



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: unleashed dogs**

1 message

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Dec 12, 2013 at 3:30 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello, your email message (attached below) was forwarded to me as I'm the park's lead on the dog management project. Thank you for your message, but unfortunately we are not taking comments on the Draft Dog Management Plan/Supplemental EIS (draft plan/SEIS) currently out for public review via email. Given your concerns, we hope that you will submit comments to us on the draft plan/SEIS; there are 2 ways to do so:

- Online at <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/dogplan> (where you can also download and review the draft plan/SEIS)
- By mail to GGNRA Superintendent, Fort Mason, Bldg. 201, San Francisco, CA 94123, Attn: SEIS

The comment period has just been extended to February 18, so comments must be entered online, or postmarked, by that date.

Also, I have added you to our email contact list for the project so that you will be aware of developments in this planning effort. Please let me know if this is not acceptable, or if you have any additional questions.

Thank you for contacting the park.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)

*I note that a good 50% of dog owners fail to leash their dogs when walking in leash-only areas of the GGNRA in Marin. New rules are well intentioned, but until someone enforces them, they are not worth much*

*Persons who witness unleashed dogs rarely say anything to admonish owners, because in most cases that would arouse instant hostility from the owner and could lead to a confrontation.*

*I also note that Pt. Reyes Rangers will not respond to a report that someone has an unleashed dog in a restricted area because the Rangers are also afraid of the hostile reactions of the dog owners (I have witnessed this).*



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

---

## Fwd: From NPS.gov: Dogs on Leash

2 messages

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 14, 2013 at 9:58 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, & Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPS

email: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: (b) (6)  
Date: Tue, May 14, 2013 at 9:15 AM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Dogs on Leash  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Can you please clarify the leash law in your state park for me? I am a trail runner and I have almost tripped on a number of dogs running the trails around Rodeo Beach because people let their dogs off leash. Are the dogs allowed off leash in this park? If not is it possible to hang signs reminding people of the leash law or occasionally send a park ranger out to remind people? I understand that the Parks department has had budget cuts over the recent years, but is there something that can be done? I would appreciate any information you can send me. Thank you.

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 28, 2013 at 2:06 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) your request for information (attached below) about leash law in the Marin Headlands of Golden Gate National Recreation Area (GGNRA) was passed along to me for follow up. Sections of the Marin Headlands are open to dog walking, both on leash or under voice control. In the Rodeo Beach area, the beach itself, the Coastal Trail from Highway 101 up to Hill 88, and two loop trails (1 - Coastal, Wolf Ridge and Miwok back to the Lagoon Trail to Rodo Beach; 2 - Coastal up to Old Bunker Road and back down to Lagoon Trail) are open to dog walking under voice control. Complete information about dog walking in GGNRA is on the park's web site: <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/pets.htm>

Given your concerns, you may be interested to know that GGNRA is in the midst of a planning project to decide how best to manage dog walking in this park. There have been multiple opportunities for the public to be involved and comment on the project. The next opportunity will be this summer, when a supplemental environmental impact statement will be issued for public review and comment. More information is at: <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

If you would like to be notified when that document is available, I will add your address to our email contact list.

Thank you for contacting the park regarding your experiences running on park trails, and I apologize for this delayed response.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

*Can you please clarify the leash law in your state park for me? I am a trail runner and I have almost tripped on a number of dogs running the trails around Rodeo Beach because people let their dogs off leash. Are the dogs allowed off leash in this park? If not is it possible to hang signs reminding people of the leash law or occasionally send a park ranger out to remind people? I understand that the Parks department has had budget cuts over the recent years, but is there something that can be done? I would appreciate any information you can send me. Thank you.*



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

**Re: Ft Mason Off Leash dogs**

1 message

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Dec 12, 2013 at 5:15 PM

To: (b) (6)

Dear (b) (6) - below is a message I drafted to you quite a while back, but inadvertently did not send. Please accept my apologies for such a late reply; in the hopes than an answer would still be helpful, am sending this to you now.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)

\*\*\*\*\*

Hello (b) (6) we received your message (attached below) about the need for enforcement of the on-leash regulation at Fort Mason. You're correct that Fort Mason is an on-leash area, and there are signs at each entrance. However, we are aware that some visitors do let their dogs off leash in spite of the signage. I have forwarded your message to our law enforcement division and to the U.S. Park Police, both of which patrol our San Francisco sites.

In addition, here are numbers for our 24/7 dispatch office, in case you need to contact law enforcement and no officers are in the area: for emergencies, call 415-561-5656; to report an incident, the non-emergency number is 415-561-5505

Finally, given your interest, you be interested to know that the park is currently involved in a planning process to address, and improve, dog management in GGNRA. You may want to review, and possibly submit comments on the Draft Dog Management Plan/Supplemental EIS (draft plan/SEIS) that is currently out for public review. There are 2 ways to do so:

- Online at <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/dogplan> (where you can also download and review the draft plan/SEIS)
- By mail to GGNRA Superintendent, Fort Mason,Bldg. 201, San Francisco, CA 94123, Attn: SEIS

Also, I have added you to our email contact list for the project so that you will be aware of developments in this planning effort. Please let me know if this is not acceptable, or if you have any additional questions.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

Hello,

I'm concerned about the increasing number of off-leash dogs at Ft Mason park. I particularly choose this park to

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Re: Ft Mason Off Leash dogs

take my dog for walks because it is an ON-leash park. Most people don't mind off leash dogs if they are well controlled and friendly. Unfortunately, we have had more and more experiences with aggressive dogs and clueless owners. I'm hoping there could possibly be a sign posted stating more clearly that it is indeed an on-leash park. I know that police patrol sometimes but I heard they rarely give out tickets and I haven't seen them for ages.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: dogs and leashes**

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Nov 5, 2013 at 12:08 PM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: (b) (6)  
Date: Tue, Nov 5, 2013 at 12:05 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: dogs and leashes  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

My wife and I thank you for making it mandatory for dog owners to use a leash in many areas. The majority of dog owners that we have come across that let their dog off leash, don't seem to care for anyone else or the environment. We witness time and again dogs defecating far from their owner who don't pick up after their dog. I even approached one of these people after the fact and told them. The reply I got was, "I don't have a bag to pick it up". So I picked it up with a bag, and they reluctantly took it with anger. I believe that is why a lot of bad dog owners let them off leash, to not have to pick it up. I actually know an individual who loves that his dog defecates out of his site, so as not to ever have to pick it up. I am so tired of the quantity of bad dog owners who don't care. And tired of hiking trails and not being able to look at the scenery, because we have to watch every step, as to not step in a mess left on the trail. I truly love all animals, but I do wish people would leave them at home, or go to designated dog parks only. Their freedom is encroaching on our freedom to enjoy the parks without barking, dog mess, and even dogs running up to jump on us, or over our beach blanket for our food. My wife and I try to only visit dog prohibited parks and areas. Yet, we still see dogs at these locations, mostly off leash also. I thank you for trying to restore peace again to our outdoor visits.



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

---

## Fwd: From NPS.gov: unleashed dogs

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Oct 30, 2013 at 7:47 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, & Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPS

email: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: (b) (6)  
Date: Tue, Oct 29, 2013 at 4:53 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: unleashed dogs  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

I note that a good 50% of dog owners fail to leash their dogs when walking in leash-only areas of the GGNRA in Marin. New rules are well intentioned, but until someone enforces them, they are not worth much

Persons who witness unleashed dogs rarely say anything to admonish owners, because in most cases that would arouse instant hostility from the owner and could lead to a confrontation.

I also note that Pt. Reyes Rangers will not respond to a report that someone has an unleashed dog in a restricted area because the Rangers are also afraid of the hostile reactions of the dog owners (I have witnessed this).



