard Morris Hunt and a Persian style mansion designed by Calvert

Vaux. Church chose the Persian style architecture after he and his family visited Europe and the Middle East. The Olana estate is a national historic landmark and a New York State Historic Site. The State of New York and the Olana Preservation partnership work cooperatively in the operation of the Olana estate. While scenic vistas are threatened by nearby development, and outbuildings and landscape features are threatened by deterioration, the estate still looks much the same as when Church had lived there. State and non-profit efforts are underway to address the threats. The Olana State Historic Site offers educational programs, guided tours of the house and grounds (The Olana Partnership 2004).

Comparisons Analysis: Expressing Cultural Values

Hearst's historic 250,000-acre estate is unique compared to these other sites representing country estates. Although they share some similarities such as their extravagance, ornamentation, use of concrete, and European and Middle Eastern art and furnishings, these other sites do not compare in scale and character.

Hearst's historic estate stands out among country estates in its representation of different styles and interpretation of architecture. The "early California" style architecture at the Milpitas Hacienda differs from the architectural styles used at the other country estates, including Italian Renaissance and late Gothic French chateaux. Julia Morgan, while trained in the same schools as other architects of the day, and Hearst created unique architectural interpretations drawing upon their California environment as well as indulging Hearst's passionate interests. The dramatic siting of La Cuesta Encantada high on a ridge overlooking Hearst's landholdings and the Pacific Coast, and likewise, the siting of the Milpitas Hacienda on a hill in connection with Hearst's ranching operation add to their character.

The 250,000-acre historic Hearst estate was much larger than the Biltmore estate's 125,000 acres, the 600-acre historic Vanderbilt estate or

the 1,500-acre-estate that encompassed Scotty's Castle. The landscape surrounding La Cuesta Encantada, including the elaborate gardens, lush grasslands, and miles of Central California mountain and coastline set it apart from other estates. To this day, the scenic qualities of the original 250,000-acre Hearst estate have largely been protected. The Hearst estate is also a rare example of such an estate on the west coast of the United States. The Milpitas Hacienda and San Simeon estate together are perhaps the finest example on the west coast of a wealthy industrialist's country estate.

The Milpitas Hacienda provides an important opportunity to expand the interpretation of Hearst's and Morgan's lives and careers. The Hearst San Simeon State Historical Monument and the Milpitas Hacienda offer the visitor the opportunity to experience two very different aspects of Hearst's extensive estate, and two examples of the collaborative architectural relationship between Hearst and Morgan. The Milpitas Hacienda currently provides the only possibility for experiential interpretation of the architecture created by the Morgan/Hearst collaboration, including the opportunity for overnight lodging. Few country house estates offer this type of experience.

Interpretive and Educational Potential

California State Parks has been operating Hearst San Simeon State Historical Monument since 1958. It has been visited by 33 million people since that time. The Milpitas Hacienda would expand and enhance California State Parks operation of Hearst San Simeon State Historical Monument in interpreting the full story of Hearst's vision of a country estate. Among the other support buildings associated with the estate, the Milpitas Hacienda is the only building available for public use. The addition of the Milpitas Hacienda would provide additional context for interpreting the history of Hearst's estate and Julia Morgan's work. Morgan designed upwards of 700 buildings, including schools, clubs, conference centers, churches, hospitals, and residences) over

the course of her long career (Boutelle 1995). No building once owned by Hearst and no work of Julia Morgan is currently represented in the national park system.

At Hearst San Simeon State Historical Monument, visitor interpretation and education include tours of the main house, guest houses, pools, and gardens, as well as an IMAX film. Visitors have access to Hearst Castle only on tightly timed guided tours, and have access to Hearst's lands only on the bus ride from the visitor center up the hill to La Cuesta Encantada. The addition of the Milpitas Hacienda would provide opportunities to expand the visitor experience at the Hearst San Simeon State Historical Monument. The Hacienda, as the northern extent of Hearst's former estate and a recreational destination for Hearst and his guests conveys the grandness of Hearst's vision and the vastness of his estate as it existed in the peak of his influence.

Peopling Places

While the national park system includes many park units that address European settlement and colonization, as well as contact and conflict with Native Americans, these broad themes are uniquely represented at Fort Hunter Liggett. The Fort Hunter Liggett study area provides unique representation of the theme "peopling places" and the topic "encounters, conflicts, and colonization" through the Juan Bautista de Anza National Historic Trail, the Mission San Antonio de Padua and its associated cultural resources, and archeological sites.

The discussion below compares character, quality, quantity, or combination of resources and opportunities for public enjoyment of the cultural resources within the Fort Hunter Liggett study area that represent Spanish settlement and their encounter with the native Salinan people to other similar sites.

