Note: The best way for me to summarize the vast discourse at the Scholars’ Roundtable is to organize it into themes and subsections. The two major categories are New Perspectives on Tubman and Points of Contention on Tubman. The New Perspectives portion, involves the most cutting-edge viewpoints on Harriet Tubman that dominated the conversation and represent where the historical literature is trending. The Points of Contention (or simply outdated assertions) are perhaps claims that should be sidestepped or handled with care due to inherent limitations. My writing below answers all 4 Questions for Consideration discussed so brilliantly at the roundtable.¹

New Perspectives on Tubman

Tubman & the “Hidden Transcript of Resistance”

The freedom seekers that Tubman was not able to rescue engaged in the hidden transcript of resistance, which is a valid form of defiance akin to escaping. The “Hidden Transcript” is a term used by scholars to characterize the behavior performed by subordinate groups “offstage” or concealed from direct observation of power holders. The “Public Transcript” underscores the open and formal public interaction between the dominated and oppressed in which the subordinate are cast as submissive. The Hidden Transcript implies that resistance lies discreetly and strategically beneath the surface of the conventional public dimension.²

Scholars are now quite privy to researching the hidden transcript of resistance as it pertains to enslaved Blacks in the American South. Much of the new literature highlights the evasive forms of routine “silent sabotage” such as doing poor work, breaking tools, abusing animals, theft of food, and other measures Blacks employed to cause low plantation productivity.³ The undertones of defiance embedded in the Negro Spirituals and the messages passed down the undisclosed Negro grapevine were a part of the hidden transcript as well. Although, “silent sabotage” was not as outright radical or bold, as the

¹ Please note that this report reflects and uses elements of my forthcoming article: “Harriet Tubman: Transnationalism and the Land of a Queen in the Late Antebellum.” It is under review with The Meridians: Feminism, Race, and Transnationalism.
actions of individuals like Tubman, Gabriel Prosser, Denmark Vesey, or Nat Turner, it was nonetheless wide spread, occurred often, and was difficult to prosecute.

**Tubman & Borderlands**

In the early stages of Tubman’s illegal dealings she grasped the knowledge of operating in the “border state” of Maryland and maneuvering the Mason-Dixie Line in Pennsylvania and Delaware to transition Blacks from slavery to freedom between two competing sectional zones. Learning the area’s geographical layout and building effective networks foreshadows and parallels her later actions along the American-Canadian framework. By late 1851 when Tubman strategically moved the base of her practice to British Canada, she understood the dynamics of borders, both national and international and used them in ways that power-holders had not intended or anticipated. Tubman also comprehended that dwelling in St. Catharines, Canada West in close proximity to the American-Canadian international border, afforded her the ability to cross and re-cross the partition to carryout her illegal business, thus yielding a transnational orientation free from one-sided state loyalty.

In St. Catharines, Tubman had to employ much of the same caution as she did along the Mason-Dixie Line. It could be a dangerous place particularly in Buffalo and Niagara Falls due to the congregation of slave catchers on the fringes of the borders seeking to capture human property. Nonetheless, Blacks in the borderlands of St. Catharines forged lives that were intertwined with their American counterparts by shared newspapers, annual celebrations, religious organizations, as well as kinship and friendship ties that were reinforced by habitual border crossings and circular exchange. This activity in the Niagara arena suited the lifestyle of Tubman due to the mobility and the interconnectedness of people and resources irrespective of borders. In all, the mindset of Tubman to maneuver diverging zones was cultivated in the “border state” of Maryland, and maximized in the American-Canadian crossroads of St. Catharines during a critical post-Civil War period.

**Tubman as a Transnational**

The term transnational is carefully applied to Tubman to define her understanding that the border between the United States and British Canada separated political sovereignties, but it could not mitigate social and cultural ties and a common cause to end bondage.  

---

4 See Michiel Baud and Willem Van Schendel, “Toward a Comparative History of Borderlands.” *Journal of World History* 8 (Fall 1997), 211-42.