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

---

## Fwd: From NPS.gov: dogs

4 messages

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Wed, May 8, 2013 at 8:50 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, & Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758  
mobile (415) 827-6296

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPS

email: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: <(b) (6)>  
Date: Wed, May 8, 2013 at 7:41 AM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: dogs  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

Walked the Alta Trail above Marin City (almost to GGB) and was shocked at the number of dogs off leash. Obvious "dog walker" area and we encountered literally packs of dogs, several of them. Dog walkers with as many as 13 dogs and at times several of them all at once. No dogs on leash and only encountered one woman who did have control of the 8 dogs she did have. Bag after bag after bag of dog feces strewn along the trail. This is such a wonderful trail but the dog situation is truly out of control. Dogs racing thru the brush scattering birds and rabbits. It was really hard to enjoy the beauty of this trail.

Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 28, 2013 at 2:30 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) your email about your experiences along the Alta Trail, in GGNRA above Marin City, was passed along to me for response. The Alta Trail is one area currently open to dog walking under voice control, and is regularly used by commercial dog walkers. Thank you for letting us know your concerns about this situation.

You may be interested to know that GGNRA is in the midst of a planning project to decide how best to manage dog walking in this park. There have been a number of opportunities for the public to comment on the project, and the next opportunity will be this summer, when a supplemental environmental impact statement will be issued for public review and comment. More information is at: <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

Given your concerns about the current situation on the Alta Trail, you might like to be notified when that document is available. If so, I will add your address to our email contact list.

Thank you for contacting us about this situation.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

Walked the Alta Trail above Marin City (almost to GGB) and was shocked at the number of dogs off leash. Obvious "dog walker" area and we encountered literally packs of dogs, several of them. Dog walkers with as many as 13 dogs and at times several of them all at once. No dogs on leash and only encountered one woman

who did have control of the 8 dogs she did have. Bag after bag after bag of dog feces strewn along the trail. This is such a wonderful trail but the dog situation is truly out of control. Dogs racing thru the brush scattering birds and rabbits. It was really hard to enjoy the beauty of this trail.

---

(b) (6)

Tue, May 28, 2013 at 2:37 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Please do. I will very much appreciate having opportunity to comment on a situation where some have taken advantage and ruin it for other users.

Thank you for response.

(b) (6)

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 28, 2013 at 2:42 PM

To: (b) (6)

Done! You've been added to the email contact list for the dog management project. We really appreciate you taking part and voicing your concerns.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

## Dogs - and Coyotes, too.

3 messages

**Livery Office** <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com> Wed, Aug 14, 2013 at 6:37 PM  
 To: Hilary Hobbs <Hilary\_Hobbs@nps.gov>, shirwin\_smith@nps.gov  
 Cc: Linda Rubio <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com>, (b) (6), Judy Braznell  
 <judybraznell@miwokstables.com>

Hi Hilary, Shirwin,  
 Linda asked that I take a moment to send a log of recent "dog sightings" around the barn - when they're on trails they shouldn't be on, or unleashed when they should be on leash, just to keep you posted. The attachment follows.

Also wanted to let you know that we've got at least one Coyote (possibly with pups) that seems to be living in CLOSE proximity to the back of the barn. Earlier this week, it bared its teeth and growled at a staff member who attempted to shoo it away from summer camp kids having lunch. Two mounted park patrol staff rode by the barn today, and were able to see the coyote and it's proximity to all of us. We're a little worried - not only about how close they are, but also because it seems that pups raised so close to people might not learn to be as cautious of humans as they should be? Any suggestions on this one? In the past we've made a big ruckus when a coyote comes too close, so that it doesn't become entirely comfortable being near people, but when they growl back, it's a game changer! :-). Thanks in advance for any help you might provide.

Best Regards,  
 Christine Pearson  
 for Linda Rubio, Owner, Miwok Livery, Inc.  
 at Miwok Stables

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Hobbs, Hilary" <hilary\_hobbs@nps.gov>  
**Date:** April 16, 2013 11:32:34 AM PDT  
**To:** Livery Office <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com>  
**Subject:** Re: DOGS

Hi Linda-  
 Sorry to hear about this recent incident, and thanks for letting us know.

I checked in with Shirwin Smith, our Dog Management project manager, to let her know about this incident. Her response is below:

>>Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

9:25 AM (2 hours ago)

to me, Jessica, Kevin, Randolph

Hi Hilary, please have the rider involved call park dispatch non-emergency number (561-5505) to have a report taken on the incident, and pls let Linda know we really need to have any incidents reported to alert us to problems. They can call for a ranger when the incident occurs (561-5656) or use the non-emergency number above to have a report taken even a day or more after. Sooner is better, of course.

Hilary Hobbs  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
(415) 561-4943

On Mon, Apr 15, 2013 at 3:47 PM, Livery Office <[liveryoffice@miwokstables.com](mailto:liveryoffice@miwokstables.com)> wrote:

Hi Hilary

I just wanted you to be aware of this

On Sunday a dog was loose in the parking lot/trail? and it ran into the arena while we were having a class, chased the horses and a lady fell off, she has a black eye and a bruised tailbone and is pretty sore. I was not here, but the dog thing is getting out of control, because there is never anyone here to enforce the rules.

Any suggestions

Linda

Miwok Livery, Inc.  
701 Tennessee Valley Road  
Mill Valley, CA 94941  
415.389.9414 or 415/383-8048  
[liveryoffice@miwokstables.com](mailto:liveryoffice@miwokstables.com)  
[www.miwokstables.com](http://www.miwokstables.com)  
[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!

[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!

---

## 2 attachments



MIWOK LIVERY STABLES  
701 TENNESSEE VALLEY RD  
MILL VALLEY CA 94941  
415-389-9414 • MIWOKSTABLES.COM  
LIVERYOFFICE@MIWOKSTABLES.COM

**signature\_logo\_web.jpg**

7K

**DOG LOG.docx**



**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Aug 15, 2013 at 9:45 AM

To: Bill Merkle <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>

Cc: Hilary Hobbs <Hilary\_Hobbs@nps.gov>, (b) (6), Judy Braznell  
<judybraznell@miwokstables.com>, Livery Office <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com>

Bill - see info from Miwok stables about a possible coyote issue (aggressive response to attempts to discourage its presence.

Your advice would be appreciated!

Christine - Bill Merkle is the park's wildlife ecologist and the best one to provide advice.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Hobbs, Hilary" <hilary\_hobbs@nps.gov>  
**Date:** April 16, 2013 11:32:34 AM PDT  
**To:** Livery Office <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com>  
**Subject:** Re: DOGS

Hi Linda-

Sorry to hear about this recent incident, and thanks for letting us know.

I checked in with Shirwin Smith, our Dog Management project manager, to let her know about this incident. Her response is below:

>>Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

9:25 AM (2 hours ago)

to me, Jessica, Kevin, Randolph

Hi Hilary, please have the rider involved call park dispatch non-emergency number (561-5505) to have a report taken on the incident, and pls let Linda know we really need to have any incidents reported to alert us to problems. They can call for a ranger when the incident occurs (561-5656) or use the non-emergency number above to have a report taken even a day or more after. Sooner is better, of course.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hilary Hobbs  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
(415) 561-4943

On Mon, Apr 15, 2013 at 3:47 PM, Livery Office <[liveryoffice@miwokstables.com](mailto:liveryoffice@miwokstables.com)> wrote:

Hi Hilary

I just wanted you to be aware of this

On Sunday a dog was loose in the parking lot/trail? and it ran into the arena while we were having a class, chased the horses and a lady fell off, she has a black eye and a bruised tailbone and is pretty sore.

