

**CHAPTER 1:
TREATMENT ALTERNATIVES AND
IMPLICATIONS**







CHAPTER 1: TREATMENT ALTERNATIVES AND IMPLICATIONS

As a federally owned property listed on the National Register of Historic Places and a designated National Historic Landmark, decisions regarding the treatment of Eisenhower NHS must be consistent with the 1996 *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. These standards specify four distinct, but interrelated, approaches to the treatment of historic properties. Application of these treatments to historic landscapes is further defined in the Secretary's 1996 *Guidelines for the Treatment of Cultural Landscapes*. The treatment option prescribed in the 1987 GMP, "preservation with selective restoration" needs to be reconsidered with these more recent definitions. Implications for alternative treatments are described below and in Table 1.1. Considerations include maintenance requirements, interpretation, public access and safety, environmental sustainability, cost, and park operations.

TREATMENT ALTERNATIVES

Preservation

Preservation focuses on the maintenance and repair of existing historic materials and retention of a property's form as it has evolved over time. This approach prescribes the maintenance and repair of the site as it currently exists, and allows existing features to be replaced in-kind, yet does not permit the addition of new features. Since acquisition in 1967, the park service has adopted a preservation approach for the property. However, after more than thirty-nine years have passed, some features, particularly trees and shrubs have declined, been removed, and now need to be replaced. The shade and root systems of healthy mature trees installed by the Eisenhowers often hinders the growth of young replacement plants. The appearance of the property has evolved from an assortment of ornamental trees and shrubs and shade trees, to a landscape dominated by large shade trees, particularly white pines. Increased emphasis on watershed protection has resulted in the growth of vegetation along the stream between Farms #1 and #2, obscuring views between the two farms.

Since preservation focuses on the maintenance and repair of existing historic materials, this treatment involves the least intervention and perpetuates the current

management practices. Preservation is likely to be the least expensive treatment alternative, with one possible exception. A preservation approach requires replacement of plants in-kind and in location. For example, the declining 'Hopi' crabapples planted along the drive during the Eisenhower period would be propagated if not commercially available. The propagated trees would then serve as replacements. Replacing plants with a different cultivar is considered rehabilitation.

Rehabilitation

Rehabilitation acknowledges the need to meet continuing or changing uses through alterations or new additions while retaining the historic character of the property. It allows for repairs and alterations of the cultural landscape, and for improving the utility and function of landscape features. It is used to make an efficient, compatible use while preserving those portions or features of the property that contribute to its historical significance. For some historic properties, changes are necessary to accommodate visitor use, such as the addition of parking, concessions, and visitor facilities or the modification of circulation surfaces to withstand high use and meet ADA accessibility standards. In other cases, modifications are necessary for sustainable management, such as the reduction of formal gardens or the elimination of agricultural practices.

A rehabilitation strategy allows for the replacement of missing features as they existed historically based on documentary evidence, or replacement with compatible features. The costs would be similar to those for a preservation approach. At Eisenhower NHS, accommodation of visitor services has resulted in some rehabilitation, such as the conversion of the storage building to the reception center and the removal of a gate for bus circulation. With a rehabilitation approach, plantings that have died or have not thrived since the Eisenhower's departure, either due to reduced maintenance or unsuitable climate, could be replaced with substitute species. For example, the 'Hopi' crabapples along the drive could be replaced with a substitute cultivar. To retain the uniformity of the planting, one substitute cultivar would be selected. Under the rehabilitation approach, however, one must constantly assess the impacts of minor changes to the property's overall historic integrity. The cumulative effect of many



TABLE 1.1
IMPLICATIONS FOR TREATMENT ALTERNATIVES

Preservation	Rehabilitation	Restoration
Spatial organization & natural features		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve landscape composed predominantly of mature shade trees. • Replace in-kind features that decay or decline. • Allow existing vegetation to grow in wetland and stream areas but prevent further growth by selective cutting and thinning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rehabilitate plantings that have lost all understory plants by planting young trees with ornamental plants. • Manage wetland and stream areas for ecological benefits of watershed protection. • Thin vegetation as much as possible to preserve historic views. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore ornamental plantings and gardens, many more features in the landscape. • Reduce plantings in wetland and stream areas to their circa 1967 appearance.
Land use and cultural traditions		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing agricultural use for grazing and crop production. • Replace deteriorated fences in kind and in location. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintain agricultural use for grazing and crop production. • Replace deteriorated fences in kind and in location as feasible. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore agricultural use to circa 1967 levels. • Restore missing fence lines or replace non-historic fence materials or styles.
Vegetation		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing vegetation. • Replace in kind those plants that decline. • Propagate species and cultivars that are no longer commercially available. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace plants in-kind where feasible. • Replant missing trees, shrubs and ornamental plantings that are missing based on 1969 documentation. • Substitute plantings that are no longer commercially available. • Maintain vegetable garden and ornamental plantings to a size that is sustainable with maintenance operations. • Do not restore crown vetch in wooded corridors (invasive). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore plantings to their circa 1967 appearance. • Remove large trees that shade areas that were previously planted with ornamental plants, shrubs, and small trees. • Replant short lived fruit trees such as peach, nectarine, and cherry. • Restore vegetable garden to its former size and crops. • Restore crown vetch in wooded corridors.
Views		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing views by removing or thinning vegetation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve historic views where possible by removing or thinning vegetation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore historic views by removing or thinning vegetation.
Circulation		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing circulation system of roads and paths. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace existing hardened paths with surface material that is more compatible with historic scene. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore historic surface treatments and maintain hardened ADA accessible network of parking areas, ramps and paths.
Buildings, Structures, and cluster arrangements		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing buildings and uses. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reuse buildings to accommodate visitor services and preservation functions. • Retain as much historic fabric and use as possible. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore buildings to historic uses, rebuild bank barn at Farm #2.
Small-scale Features		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserve existing small-scale features. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore some small scale features that are missing, such as the state plaques on trees along the drive. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore small scale features that are missing such as the state plaques on trees along the drive.
Archeology		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protect archeological sites. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protect archeological sites. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protect archeological sites.



substitutions of plant species and other modifications to facilitate park operations could compromise the historical setting, materials, and feeling of the site.