5 Please note that the area now called present-day Ontario was “Upper Canada” from 1791 to 1841 and then “Canada West” from 1841 to Confederation in 1867.

Therefore, Tubman built relationships in the United States with William Still of Philadelphia, Stephen Myers of Albany, Jermain W. Loguen of Syracuse, and Frederick Douglass of Rochester that fed into a Canadian pipeline. On the other side of the national margin she partnered chiefly with Hiram Wilson, folks from the Eastern Shore, and the local Black Churches (British Methodist Episcopal Church & Zion Baptist Church) and benevolent societies (the St. Catharines Refugee Slaves’ Friend Society & the Fugitive Aid Society of St. Catharines). This networking in the Niagara region became crucial to the wellbeing of runaways as they sought to reestablish themselves as free people in Canada.

Moreover, Tubman spent time in both St. Catharines and Philadelphia working to gather funds for odysseys South and convinced New Englanders to invest in endeavors over the border; thus receding the significance of national boundaries. In addition, Tubman was aware that the British government and the esteemed Queen Victoria would not extradite her back to the United States to be punished for the criminal activities she performed.

Despite moving to Auburn in 1859, Tubman still invested time and conducted business in British Canada. In fact, Tubman even established from Auburn, the Fugitive Aid Society of St. Catharines, an interracial association relief organization, which provided support to American escapees in the early 1860s. The electoral board of the Fugitive Aid Society of St. Catharines was staffed with a core group of runaways from Maryland whom Tubman trusted. Although, the Society had a short-term existence due to the coming Civil War, it plainly demonstrated that Tubman divided duty between the United States and Canada.

**Tubman as an “In-Betweener”**

Tubman was an “in-betweener” that balanced the Black Slave-Free community in Maryland bondage, the North-South border (or Mason-Dixie Line) to help escapees liberate themselves, the American-Canadian international border in St. Catharines, her home in Central New York literally set on the border of Auburn and Fleming, New York, and Auburn was nearby to the “Burnt Over District” a freethinking liberal hub on the border of more conservative regions of New York. Each of these elements demonstrated Tubman’s “in-betweennessee.” She could move through and effectively occupy zones of “in-betweennessee,” carrying signifiers of more than one identity, while fully embodying none.

**Tubman & Queen Victoria (the “Queen’s Soil” British Canada)**

The impetus for Tubman and other Black female runaways to flee to Canada was motivated by Queen Victoria’s reign. In 1837, Queen Victoria of the United Kingdom of Great Britain inherited the throne at the age of eighteen. The Queen became an international icon and a powerful symbolic figure for women around the world. Victoria Agard-Jones. *Transnational Blackness: Navigating the Global Color Line* (New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).


brutally colonized thousands of people, especially persons of color, but Blacks in the United States context had grown to understand as radical abolitionist David Walker explained in his *Appeal* that: “The English are the best friends the coloured people have upon earth…as a nation, the English are our friends.” Therefore, Black female runaways from the American South, viewed *Her* dominion of Canada as a place of greater freedom, from a male dominated “King’s Land” of the United States, where white male Presidents and leaders, held a monopoly on social and political power. For Black female runaways Queen Victoria represented the possibilities and heights women could reach if they were not simply limited by their sex.

Overall, Tubman’s quest to reach Canadian soil was twofold: first she wanted to resist Black enslavement in the United States based on her race, and secondly she wished to sidestep sexual exploitation and gender degradation. Tubman reasoned that her dual desirers could be achieved in Canada. After all, Queen Victoria ushered in the Victorian Era (1837-1901), and as her popularity started to grow, so did the message that freedom and legal rights for Blacks could be obtain in Canada. This gave way to Black female fugitives from the American South crafting ideas about Canada as a “safe place” from racial and sexual bigotry. Unfortunately, the romanticized idealism and identification with Queen Victoria Tubman and Black women from America ventured to Canada with was met by a sobering reality—the dual bigotries of racism and sexism were a transcending sentiment, which did not discontinue at the American-Canadian international border.