I was not here, but the dog thing is getting out of control, because there is never anyone here to enforce the rules.

Any suggestions

Linda

Miwok Livery, Inc.

701 Tennessee Valley Road

Mill Valley, CA 94941

415.389.9414 or 415/383-8048

[liveryoffice@miwokstables.com](mailto:liveryoffice@miwokstables.com)

[www.miwokstables.com](http://www.miwokstables.com)

[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!

[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

Thu, Aug 15, 2013 at 9:55 AM

To: Kevin Cochary <[Kevin\\_Cochary@nps.gov](mailto:Kevin_Cochary@nps.gov)>, Randolph Lavoisier <[randy\\_lavoisier@nps.gov](mailto:randy_lavoisier@nps.gov)>

Cc: Howard Levitt <[Howard\\_Levitt@nps.gov](mailto:Howard_Levitt@nps.gov)>, Alexandra Picavet <[Alexandra\\_Picavet@nps.gov](mailto:Alexandra_Picavet@nps.gov)>

Kevin/Randy - see attached "dog log" from Miwok stables, in particular the last entry in that log which is likely (I hope) a mis-characterization of a response received when a call was made by an equestrian to get assistance for aggressive dog.

I am contacting them to make sure they are calling dispatch for immediate LE assistance and for reporting incidents, but wanted you to see this info about issues in stables area.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith

Management Assistant

Golden Gate National Recreation Area

Ft. Mason, Building 201

San Francisco, CA 94123

415-561-4947 (o)

415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!

---

**2 attachments**



**signature\_logo\_web.jpg**  
7K

 **DOG LOG.docx**  
79K



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## I support the Dog Management Plan

1 message

(b) (6)

Sun, Dec 15, 2013 at 4:17 PM

To: "frank\_dean@nps.gov" <frank\_dean@nps.gov>, "howard\_levitt@nps.gov" <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>, "alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov" <alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov>, "shirwin\_smith@nps.gov" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Dear Superintendent Dean -

I am writing to express my strong support for the GGNRA's management plan as proposed. I do not, however, support any fenced areas for "dog parks." I have also submitted my expression of support through PEPC.

Please see my letter to Congresswoman Pelosi which goes into greater detail.

Thank you for all you do, and to your staff.

(b) (6)

Dear Congresswoman Pelosi:

I am writing to request your support for the GGNRA's proposed dog management plan and the process timeline.

I am a mother of a 6 year old boy who lives near Ocean Beach. I have hesitated to bring him there, and have never brought him to Fort Funston or East Beach/Crissy Field because I feel these park sites are unsafe and unpleasant due to un-managed dogs and irresponsible owners.

I understand that you recently referenced St. Francis in support of the dog owner community's request for less regulations and an extended deadline. I encourage you to consider the whole of St. Francis' message, his love for all living things, which can include the snowy plover, wild coho salmon, even Park Police horses, all of which have been harmed by unmanaged dogs.

St. Francis also had great compassion for the vulnerable, such as children, the elderly, and poor. The parks are for all - no one group should overwhelm our national park and make people feel unsafe or unwelcome.

We love dogs, in the right places. There are many provided in the park. It is frustrating to me that their owners are irresponsible and single-minded and do not respect the resources we have.

Referring back to St. Francis, I am sure you are familiar with his prayer, "Make me a channel of your peace." I encourage you to do what you can to protect our park and bring our community together, not divide it by supporting lax rules to benefit dog owners.

(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: dogs and leashes**

1 message

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Nov 5, 2013 at 1:43 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) your email message (attached below) was forwarded to me as I'm the park's lead on the dog management project. Thank you for contacting us with your concerns, but unfortunately we are not taking comments on the Draft Dog Management Plan/Supplemental EIS (draft plan/SEIS) via email. We very much hope, given your concerns, that you will submit comments to us on the draft plan/SEIS, and there are 3 ways to do so:

- Online at <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/dogplan> (where you can also see and download the draft plan/SEIS)
- By mail, postmarked by January 11, to GGNRA Superintendent, Fort Mason, Bldg. 201, San Francisco, CA 94123, Attn: SEIS
- At the last of the 3 open house meetings: November 6, 4 – 8 p.m., at the Tamalpais High School/Ruby Scott Gym, Mill Valley. (the previous mtgs were November 2, in San Francisco and November 4 in Montara)

Ag I have added you to our email contact list for the project so that you will be aware of developments in this planning efforts. Please let me know if this is not acceptable, or if you have any additional questions. Again, thank you for contacting the park, and for your interest in this project.

Shirwin Smith

Management Assistant

Golden Gate National Recreation Area

Ft. Mason, Building 201

San Francisco, CA 94123

415-561-4947 (o)

415-716-9999 (c)

M

*My wife and I thank you for making it mandatory for dog owners to use a leash in many areas. The majority of dog owners that we have come across that let their dog off leash, don't seem to care for anyone else or the environment. We witness time and again dogs defecating far from their owner who don't pick up after their dog. I even approached one of these people after the fact and told them. The reply I got was, "I don't have a bag to pick it up". So I picked it up with a bag, and they reluctantly took it with anger. I believe that is why a lot of bad dog owners let them off leash, to not have to pick it up. I actually know an individual who loves that his dog defecates out of his site, so as not to ever have to pick it up. I am so tired of the quantity of bad dog owners who don't care. And tired of hiking trails and not being able to look at the scenery, because we have to watch every step, as to not step in a mess left on the trail. I truly love all animals, but I do wish people would leave them at home, or go to designated dog parks only. Their freedom is encroaching on our freedom to enjoy the parks without barking, dog mess, and even dogs running up to jump on us, or over our beach blanket for our food. My wife and I try to only visit dog prohibited parks and areas. Yet, we still see dogs at these locations, mostly off leash also. I thank you for trying to restore peace again to our outdoor visits.*



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

# Fwd: Dog incident

1 message

**Frank Dean** <frank\_dean@nps.gov> Sat, Nov 2, 2013 at 9:49 AM  
To: Kevin Cochary <kevin\_cochary@nps.gov>, jason\_wu@nps.gov, Aaron Roth <aaron\_roth@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>

FYI

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** (b) (6)  
**Date:** November 2, 2013 8:32:09 AM PDT  
**To:** Francis Dean <[Frank\\_Dean@nps.gov](mailto:Frank_Dean@nps.gov)>, Howard Levitt <[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)>  
**Cc:** david anderson (b) (6)  
**Subject:** Fwd: Dog incident

Begin forwarded message: FYI - glad the USPP followed up on this. See you at the dog management public meeting today.

**From:** (b) (6)  
**Date:** November 1, 2013 11:40:05 PM PDT  
**To:** (b) (6)  
**Cc:** "Michael Lynes" <[mlynes@goldengateaudubon.org](mailto:mlynes@goldengateaudubon.org)>, (b) (6)  
**Subject:** Dog incident  
**Reply-To:** (b) (6)

Hi,

I thought you may want to be made aware of this incident. You may want to share it with Frank Dean or Howard or whomever, though they might get briefings on such matters.

(b) (6)

About 10:15 Wednesday, October 30th at Sutro Baths, a man was observed fishing on the rocks just in front of the old Bath, when his dog jumped into the water and grabbed a gull (adult western gull). He was yelled at but maybe too far away to hear, likely because of surf noise. The gull flapped and tried to get away, escaping the

dog's grip once. But the dog latched on again. The dog was a little over medium size, short-haired, light tan with pale underside, and full tail. The man could be heard saying "bring the bird, bring the bird" repeatedly. And the dog finally did, the man taking it from his jaws, clearly now dead, and tossing it on the rocks.

