



*Cumberland
Island
National
Seashore*

A History of
Conservation
Conflict

Lary M. Dilsaver

University of Virginia Press
Charlottesville & London

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA PRESS

© 2004 by the Rector and Visitors of the University of Virginia

All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper

First published 2004

9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Dilsaver, Lary M.

Cumberland Island National Seashore : a history of conservation conflict / Lary M. Dilsaver.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-8139-2268-2 (alk. paper)

1. Cumberland Island National Seashore (Ga.)—History.
2. Cumberland Island National Seashore (Ga.)—Management.
3. Conservation of natural resources—Georgia—Cumberland Island National Seashore.
4. Cumberland Island National Seashore (Ga.)—Environmental conditions.
5. Environmental protection—Georgia—Cumberland Island National Seashore. I. Title.

F292.C94 D55 2004

975.8'746—dc22

2003019677

This book is published in association with the Center for American Places, Santa Fe, New Mexico, and Staunton, Virginia (www.americanplaces.org).

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations *vii*

Acknowledgments *ix*

Introduction *i*

- 1 A Richness of Resources: Cumberland Island to 1880 *8*
- 2 The Era of Rich Estates, 1881–1965 *36*
- 3 Creating Cumberland Island National Seashore *76*
- 4 Land Acquisition and Retained Rights *111*
- 5 Planning and Operating in the 1970s *137*
- 6 Resource Management in the 1970s *165*
- 7 Contested Paradise: The 1980s and Early 1990s *195*
- 8 Hope for the New Century *239*

Conclusion *260*

APPENDIX A

National Park Service Officials *267*

APPENDIX B

Cumberland Island National Seashore Operating Base Budgets *269*

Notes *271*

Index *309*

ILLUSTRATIONS

Figures

Figure credits: Figs. 1.1, 1.3, 2.1-2, 2.8, 3.1-3, 5.3, 6.2, and 8.2 are from the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service Archives, Harpers Ferry, W.Va. Figs. 1.1-2, 1.4, 2.3-6, 2.9-12, 5.1-2, 5.4, 6.1, 6.4, 7.2-3, 8.1, and 8.3 are from the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, Cumberland Island National Seashore Archives, St. Marys, Ga. Photos by author: Figs. 1.5, 6.3, 7.1, and 8.4.

- 1.1. Maritime oak forest 2
- 1.1. Aerial view of the island 10
- 1.2. Cumberland Island vegetation 15
- 1.3. Ruins of Nathanael Greene's mansion 28
- 1.4. Tabby House at Dungeness 29
- 1.5. Main Road running the length of the island 32
- 2.1. Dungeness mansion in its prime 39
- 2.2. Interior of the Recreation House 40
- 2.3. Gardens and Recreation House at Dungeness 41
- 2.4. Lucy Carnegie and her family at Dungeness 43
- 2.5. The Cottage built for Thomas Carnegie Jr. 45
- 2.6. Plum Orchard mansion built for George Carnegie 46
- 2.7. Thomas Carnegie family tree 47
- 2.8. Ruins of the Dungeness mansion 58
- 2.9. Picnicking at the beach 64
- 2.10. Fun at the beach for children 65
- 2.11. Cumberland Island Hotel at the north end 67
- 2.12. Primus Mitchell at the Settlement 70
- 3.1. National Park Service vehicles near High Point in 1957 82
- 3.2. National Park Service survey team at Lake Whitney 84
- 3.3. National Park Service survey team at the Stafford Chimneys 85
- 5.1. Ruins of several generations of automobiles 141
- 5.2. Dungeness Dock in 1972 142
- 5.3. National Park Service trams on the south end of the island 144
- 5.4. Cumberland ferry docking at the island 144
- 6.1. Dune encroachment on the maritime oak forest 175

- 6.2. Exterior damage on the Plum Orchard mansion 182
- 6.3. Ruins of the Recreation House in 2000 186
- 6.4. First African Baptist Church 192
- 7.1. Riprap near the Sea Camp Visitor Center 225
- 7.2. Feral horse in the marsh 230
- 7.3. Duck House 233
- 8.1. Trapping of hogs 241
- 8.2. Plum Orchard mansion 245
- 8.3. Native American canoe 246
- 8.4. Tracks from beach driving 250

Maps

- 1.1. Cumberland Island location map 4
- 1.1. Land and vegetation on Cumberland Island 14
- 1.2. Native American and colonial areas 19
- 1.3. Division of Cumberland by the Greene and Lynch families 27
- 1.4. Dungeness plantation in 1878 34
- 2.1. Dungeness estate in 1916 42
- 2.2. Glidden Company mining proposal 60
- 2.3. Subdivision plans for the north end 69
- 2.4. High Point–Half Moon Bluff Historic District 71
- 2.5. Carnegie land division 74
- 4.1. National Park Service land acquisition and proposed subdivisions 114
- 4.2. Retained estates and private land 133
- 5.1. Cumberland Island in 1972 138
- 5.2. National Park Service 1971 master plan 151
- 5.3. Options for a mainland embarkation point 156
- 5.4. Proposal of 1977 for three wilderness areas 160
- 6.1. National Register historical and archaeological areas 166
- 6.2. Shoreline changes since 1857 168
- 7.1. General management plan proposal of 1981 197
- 7.2. Revised 1981 general management plan 211
- 7.3. National Park Service development plan for Point Peter 215
- 7.4. National Park Service plan for the town of St. Marys 217
- 7.5. Table Point and South Cut fires 221
- 7.6. Proposed changes to the Atlantic Intracoastal Waterway Channel 223