Overtime the admiration Tubman held for Queen Victoria proved to be mutual. After the Queen read Tubman’s narrative and was “pleased with it,” she mailed her a silver medal, which memorialized Victoria’s Diamond Jubilee in 1897.

**Tubman & the “Burnt Over District” Culture**

The District produced the Mormons of the Latter Day Saints church established by Joseph Smith; William Miller’s Millerites, who believed the Second Coming was to occur on October 22, 1844; the Shakers, a religious sect that died out partly because its members were forbidden to have sex or marry; as well as the Fox sisters who educated others on communicating with the dead; and the Oneida Community, where people engaged in communal marriage, birth control, and eugenics. In addition, the “Burned-Over District” was a hub for political causes such as the abolitionist upsurge, women’s suffrage, and the temperance movement. The character of Western New York was undoubtedly different from the rest of the state and other regions in America. Auburn just on the edges of the “Brunt Over District,” a transparent hotbed for social reform,

---


allowed Tubman a liberal space where others shared her in-depth spirituality, social mindset, and political desires. It was unquestionably an ideal space for her to inhabit.

**Maryland’s Eastern Shore Escapee Diaspora & Tubman**

Before the Civil War, enslaved Blacks from Maryland’s Eastern Shore escaped in large numbers to several United States northern towns and Canadian communities. Three places that Eastern Shore Blacks fled to in large numbers was St. Catharines, Canada West, New Bedford, Massachusetts, and to a lesser extent Auburn, New York (perhaps this diaspora should be plainly mapped out). In these new host areas that Eastern Shore Blacks settled in they reestablished community and maintained a consciousness of common origins.

This reality is clearly demonstrated in St. Catharines, Canada West. Tubman resided in a community of Black American fugitives in St. Catharines, where a score of the implants were from Maryland’s Eastern Shore, some of which she brought or directed to town herself.\(^{11}\) The area was principally called the “Black Town,” or the “Colored Village”\(^ {12}\) and its main streets were North and Geneva near the center of Black life, the British Methodist Episcopal (BME) Church and the Zion Baptist Church. When Tubman was not away on missions to free those in bondage, she stayed on North Street; both her brothers, John and William Henry Stewart, resided in the immediate vicinity. Others from the Eastern Shore congregated in a several-block radius in the tight knit community. Individuals such as minister Joseph Cornish, Christopher “Kit” Anthony, and Horatio Wilkins (Wilkinson) were directly from Tubman’s native Dorchester County.\(^ {13}\) For Tubman, St. Catharines was ideal because of its distance to the international border, and its inland position was just far enough to deter the American bounty hunters. Moreover its transnational location yielded back and forth travel and stood at a key junction for land and water movement.

The greater Auburn area possessed a modest Black settlement, called New Guinea that also held a constituency of Maryland Eastern Shore runaways and transplants. Tubman managed to occupy places that held some of the comforts and familiarity of home. This should be cited as part of Tubman’s remarkable capacity to preserve family and cultural inheritance and forge community in **alien** spaces. To Tubman community was not necessarily based on the geographic location, but it was a transient entity that could be established and reestablished.\(^ {14}\)

**Tubman as a Naturalist**

Being an enslaved Black from the American South, Tubman worked closely with the earth’s riches whether as a muskrat trapper, lumberjack, or conductor of freedom seekers. It can be argued that enslaved Black agricultural workers predated the formal philosophy,


\(^{13}\) 1861 Canadian Censes, St. Catharines, Ontario; 1855 St. Catharines, Assessment Roll.

ideology, and social environmental and/or green movements.15 Tubman’s love of the natural world included: flowers, trees, animals, and the stars. This naturalist disposition served Tubman well while she navigated Blacks from Maryland to the American North and British Canada. This enterprise took knowledge of the waterways, wind patterns, geography, forestry, interpretation of astronomy, even the understanding of herbal medicine and healing. Tubman skillfully used the North Star, forecasted weather conditions ideal for travel, and drugged babies with paregorics or opium in order to minimize outbursts.16