The Park Police were called and upon request given a description of the location, the individual, the dog, and what occurred. The dispatcher said units were not close, and at that point the man began to walk up to leave. As the man and dog passed he was told he should not be doing that. He was heard to say, "hey, that gull was about to die anyway from being bruised in the storm Sunday. My dog put him out of his misery. It was a humane thing to do for it." He was told they were protected, and he said, "they are not, and I let my dog train with them for hunting. It helps them when I go duck hunting." He was getting excitable and mentioned that some people probably never fish and hunt but get their food from Safeway! He went to his car and the dispatcher asked for and was given a description of the car - a (b) (6) and also was given the license number. And after the man left, the dispatcher was told the direction he went.

Five minutes later a patrol SUV arrived and the policeman got out and was shown the dead gull through binoculars. He said they'd stopped the man up the road a ways (three patrol cars). Said that he was pretty blatant admitting what he'd done, as if he felt he were justified, which the officer said makes their case easier. The Park Policeman related that this incident is not a matter of a fine but will be a court date for this man. The officer was given a statement and said he was going to go photograph the gull, and maybe collect the bird.

A shame for such an incident to occur but good that the Park Police took care of it.

Sent from my Verizon Wireless BlackBerry



## Fwd: SNPL problems

**Merkle, William** <bill\_merkle@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 27, 2013 at 8:26 AM

To: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Chad Marin <chad\_marin@nps.gov>, Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Cc: Sunil Rajappa <sunil\_rajappa@partner.nps.gov>, Daphne Hatch <Daphne\_Hatch@nps.gov>

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Thursday, September 26, 2013  
Subject: SNPL problems  
To: Bill Merkle <bill\_merkle@nps.gov>

Hi Bill,

There is a predatory dog walker on Ocean Beach who is really raising hell with the plovers. I mean this woman is so irresponsible she is an actual threat to the birds. I've seen her twice, today (9/26) and previously on 9/24. She's out there around 9:00 am. She left the beach at Noriega at 9:20 this morning.

The dogs are black over brown. The larger of the 2 is a mongrel and the real source of the problem. It is fast and chases the mixed flock of 40 to 50 SNPLs and Sanderlings relentlessly. I mean this dog spots the birds and attacks. It chases them into the air and causes them to fly as much as 3 blocks. It followed the same pattern both days. The other smaller dog just sort of runs along, following a bit, but basically running along the shoreline. The owner leashes both dogs when they are done with the plover flock. At least that is what she did the 2 days I've seen her. Oh, the larger dog has a red collar and was wearing a yellow scarf on the 24th, but not today.

The dog owner is a white woman. I didn't see her face well, but my impression is she's middle aged. Today she was wearing a bright mid blue sweatshirt, a black baseball style hat and had a great sweatshirt or overshirt tied around her waist. She wore the same distinctive mid blue sweatshirt on the 24th. Sorry I don't have pictures, but the batteries in my camera were dead when I tried to get her.

There is another dog that is pretty bad too and is on the beach at the same time. It's a white pit bull with an female Asian owner. The dog runs all over the beach chasing birds. It almost always has a ball in it's mouth. The owner was wearing a bright coral colored sweatshirt both on the 24th and the 26th.

And bird feeding is a problem. About half an hour after the dogs leave the beach there is a guy out there feeding the ravens. I did attach a nice picture of him on Sept. 16. This was the day he walk off with his off leashed dog (not one that chases anything), passed me and went about a block where he stopped. The birds stayed where he was feeding them in the first place. But when he stopped they took off, no doubt figuring there was more to be had. They flew low and direct over the SNPLs and Sanderlings and flushed them.

The entire flock took off. So without trying to do so, he caused a major disturbance.

All these incidents occurred between Noriega and Lawton. As you know, I don't bother calling this stuff in because it's a wasted effort. Had I called in the woman today she would have had her dogs leashed and been off the beach by the time anybody got there. Let's face it, the only way these people will ever be cited is if a ranger or park police officer actually witnesses them disturbing wildlife, and since NPS does not patrol the beach at any time during the morning prior to about 11, that isn't going to happen. My assumption is based on the fact I haven't see a single ranger or park police officer on the beach in well over a year and I'm out there for 1 to 2 hours, on one day, almost every week between mid July and the end of April.

All the best,

(b) (6)

-

Bill Merkle, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
415-289-1843



P1010058.JPG  
765K



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: please limit dog use in parks**

1 message

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Sep 25, 2013 at 9:44 AM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) your message (attached below) was forwarded to me for response, as GGNRA's lead on the dog management planning process. Given your concerns and interest in this topic, we would appreciate your comments on the draft Dog Management Plan/Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement now open for public review and comment. You can review the document and comment on it online at <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/dogplan> You can also send a letter to the park at Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Ft. Mason, Bldg. 201, San Francisco, CA 94123, or you can attend one of the 3 public open house meetings in early November. Dates and times are listed at the web site above, and at the park's web site - [www.nps.gov/goga/seis.htm](http://www.nps.gov/goga/seis.htm) Unfortunately, we are not accepting comments through email, thus the information on how you can weigh in on this important planning process.

Thank you for contacting us.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

*I read in the New York Times that the dog policy in Golden Gate National Park is being reexamined. I support limiting dog use and requiring dog owners to follow the stricter rules. My two picnics with my kids this summer at Chrissy Field were run through by dogs. In addition my toddler's face has been licked by an off leash dog at the park. I have lived in other cities and consider the lax dog rules in San Francisco to be unsafe and unfair. I feel unsafe around other people's off leash dogs and don't think my family should be forced to interact with other people's dogs when I go to a public park. Often people have their dogs off leash when signs say it is forbidden. I find this disregard to the rules as hard to explain to my kids. In Seattle, where we moved from, police gave tickets to violators of leash laws in parks. As a result, such violations became the exceptions, not the norm. In no other public space, have I seen dogs allowed such freedom because their respective owners deem them safe to do so. Dogs are unpredictable around other dogs and around kids and people they don't know—a park contains all these elements. A new dog policy would make the park safer for everyone.*



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

---

## Fwd: From NPS.gov: please limit dog use in parks

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Sep 25, 2013 at 8:41 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, & Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPS

email: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: (b) (6)  
Date: Tue, Sep 24, 2013 at 9:19 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: please limit dog use in parks  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

I read in the New York Times that the dog policy in Golden Gate National Park is being reexamined.

I support limiting dog use and requiring dog owners to follow the stricter rules.

My two picnics with my kids this summer at Chrissy Field were run through by dogs.

In addition my toddler's face has been licked by an off leash dog at the park.

I have lived in other cities and consider the lax dog rules in San Francisco to be unsafe and unfair. I feel unsafe around other people's off leash dogs and don't think my family should be forced to interact with other people's dogs when I go to a public park.

Often people have their dogs off leash when signs say it is forbidden. I find this disregard to the rules as hard to explain to my kids. In Seattle, where we moved from, police gave tickets to violators of leash laws in parks. As a result, such violations became the exceptions, not the norm.

In no other public space, have I seen dogs allowed such freedom because their respective owners deem them safe to do so. Dogs are unpredictable around other dogs and around kids and people they don't know--a park contains all these elements.

A new dog policy would make the park safer for everyone.



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## Dog attack in the Sutro Heights Park

2 messages

(b) (6)

Thu, Sep 19, 2013 at 12:06 PM

To: shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

Dear Ms. Smith,

I got attacked by dogs the other day. This was in the Sutro Heights Park. I was riding my bicycle back from the Safeway, full of shopping items. As I came around the east side of the park, two dogs, the little yappy types, charged me at full speed, furiously barking. I swerved to avoid one of them and fell off my bicycle. Being 66 years old this is not as trivial as it once was. I got up and saw one of the dogs about a yard from my feet, still furiously barking. I kicked at it. I didn't actually touch it and my kick did not discourage it from its insane barking, but it kept out of range.