National Park Service Sites

- San Antonio Missions National Historical Park in San Antonio, Texas tells the story of Spanish settlement in Texas through four Spanish missions (San José, San Juan, Espada, and Concepcion) that were part of a colonization system that stretched across the Spanish Southwest in the 17th through 19th centuries. The San Antonio missions are among the few relatively intact examples of the colonial missions in the Southwest. The San Antonio missions today represent a connection with the past and they remain active parishes. In addition to the missions, the park also protects habitats including riparian areas along the river and acequias and scrubland. San Antonio Missions National Historical Park is within the city limits of the city of San Antonio. In this urban location, the Missions are impacted by environmental factors such as degraded air quality, modern intrusions to scenic vistas, noise, disturbed lands, and non-native species.



San Antonio Missions National Historical Park, NPS photo

Visitor facilities and opportunities include museums at the park visitor center and Mission San Juan, interpretive films, self-guided walks, guided tours to see an active acequia (aqueduct or irrigation ditch) and ranch (NPS 2004c).

- The Presidio of San Francisco in California was founded in 1776 when Juan Bautista de Anza led Spanish soldiers and missionaries to establish this northernmost outpost of the Spanish empire in western North America on the San Francisco Bay. The Presidio was in continuous military use from 1776 until 1994. Over two centuries the Army transformed the Presidio grounds from the mostly empty windswept dunes and scrub that had greeted the Anza expedition to a verdant, preeminent military post. Because of this major transformation, there is little fabric left of the original Spanish settlement.

The Presidio is now part of the Golden Gate National Recreation Area, and is a national historic landmark district. The Presidio is rich in archeological resources, spanning from Native American sites through the Spanish and Mexican periods and United States Army use. An archeological management strategy is being prepared, which will identify methods for studying, preserving, and interpreting the archeological resources including the original 1776 Spanish settlement.

Visitors have the opportunity to enjoy the history and beauty of the Presidio including its historic architecture. The Presidio contains 11 miles of hiking trails, including part of the Juan Bautista de Anza National Historic Trail. The Presidio provides extensive educational programs (NPS 2004d).

- Tumacácori National Historical Park in the upper Santa Cruz River Valley of southern Arizona is comprised of the abandoned ruins of three Spanish colonial missions (San José de Tumacácori, Los Santos Ángeles de Guevavi, and San Cayetano de Calabazas). Established in 1908, the park tells the story of

Spanish missionaries encountering the native people of southern Arizona. The park was established in 1908; stabilization of the church ruins began in 1919. The Sonoran riparian landscape has been preserved and protected by the park. The landscape setting of Tumacácori National Historical Park is little changed from Anza's visit.

The park offers living history programs which includes the story of Juan Bautista de Anza, "captain" of the Tubac Presidio and of the Anza expedition, which traveled through Tumacácori. There are tours of the grounds, river walks, and school programs (NPS 2004).



Tumacacori National Historical Park, NPS photo.

Sites Managed by Other Entities

■ California Missions: There are 21 missions along the California Coast, established between 1769 to 1823. While each has its own unique story, all were established by Father Junipero Serra as part of Spain's colonization of the Americas. After Mexico gained independence from Spain, Mexico determined that it could no longer afford to keep the missions running, and in 1834 decided to end the mission system and sell all of the lands. Most of the missions suffered serious deterioration during this period. In 1863 legislation returned the 21 missions to the Catholic Church.

All 21 California missions are open to the public to varying extents. Two are owned and managed by California State Parks as state historical parks. The other 19 are owned and managed by the Catholic Church, which has interests both in preserving their history and in maintaining active, evolving parish

churches. Fourteen of the missions are home to active parishes and offer regular services. Many offer museums and gardens as well as the church building. Most of the missions are now surrounded by urban or otherwise modern settings. Thirteen missions are on the National Register of Historic Places; 6 are national historic landmarks. The only other mission that comes close to Mission San Antonio de Padua for its protected landscape is La Purisima Mission State Historic Park in Lompoc, California.

Comparisons Analysis: Peopling Places

The cultural resources at Fort Hunter Liggett that represent "Peopling Places" are unique compared to sites in California and the Southwest. Missions in Arizona and Texas present a different aspect of the Spanish settlement story compared to the resources at Fort Hunter Liggett. Mission San Antonio de Padua and the surrounding landscape on Fort Hunter Liggett retain greater integrity than other California Missions and Presidios. The landscape of Fort Hunter Liggett provides a setting similar to that of when Juan Bautista de Anza camped at the area. The Mission San Antonio de Padua still retains its integrity and is located on the site where the church was built in 1813. The church was restored since that time. The resources at Fort Hunter Liggett provide an important opportunity to expand the interpretation of Salinan culture, Spanish exploration and settlement in California.

Interpretive and Educational Potential

Resources at Fort Hunter Liggett enable the Anza Trail to tell a universal story of migrants crossing great distances and enduring tremendous hardships in the hope of a better way of life. The eventual expansion of the Spanish settlements that resulted from the Anza Trail came at the expense of indigenous peoples and their cultures. Along the trail route, the visitor can experience the varied landscapes; learn the stories of the expedition, its members, and descendants; better understand the American Indian role in the expedition and the diversity of their cultures; and