**Tubman as a Deviant of Social Barriers**
Harriet Tubman’s lifetime was a dismissal of arbitrary social barriers, whether national, racial, or sexual, which she intentionally crossed, often at considerable personal risk. Tubman transited America by living in Canada, which had Atlantic World and African Diaspora ties to Great Britain. Tubman labored as a lumberjack and did the dangerous and dubbed “manly” task of saving slaves from bondage. She was born into slavery and poverty, but byway of vast toil Tubman gained great merit among her people and the world. Proving that the situation an individual is born into does not determine the extent they can inspire and raise. To think that a woman who asserted: “I grew up like a neglected weed,--ignorant of liberty, having no experience of it” went on to become a champion of freedom, justice, and resistance is quite astonishing.17 Tubman understood: national borders, social lines, as well as gender roles, but she refused to be defined by them.

**A New Understanding of Tubman as Moses & Transnationalism**
The Moses references to Tubman have been used extensively throughout history to underscore her endeavors, since William Lloyd Garrison bestowed the name upon her. However, the citation is constructive beyond the simple fact that they both led their people out of bondage. Moses was a transnational in his own right. After being exiled out of Egypt and crossing the Red Sea to Midian; he reentered the Kingdom of Pharaoh multiple times to request the release of the Israelites. Ultimately, Moses led the Hebrews on an exodus via the Red Sea and beyond the borders of Egypt onward to Canaan. He, like Tubman, understood the lines between peoples and places and how to traverse them to shield himself and his followers from harsh enemy subjection and slavery.18 Both Moses and Tubman had spiritual God-guided ministries, but they also had a practical comprehension of navigating territorial jurisdictions to meet and maximize their political objectives. Each in essence transcended location and nationality to provide greater freedom and to sidestep persecution for a comparative “Promised Land.” The juxtaposition of Moses and Tubman, especially in the post-Civil War era, is far more

---

18 See Bible: Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers and Deuteronomy.
meaningful than the parallels to the French nationalists Joan d’Arc, who was bond by
statehood.19

Tubman & Negro Spirituals
The Negro Spirituals provide for the historian a window to the masses of enslaved
Blacks. The African Americans who were able to write a narrative or be interviewed
were fortunate and few. In order to hear the voice of the vast majority of Black slaves the
Negro Spirituals are the chief primary source. These simple songs articulate a complex
reality of adversity, struggle, and resistance. Spirituals allow people who could not
formally read or write English to have the ability to speak and have their humanity
acknowledged. The Black upper and middle classes are heard by way of speeches,
newspapers, pamphlets, and narratives, but the lower class and masses rely heavily on the
spiritual to mark their existence and viewpoints. Tubman’s usage of Spirituals goes
beyond simple religious significance or an “Unseen Presence” they have an alternative
interpretation and tell the stories of thousands of lowly Blacks that lack the mainstream
means to communicate. Negro Spirituals produce a treasure trove of pertinent
information that cannot be overlooked.

Points of Contention on Tubman

Tubman as an “American Hero”
The modern works on Harriet Tubman of Jean Humez, Kate Clifford Larson, and
Catherine Clinton20 have reinvigorated her popularity and significance as a freedom
fighter. Others scholars such as Milton C. Sernett and Beverly Lowry21 have also
contributed to the historiography and renewed interest in Tubman. Nonetheless, all of
these publications depict Tubman largely from a national American-based perspective.
Portraying Tubman as an “American Hero” undermines her years as a British Canadian
resident and the ways in which she perceived and employed the international lines to
safeguard fugitives. Also it is misleading considering that she lived in St. Catharines,
Canada West, between 1851 and 1858. There in the American-Canadian borderlands, just
12 miles (19 kilometers) from the international divide, Tubman learned the art of
navigating the overlapping worlds of the United States, Canada, Great Britain, and the
African Diaspora. Tubman worked in solidarity with those of common cause regardless
of nation and held relationships and affiliations spanning across international lines.
As Tubman became well-known, in the mid-1850s, an outpouring of financial aid from
Canada, New England to Scotland and Ireland ensued; also she inspired others engaged
in liberation struggles throughout the African Diaspora and around the world by her sheer