The owner, a woman around 35 years old, came running towards me and told me if I kicked her dogs she would smash my face in. I don't remember exactly the conversation after that, but my theme was that dogs had to be on leashes, hers was that I was a jackass. She seemed to use that word a lot. In her place I would have apologized for having knocked someone off a bicycle, but that did not occur to her.

She got her dogs on a leash. I told her I was calling the police. She moved away quickly, three dogs on leashes, screaming things I could not understand, except the word jackass.

The police came. Officer Smith, I think. He looked for her, but I suspect she may have had a car and have driven away. He took my statement, and we had a conversation. He said he had issued citations to people with dogs off-leash. He said he knew some of the regulars in the park and has asked them to keep him informed. He asked me to telephone him when I saw dogs off leash. At first I thought this was impractical, but later I changed my mind.

This is the third time I have been attacked by dogs in the GGNRA, twice in the Sutro Heights Park and once across the street on the path up to the VA. It was getting the point that I did not want to go anywhere except the arboretum, which is dog free. Or if I went to the Sutro Heights Park or Lands End Trail, I would go at midmorning on a weekday, carrying a heavy wooden

cane for protection.

But I felt I had to conquer that fear. At my age you have to keep active. Walking in parks is about all I can do now. So the day after the attack, I took my cane and walked to the Sutro Heights Park around five o'clock. I expected to find a large number of dogs running free. I also expected to see the woman whose dogs had charged me the day before. But what I saw surprised me.

I saw a mother and a toddler playing in the grass, a father and son playing baseball, mothers with baby carriages, grandparents with baby carriages walking slowly around the path, and people sitting on the grass talking. Things that you don't see much when dogs are running free. There were dogs, but all leashed.

I don't know why I saw that peaceful scene. Perhaps it was a fluke. Or perhaps things have changed. I haven't been to that park at that hour since the dogs took over. Or perhaps it had something to do with Officer Smith's citations. Maybe only moderate policing is needed. If you do no enforcement at all, the park fills up with dogs, and the other things—the mothers and toddlers running in the grass, the fathers and sons playing baseball—disappear.

So I decided to take up Officer Smith's offer. I will not call the police if I see an obviously harmless dog waddling along behind its owner, or calm dogs sitting quietly next to their owners on the grass. But if I see dogs running wild and out of control, I will telephone. If the police are too busy to come, I won't hold it against them.

But I intend to keep walking.

I sent this email through the GGNRA website, but please pass this on to anyone who you think should read it.

Best wishes,

(b) (6)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Sep 19, 2013 at 5:26 PM

To: (b) (6)

Bcc: Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>

Oh my gosh, just got back in the office and read your email, as well as the one you sent through the park's web site. Hope you're OK and am so glad you called dispatch and spoke to an officer. Will forward your message to the head of the US Park Police so that he is aware of this situation and the officer's proactive policing. I do know they have been trying to swing by Sutro Park - and other areas - more often in response to issues reported and am very hopeful that it may be starting to improve the situation.

Best wishes, and given this - and other experiences we've discussed - your comments will provide substantive input on the park's dog management plan (<http://parkplanning.nps.gov/dogplan>).

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Attacked by dogs in Sutro Heights Park**

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Sep 19, 2013 at 12:06 PM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Thu, Sep 19, 2013 at 12:05 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Attacked by dogs in Sutro Heights Park  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

I got attacked by dogs the other day. This was in the Sutro Heights Park. I was riding my bicycle back from the Safeway, full of shopping items. As I came around the east side of the park, two dogs, the little yappy types, charged me at full speed, furiously barking. I swerved to avoid one of them and fell off my bicycle. Being 66 years old this is not as trivial as it once was. I got up and saw one of the dogs about a yard from my feet, still furiously barking. I kicked at it. I didn't actually touch it and my kick did not discourage it from its insane barking, but it kept out of range.

The owner, a woman around 35 years old, came running towards me and told me if I kicked her dogs she would smash my face in. I don't remember exactly the conversation after that, but my theme was that dogs had to be on leashes, hers was that I was a jackass. She seemed to use that word a lot. In her place I would have apologized for having knocked someone off a bicycle, but that did not occur to her.

She got her dogs on a leash. I told her I was calling the police. She moved away quickly, three dogs on leashes, screaming things I could not understand, except the word jackass.

The police came. Officer Smith, I think. He looked for her, but I suspect she may have had a car and have driven away. He took my statement, and we had a conversation. He said he had issued citations to people with dogs off-leash. He said he knew some of the regulars in the park and has asked them to keep him informed. He asked me to telephone him when I saw dogs off leash. At first I thought this was impractical, but later I changed my mind.

This is the third time I have been attacked by dogs in the GGNRA, twice in the Sutro Heights Park and once across the street on the path up to the VA. It was getting the point that I did not want to go anywhere except the arboretum, which is dog free. Or if I went to the Sutro Heights Park or Lands End Trail, I would go at midmorning on a weekday, carrying a heavy wooden cane for protection.

But I felt I had to conquer that fear. At my age you have to keep active. Walking in parks is about all I can do now. So the day after the attack, I took my cane and walked to the Sutro Heights Park around five o'clock. I expected to find a large number of dogs running free. I also expected to see the woman whose dogs had charged me the day before. But what I saw surprised me.

I saw a mother and a toddler playing in the grass, a father and son playing baseball, mothers with baby carriages, grandparents with baby carriages walking slowly around the path, and people sitting on the grass talking. Things that you do don't see much when dogs are running free. There were dogs, but all leashed.

I don't know why I saw that peaceful scene. Perhaps it was a fluke. Or perhaps things have changed. I haven't been to that park at that hour since the dogs took over. Or perhaps it had something to do with Officer Smith's citations. Maybe only moderate policing is needed. If you do no enforcement at all, the park fills up with dogs, and the other things—the mothers and toddlers running in the grass, the fathers and sons playing baseball—disappear.

So I decided to take up Officer Smith's offer. I will not call the police if I see an obviously harmless dog waddling along behind its owner, or calm dogs sitting quietly next to their owners on the grass. But if I see dogs running wild and out of control, I will telephone. If the police are too busy to come, I won't hold it against them.

But I intend to keep walking.

Best wishes,

(b) (6)





Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: Vicious dogs at Baker Beach**

8 messages

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 11:04 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Howard Levitt &lt;Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov&gt;, Alexandra Picavet &lt;Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov&gt;, Kevin Cochary &lt;Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov&gt;, Jason Wu &lt;Jason\_Wu@nps.gov&gt;

Hello (b) (6) we received your email (attached below) regarding the incident and injury you experienced at Baker Beach. We very much regret that this happened, and hope you've been treated for the bite. I will pass your message on to our Law Enforcement divisions (U.S. Park Police and Park Rangers). They do regularly patrol park sites, but given the size of the park, it's helpful for them to be aware of particular problem areas.

When you're in any GGNRA area, if you need assistance from our law enforcement staff, please do call the park's dispatch center (open 24/7) - the emergency number is 415-561-5656. If you want to report an incident - and I urge you to report this one - please call the non-emergency number: 415-561-5505, and request that an officer contact you to take a report.

The park is in the midst of a planning project to create a new dog walking regulation for GGNRA, and given your concerns, you may want to review the just-released draft dog management plan/Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement and provide comment. FYI - the preferred alternative recommends that Baker Beach be divided into two sections, one allowing on-leash dog walking and the other prohibiting dogs; no off-leash dog walking would be allowed. General information about the plan, and a link to the online site where you can review the plan and comment on it, is at: [www.nps.gov/goga/seis.htm](http://www.nps.gov/goga/seis.htm)

As to how to avoid dogs, currently, the one GGNRA beach in the city which prohibits dogs is China Beach. The intent of the dog management plan is to better balance the use of GGNRA areas and provide a variety of safe visitor experiences.