Restoration

Restoration is undertaken to depict a property at a particular time in its history, while removing evidence of other periods. This approach would require depiction of the site at a certain date or period of time. The “period of significance” of 1951 to circa 1967 implies restoration of the site to its circa 1967 appearance. A restoration approach would require reversing the many minor modifications to the property since it was acquired by the park service, with one major exception. Under the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for restoration, provisions are made to allow accessible parking, circulation, and facilities to meet the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) guidelines. Existing accessibility features such as parking spaces, ramps, and hard surfaced walkways would be retained.

Restoration would be the most costly alternative and require the highest level of maintenance. A restoration strategy would result in reverting a portion of the Farm #1 barn yard to shale, rebuilding the bank barn at Farm #2, and replacing overgrown plantings in-kind, such as mature tree specimens at the teahouse area, the screen between the house and barn, and the spruce, pine and crabapple planting along the drive. The ‘Hopi’ crabapples planted along the drive during the Eisenhower period would be propagated if not commercially available. The vegetable garden would be restored to its circa 1967 size.

Reconstruction

Reconstruction recreates vanished or non-surviving portions of a property for historic purposes. This approach would only be appropriate if historic characteristics of the site were destroyed or if the Civil War battlefield within the park boundaries was determined so significant that its re-creation, by the removal of the Eisenhower elements, was critical to the park’s interpretive mission. This treatment option is rarely selected and is not considered an appropriate or necessary option for the Eisenhower property.

PREFERRED TREATMENT ALTERNATIVE

Based on the changes in vegetation and the changes made to the landscape to accommodate visitors, the recommended treatment for the Eisenhower NHS is rehabilitation. This approach will focus on the continued maintenance and repair of landscape features remaining from the period of significance, which ends in 1969. When feasible, vegetation, fences, circulation surfaces, and small-scale features will be replaced in kind. However, as has been the case since the NPS converted the private estate into a public historic site, rehabilitation will take place to ensure visitor safety and comfort, such as hardened circulation surfaces. Rehabilitation will also allow for sustainable maintenance practices. The ‘Hopi’ crabapples, for example, would be replaced with a disease-resistant variety. Treatment of the stream corridors will be carried out in concert with the Chesapeake Bay Act to protect water quality and natural resource wetland habitat. Below is a list of treatment principles that apply to Eisenhower NHS. Subsequent sections contain descriptions of the defining historic landscape characteristics and associated recommendations.

Treatment principles

In 1966, Farm #1, the central farmstead of the Eisenhower Farms, was designated a National Historic Landmark because of its nationally significant association with General Eisenhower. In the park’s enabling legislation in 1967, the Eisenhower NHS was designated primarily for the association with General Eisenhower and secondarily for its relationship to the Battle of Gettysburg during the Civil War. This holds true for Farms #2 and #3, which were transferred out of Gettysburg NMP and into Eisenhower NHS in 1969. Similarly, the purpose of the Clement Redding farm is to preserve the historic setting of the Eisenhower properties. Therefore, the rehabilitation treatment approach at Eisenhower NHS aims to reflect the lives and interests of the Eisenhowers and associated working farms.

Before any modifications are made to the farm properties or properties in the surrounding viewshed, changes should be carefully evaluated for their impact on historical integrity and defining landscape characteristics and features. In carrying out individual actions or routine maintenance, it is advisable to evaluate the overall or



cumulative effect of each change to ensure that the historical integrity is not diminished. The following is a list of general principles that, when adhered to, will enhance the character and integrity of the farm properties.

- Preserve the open areas, woodlands, building clusters, and natural systems that contribute to the overall spatial organization of the farm properties. Control vegetation as needed.
- Preserve the natural features of the properties.
- Preserve agricultural use.
- Preserve historic fence lines, fence materials, fence post and gate styles.
- Preserve the diversity of vegetation within the cultural landscape, recognizing that many plants were gifts or relate to a particular interest of the Eisenhowers.
- Preserve historic views.
- Provide barrier-free access in such a way that character-defining features, materials, and finishes are preserved.
- Preserve historic buildings and structures, including small outbuildings and features associated with agricultural operations and the lives of the Eisenhowers.
- Preserve the diversity of features in the landscape, both large and small features, to best provide the overall appearance of an occupied homestead and operating farm.
- Protect archeological sites.
- Protect intermittent streams.
- Protect the ecosystem.

ENDNOTE TO CHAPTER 1

¹ United States Department of the Interior, National Park Service, *The Secretary of Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Landscapes*, Washington DC: Cultural Resource Stewardship and Partnerships, Heritage Preservation Services, Historic Landscape Initiative, 1996: p. 33.