19 Milton C. Sernett, Harriet Tubman: Myth, Memory, and History. 2. See for the full list of the various
references to Tubman.
20 Jean M. Humez, Harriet Tubman: The Life and the Life Stories. (Madison: University of Wisconsin
Press, 2003); Kate Clifford Larson, Bound for the Promised Land: Harriet Tubman, Portrait of An
American Hero. (New York, NY: Ballantine Books, 2004); Catherine Clinton, Harriet Tubman: The Road
21 Milton C. Sernett, Harriet Tubman: Myth, Memory, and History. (Durham, NC: Duke University Press,
resilience to battle against damning odds. Someone this multi-dimensional cannot be consigned to the simplistic restraints of nationalism, a construction she did not neatly fit.

Those that have labeled Tubman an “American Hero” became trapped in the snares of a national consciousness of self-importance, which does not glance outward to make substantial connections beyond set restrictions even when they are quite apparent. The new age of global competence scholarship demands a wider-lens and alterative approach that cannot be avoided.

**Canada (& the American North) as a “Promise Land”**

For example: The Canadian “Promise Land” discourse overemphasizes Black freedoms enjoyed in Canada prior to the Civil War and beyond. Its casts the British colony as a “Haven” and overlooks the transcending sentiment of racism that was present on both sides of the American-Canadian border. While there were legal differences that hampered bigotry in Canada, the social reality must not be taken out of context, as prejudice could be just as pervasive on the Crown’s soil. The “Promise Land” historical literature treats Canada as if it was an ideal “Heavenly” place floating above 19th and 20th century intolerance and Black degradation. However, when Blacks arrived in Canada, they found that legal privileges did not feed, clothe, or employ them. The work of building a new life began right away. Neither the provincial government nor the local authorities made substantial arrangements to aid them. Like in the United States, the major problem that confronted Blacks in Canada was the attitudes of unsympathetic whites. Indeed, bigotry transcended constructed national divisions. Canada was not a “Promise Land,” nor was the American North. See citation.

**Tubman as Illiterate**

While Tubman could not formally read or write the English language, like the majority of Blacks of her day, she was not void of knowledge nor did she devalue the education of African Americans. Her inability to read or write is really a critique of the institution of slavery, which made these practices illegal and not solely the outcome of her own desire. In addition, not being able to meet minimum standards of literacy does not mean Tubman

---

did not have the capability of word recognition, profound philosophical depth, or adhere to the theory of multiple intelligences (that is intelligence not dominated by a single general ability). The intelligence that it took for Tubman to move Blacks from Maryland to free territory required an intricate skill set- as with any vocation. Tubman’s intelligence involved visual-spatial, musical-rhythmic, and logical components. Lastly it is wrong to blame her head injury and epilepsy for her being “illiterate.” Tubman could accomplish anything she wanted. This is a woman who led Blacks out of bondage. In addition, she had people and resources to get a letter written or a message translated.

Slave Marriage

“Slave Marriage” or “Jumping over the Broomstick” was not an official union recognized by the state or federal government. This meant that the slaveholder was not held to honor the commitment. And every time the Black married couple had sex they virtually committed adultery and their children were bastards. This is why Black couples quickly exchanged “jumping over the broomstick” for legalized marriages after reaching the American North. It empowered Blacks to shed the practice of the master and to redefine themselves and their relationships. Plus the redemptive action of an official marriage legitimized the Black family, freed the couple of sin, and forced the state to legally recognize the humanity of Blacks on equal terms with whites. The expression “married” when referring to enslaved Blacks should be used with care considering the special set of circumstances which were intentionally perpetrated by power-holders. 27

Conclusion

In all, Harriet Tubman is relatable to the modern person and fits into the current historical landscape being that she is global, green, gender aware, employed bottom-up theory, and managed to take common knowledge elements of Maryland Eastern Shore Blacks and apply them to execute astonishing task at key junctions.

Yours for the cause of Harriet Tubman
Respectfully,

dann j. Broyld
Hartford, Connecticut
January 20, 2014