If you have any questions, please let me know. And thank you for contacting the park about this incident. I hope your future visits will be much more pleasant.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

*I have seen a steady rise in the number of Pit Bulls and other vicious dogs at Baker Beach. Yesterday, while jogging at Baker Beach, I was bit by an unleashed boxer-mix dog. While trying to scare the dog away another unleashed dog, a pit bull approached me. Unfortunately this dog did not bit me.*

*I have 3 small children and enjoy living in the Presidio, but I now feel unsafe. How do you recommend that we avoid vicious unleashed dogs at Baker Beach?*

(b) (6)

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 12:02 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Cc: Howard Levitt &lt;Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov&gt;, Alexandra Picavet &lt;Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov&gt;, Kevin Cochary

<Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Jason Wu <Jason\_Wu@nps.gov>, (b) (6)

Dear Shirwin,

Thank you for the thoughtful response and your concern about the experience of park visitors.

Because this particular dog did not have proof of vaccination and also bit a 2nd person approximately 20 minutes before me, I have begun a series of rabies shots. The rabies vaccine series requires 5 separate visits to the Emergency Department (Not available in primary care setting) and costs several thousand dollars.

I understand that the park needs to be shared with people and their pets, but the presence of unleashed vicious dogs should be prevented if possible. Thank you for forwarding information regarding the new dog walking regulation for GGNRA. I hope that this process provides all visitors a way to enjoy the Presidio.

Kind Regards,

(b) (6)

[Quoted text hidden]

--

(b) (6)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 12:14 PM

To: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Jason Wu <Jason\_Wu@nps.gov>

Cc: Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>

Kevin and Jason, could one of you have an officer contact (b) (6) to get a report? Sounds like he's not going to follow up my strong suggestion to report the incident, and a bite that leads to rabies shots definitely merits documentation.

And I apologize to all for having addresses on the cc, rather than the bcc, line. I think it's been a long week.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Jason Wu** <jason\_wu@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 12:20 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Cc: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>, Todd Roth <Todd\_Roth@nps.gov>, Jeff Wasserman <Jeff\_Wasserman@nps.gov>

Hi Shirwin,

I will my staff reach out to (b) (6) Do you have other contact info for him other than email?

Todd - please assign someone to follow up with (b) (6)

Thanks,

Jason

Jason Wu, Major  
Commander, SFFO  
United States Park Police  
(415) 561-5149 office  
(415) 561-5166 fax  
(415) 559-9642 mobile

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 12:36 PM

To: Jason Wu <jason\_wu@nps.gov>

Cc: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>, Todd Roth <Todd\_Roth@nps.gov>, Jeff Wasserman <Jeff\_Wasserman@nps.gov>

I don't have any other info, other than his email and physical address, which is in the Presidio, so perhaps that can help you reach him.

(b) (6)



Thanks, Jason and Todd.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Roth, Todd** <todd\_roth@nps.gov>

Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 2:27 PM

To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Cc: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>, Jeff Wasserman <Jeff\_Wasserman@nps.gov>, Jason Wu <Jason\_Wu@nps.gov>

Shirwin,

This incident was reported and a case number, 13-36137, was assigned when it happened. Photos were taken on scene and a follow up on documentation of proof of vaccination is being worked on. I don't understand why (b) (6) led you to believe he did not want to document the incident.

Todd

On Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 12:20 PM, Jason Wu <jason\_wu@nps.gov> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Lieutenant Todd Roth  
United States Park Police  
San Francisco Field Office  
1217 Ralston Ave, San Francisco CA 94129  
(w) 415-561-5162  
(c) 415-740-5735  
(f) 415-561-5193

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 2:42 PM  
To: "Roth, Todd" <todd\_roth@nps.gov>  
Cc: Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov>, Jeff Wasserman <Jeff\_Wasserman@nps.gov>, Jason Wu <Jason\_Wu@nps.gov>

That's great, Todd, thanks for confirming that a report was taken. I'm thinking he just didn't really see my request mid-email to report the incident. He didn't refuse, he just didn't respond, so I figured best to just start from the other end and ask you guys for assistance. But given all the effort made by officers to document the incident, am surprised he didn't at least touch on it in his message...

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 5:21 PM  
To: Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

When we put out that press piece about asking for responsibility, I ended up redacting a bunch of reports and sending them to the Funston group, just to prove that incidents had, indeed happened. So given an opening, we can do that...spoke to Dee Bardwich back then about the appropriateness of sending such things outside a FOIA, and she was in favor, assuming all personal info redacted.

SES

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

On Fri, Sep 13, 2013 at 4:49 PM, Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov> wrote:

Hi Shirwin : How can we pass on these kinds of reports Martha, et al, without compromising the guy who was bit? HL

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Re: Vicious dogs at Baker Beach

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Attacks by Vicious dogs at Baker Beach**

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Sep 12, 2013 at 9:12 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Thu, Sep 12, 2013 at 12:53 AM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Attacks by Vicious dogs at Baker Beach  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Fwd: From NPS.gov: Attacks by Vicious dogs at Baker Beach

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /prsf/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

I have seen a steady rise in the number of Pit Bulls and other vicious dogs at Baker Beach. Yesterday, while jogging at Baker Beach, I was bit by an unleashed boxer-mix dog. While trying to scare the dog away another unleashed dog, a pit bull approached me. Unfortunately this dog did not bit me.

I have 3 small children and enjoy living in the Presidio, but I now feel unsafe. How do you recommend that we avoid vicious unleashed dogs at Baker Beach?



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## Fort Funston dog interaction

9 messages

---

**Eric Klein** <EKlein@parksconservancy.org>

Tue, Sep 10, 2013 at 5:04 PM

To: Holly Chrobak <HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Jane Chin <JChin@parksconservancy.org>

Cc: Monica Stafford <MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Betty Young <Betty@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner <SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

Greetings, all.

One of our restoration technicians, John Anderson, was working at Fort Funston last month and had a troubling interaction with some dogs and their dog walker. We reported this to Park Police, and filled out an incident report with them the next day. I'm passing this on to get any feedback from you all regarding how to best proceed with incidents like this, and to give you an update of what happens in the field. Although this takes place the field, workplace-safety should still apply here, and I thought that sharing this with HR to get your feedback would also be worthwhile.

His note to me is below.

Thanks,

Eric Klein

Park Stewardship Program

Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy

Building 201, Fort Mason

San Francisco, CA 94123

tel: (415) 341-3066

[www.parksconservancy.org](http://www.parksconservancy.org)

*The nonprofit support partner for the Golden Gate National Parks*

--- --

Hi Eric,

I had a run-in with some dogs this afternoon at Fort Funston. I was unhurt.

Around 4:30 at Battery Davis, I was weeding cape ivy around a eucalyptus most of the way up the slope, just north of the entrance to the first (most southern) casemate. I was kneeling, and heard a growling. I looked up and saw it was a pit bull coming up the slope to me, snarling and occasionally barking. There were also 5 or 6 other dogs, none on leashes. I got up and watched as the pit bull came up to about my level and faced me, snarling and barking. At that point another dog came up behind me and nipped me on the ankle. He didn't break the skin; I don't know if that was because he wasn't trying or because of my trousers and two pairs of socks. I yelled at the dog to back off, then turned and yelled at the pit bull, which was climbing up the slope above me. I moved up the slope so as not to be between the two dogs, shouting things like "back off!" and "bag dog!". The guy walking the dogs was coming up the slope and I yelled "curb your dog!" and similar things to him. I don't recall if I said the dog tried to bite me.

He called the dogs, and I kept yelling at them, and they went back down to him. He said something like "Sorry, I didn't know they would do that". I glared at him. I probably should have tried to get his name, but at that point I felt the less I said the better. He walked away with the dogs. At no point did he leash them, and I didn't notice any leashes on him.

Later, on the Horse Trail, another dog came up aggressive and snarling. I stood up and looked at it until its owner pulled it away. This latter interaction is not uncommon at Fort Funston, but it's been a while since a dog has tried to bite me.

If there is some kind of incident report form I can fill out, please let me know.

Regards,

John

---

**Betty Young** <Betty@parksconservancy.org>

Tue, Sep 10, 2013 at 6:43 PM

To: Eric Klein <EKlein@parksconservancy.org>, Holly Chrobak <HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Jane Chin <JChin@parksconservancy.org>, (b) (6)

(b) (6) " (b) (6) , Meghan Steinharter  
<msteinharter@parksconservancy.org>

Cc: Monica Stafford <MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner <SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

John, so sorry that happened.

We did a training with a dog trainer, several years ago. Do you think it is worthwhile to repeat that? Training or not, I would freak out, if a pit bull was coming up the hill at me. So glad he did not attack.

Be sure to call park police immediately, if there is, hopefully not , a next time.

Shirwin, any advice. Looks like it is still 2015 for final Rules.

Have a great day,

Betty

*Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy Nurseries*

*Desk 415-561-3532, FAX 561-3003, Cell 415-497-5671*

---

**From:** Eric Klein  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 10, 2013 5:04 PM  
**To:** Holly Chrobak; Shirwin Smith; Jane Chin  
**Cc:** Monica Stafford; Betty Young; Sue Gardner  
**Subject:** Fort Funston dog interaction

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 1:32 PM  
To: Eric Klein <EKlein@parksconservancy.org>  
Cc: Holly Chrobak <HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Jane Chin <JChin@parksconservancy.org>, Monica Stafford <MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Betty Young <Betty@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner <SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

Hi Eric - so sorry to hear this. We did distribute small air horns to park and Conservancy staff to use if dogs come at them aggressively. This was recommended by the SF SPCA dog behavior trainers. Did you guys get any of those? They were all handed out and too late in fy for me to buy more, but perhaps the Conservancy can?

Also, when discussing this problem with the Funston Dog Walking Group, we agreed that putting a sign(s) up on nearby trails indicating park workers were in the area and requesting that dogs be kept under control and out of work areas would be a good idea and could help. I was picturing one of those smaller, plastic A-frames that wouldn't be too hard to carry. I believe Sharon Kato developed some sort of cool looking, Schwab-style sign with the outline of a worker and some text. However, I can't find it in any of my files. Hopefully someone at your end can locate it?

There are a few pointers I could pass along about dealing with dogs that we learned from the SFSPCA trainers, but if there are a bunch of people that could use the information, maybe we need to see if the SFSPCA would be willing to give another staff training.

Let me know -

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Betty Young** <Betty@parksconservancy.org> Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 3:18 PM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Eric Klein <EKlein@parksconservancy.org>, Meghan Steinharter

<msteinharter@parksconservancy.org>, (b) (6)

Cc: Holly Chrobak <HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Jane Chin <JChin@parksconservancy.org>, Monica Stafford <MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner <SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

No, our staff didn't get airhorns. But I will buy some, do you have the type and where they came from, by chance?

I remember the sign. But I don't have a copy. We check with Sharon, if Meghan doesn't have the file.

I already asked Clara (park Academy) to set up another training with Helen Columbo at SFSPCA. Is she still the one?

Have a great day,

Betty

*Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy Nurseries*

*Desk 415-561-3532, FAX 561-3003, Cell 415-497-5671*

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:shirwin\_smith@nps.gov]

**Sent:** Wednesday, September 11, 2013 1:32 PM

**To:** Eric Klein

**Cc:** Holly Chrobak; Jane Chin; Monica Stafford; Betty Young; Sue Gardner

**Subject:** Re: Fort Funston dog interaction

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 4:21 PM

To: Betty Young <Betty@parksconservancy.org>

Cc: Eric Klein <EKlein@parksconservancy.org>, Meghan Steinharter <msteinharter@parksconservancy.org>, (b) (6)

(b) (6), Holly Chrobak

<HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Jane Chin <JChin@parksconservancy.org>, Monica Stafford

<MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner <SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

The airhorns I bought were from Craig's Warehouse, 15 Dodie St, San Rafael (456-5090) - around \$5 apiece as I recall. If you call ahead, they can order in quantity - assuming they still carry them. These are much cheaper than the small air horns you'd get at West Marine. No brand name on the one in my office, just "air horn" - size is 1.8 oz.

The gals that did the training for the park were Kim Moeller and Erika Slovikoski, and I worked through James Dress, SPCA training manager. Don't know Helen Columbo.

Thanks, Betty!

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith

Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Betty Young** <Betty@parksconservancy.org> Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 4:30 PM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Clara Voigt <CVoigt@parksconservancy.org>

Thanks Shirwin. Got Helen's name from an e-mail Sharon sent about doing a training. We will contact the folks below. I assume they are SF SPCA?

I'll check out Craig's Warehouse, thanks.

Have a great day,

Betty

*Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy Nurseries*

*Desk 415-561-3532, FAX 561-3003, Cell 415-497-5671*

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:shirwin\_smith@nps.gov]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 11, 2013 4:22 PM  
**To:** Betty Young  
**Cc:** Eric Klein; Meghan Steinharter; (b) (6); Holly Chrobak; Jane Chin; Monica Stafford; Sue Gardner

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 5:03 PM  
To: Betty Young <Betty@parksconservancy.org>  
Cc: Clara Voigt <CVoigt@parksconservancy.org>

Betty, I'll start the ball rolling by introducing you guys to (b) (6) by email - I've been working with him for a year so we are regularly in touch.

OK?

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201

San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Betty Young** <Betty@parksconservancy.org>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
Cc: Clara Voigt <CVoigt@parksconservancy.org>

Wed, Sep 11, 2013 at 5:08 PM

That would be great. then Clara will have his contact info.

Have a great day,

Betty

*Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy Nurseries*

*Desk 415-561-3532, FAX 561-3003, Cell 415-497-5671*

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:shirwin\_smith@nps.gov]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 11, 2013 5:03 PM  
**To:** Betty Young  
**Cc:** Clara Voigt

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Eric Klein** <EKlein@parksconservancy.org> Thu, Sep 12, 2013 at 9:52 AM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Betty Young <Betty@parksconservancy.org>  
Cc: Meghan Steinharter <msteinharter@parksconservancy.org>, (b) (6)  
(b) (6) Holly Chrobak <HChrobak@parksconservancy.org>, Jane Chin  
<JChin@parksconservancy.org>, Monica Stafford <MStafford@parksconservancy.org>, Sue Gardner  
<SGardner@parksconservancy.org>

Hi all, thanks for the responses.

Thank you Betty for so quickly providing air horns to our team. John, I'll give them to you on Saturday.

Regarding the signs, this is news to me – if we can't find the file already made by Sharon, let me know, and we'll create some new ones. Thanks for that lead.

Unfortunately, many of us didn't get to attend the SPCA training. If this being scheduled again, please let us know. And it may be worth noting that the vast majority of our field staff doesn't work on Mondays, so

having a training on a different day of the week would increase attendance.

Thanks again to all, and we look forward to moving forward with working more safely at Fort Funston,

Eric Klein

Park Stewardship Program

Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy

Building 201, Fort Mason

San Francisco, CA 94123

tel: (415) 341-3066

[www.parksconservancy.org](http://www.parksconservancy.org)

*The nonprofit support partner for the Golden Gate National Parks*

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)]

**Sent:** Wednesday, September 11, 2013 4:22 PM

**To:** Betty Young

**Cc:** Eric Klein; Meghan Steinharter; (b) (6) Holly Chrobak; Jane Chin; Monica Stafford; Sue Gardner

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: posting guidelines regarding unleash dogs at crissy field**

2 messages

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Aug 14, 2013 at 2:58 PM

To: (b) (6)

Bcc: Janet Takashiro &lt;janet\_takashiro@nps.gov&gt;, Howard Levitt &lt;Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov&gt;

Hello (b) (6) your email to Superintendent Dean regarding your concerns about off leash dogs at Crissy Field was forwarded to me for response, as I am the park's point person for the dog management project.

We certainly regret that you and your children have had unpleasant and difficult experiences while visiting Crissy Field. Although at this time dogs are allowed to be off leash at Crissy Field, they are expected to be under voice control. If you ever need assistance from our law enforcement personnel while at any GGNRA site, please call our 24/7 Dispatch Center. The emergency number is 415-561-5656; if you just want to have a report taken on an incident, the non-emergency number is 415-561-5505.

With your concerns, you may be aware that the park is involved in a planning project to address dog management here in GGNRA that would allow some off leash use to continue, but in such a way as to not impact other users or park resources. The next step will be the release of a draft plan and Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement (EIS), which will be released for public comment in the near future. Details of the project are on the park's web site at: <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

If you would like to be added to the project's email contact list so that you will be notified when the draft EIS is released for comment, please let me know. And if you have any additional questions, please do give me a call to discuss further.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

---

(b) (6)

Thu, Aug 15, 2013 at 11:33 AM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Thank you very much Shirwin. I would very much like to be put on the project's email list. And I will also make good use of those numbers you provided. Thank you for your thoughtful email.

I look forward to seeing the progress of your project. I'm sure it won't be easy to balance the varying needs and concerns of all major perspectives - but I wish you much good luck.

Best,

(b) (6)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Re: Leash laws needed**

2 messages

**Solomon, Sara** <sara\_solomon@nps.gov>

Mon, Jul 29, 2013 at 11:36 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Board &lt;board-mail4@flyfunston.org&gt;, Shirwin Smith &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;, Matt Wallat &lt;matt\_wallat@nps.gov&gt;

Hi (b) (6)

I'm so sorry to hear about (b) (6)'s experience. I mentioned this to Shirwin (whom I believe you know is spearheading our Dog Management Plan efforts in the park). She asked that you please continue to let us know when things like this happen, and to file an incident report with our rangers. If we have records of incidents like this on file, it helps support the need we've expressed for better dog management.

Again, very sorry that (b) (6) was subjected to such inappropriate behavior on the part of the dogs and their walker(s)! Please convey to the other gliders (and visitors in the area) that if they feel threatened in any way, they should always reach out to dispatch. The non-emergency number there is: 415-561-5505.

Best regards,  
Sara

On Thu, Jul 25, 2013 at 3:58 PM, (b) (6) wrote:

Hello Sara,

FYI, no action required.

I just received a report from FF club member (b) (6) was starting to shovel away the chip pile when 4 out of 12 dogs in a dog-walker's pack semi-attacked him. I say "semi" because he was not bitten, just growled and barked at a lot. He told me that he felt threatened and left the area. I can understand how shaken he might feel by numerous dogs coming together in a pack mentality like that!

(b) (6) is one of our senior citizen members, and as a result of today's incident, has resigned from his volunteer position on the chips maintenance team. I told (b) (6) that we were sorry to see him go but that things will likely get safer in about 18 months or so, assuming the dog management plan goes into effect per schedule. Let's keep our fingers crossed!

Regards,

(b) (6)

<http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

### Project Schedule as of March 2013

Spring 2013: Release the Supplemental EIS (SEIS) for public comment

Summer/Fall 2013: Incorporate public comment on the SEIS into the Proposed Rule

Spring 2014: Release the Notice of Proposed Rulemaking for public comment

Summer/Fall 2014: Incorporate public comment on the Proposed Rule into the Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) and Final Rule

Spring 2015: Release the FEIS

Early Spring 2015: Publish the Final Rule. Implementation begins 30 days after the rule is published

--

Sara Solomon  
Business Management Analyst (Partner Liaison)  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
[sara\\_solomon@nps.gov](mailto:sara_solomon@nps.gov)  
(415) 561-4742

*Everybody needs beauty as well as bread, places to play and pray in, where Nature may heal and cheer and give strength to body and souls alike.*

- John Muir, considered the father of our National Parks

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

Mon, Jul 29, 2013 at 2:34 PM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Board <[board-mail4@flyfunston.org](mailto:board-mail4@flyfunston.org)>, Matt Wallat <[matt\\_wallat@nps.gov](mailto:matt_wallat@nps.gov)>, "Solomon, Sara" <[sara\\_solomon@nps.gov](mailto:sara_solomon@nps.gov)>

Hi (b) (6) - quick heads up that the schedule on the web page has been updated - here's the most current.

### Project Schedule as of July 2013

Fall 2013: Release the Supplemental EIS (SEIS) for public comment

Spring - Summer 2014: Incorporate public comment on the SEIS into the Proposed Rule

Fall 2014: Release the Notice of Proposed Rulemaking for public comment

Winter 2014 - Spring 2015: Incorporate public comment on the Proposed rule into the Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) and final rule

Summer 2015: FEIS published

Fall 2015: Record of Decision published

Winter 2015: Final rule published. Implementation begins 30 days after the rule is published

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Re: Leash laws needed

415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Complaint re: off leash dogs regularly in Sutro Heights park**

8 messages

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jul 15, 2013 at 12:48 PM

To: Constance Leonard &lt;Constance\_Leonard@nps.gov&gt;, Kevin Cochary &lt;Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov&gt;

Cc: Frank Dean &lt;Frank\_Dean@nps.gov&gt;, Howard Levitt &lt;Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov&gt;, Alexandra Picavet &lt;Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov&gt;

Supt's office received a complaint from a Sutro Heights neighbor who documented regular use of the park by neighbors who use it as an off-leash park. Spoke to the neighbor; apparently use is quite regular, M-F around 5. She witnessed an incident between off leash dogs and children which finally prompted her to contact the park. She was concerned that the park was not well signed (we've checked - every entrance has a dogs on leash required sign), and that enforcement was needed to address the attitude that this was the neighborhood off leash park. Gave her the dispatch numbers and said I'd pass the message on to LE.

Any chance of some checking around 5ish on some weekday evenings?

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jul 15, 2013 at 12:50 PM

To: Todd Roth &lt;todd\_roth@nps.gov&gt;

Got Connie's out of office message, so am forwarding this to you.. Thanks for any help.

Shirwin

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Roth, Todd** <todd\_roth@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 16, 2013 at 10:31 AM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Yes,

I will put it out to our patrol supervisors and have the area checked, but as you stated it is best when they call us when they see it happening.

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Lieutenant Todd Roth  
United States Park Police  
San Francisco Field Office  
1217 Ralston Ave, San Francisco CA 94129  
(w) 415-561-5162  
(c) 415-740-5735  
(f) 415-561-5193

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Leonard, Constance" <constance\_leonard@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 10:02 AM

Hi Connie - Todd did respond on Jul 16 (forwarded to him when I saw your out of office message) - said he would put out to patrols, but also mentioned best if we are alerted. Interesting thing is that it's not just one person - apparently there are a number of folks who live near by and consider this their park for off leash dog walking after work. The complainant is also a neighbor and altho I did give her the dispatch numbers, she may not want to become the neighborhood rat...

SES

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

On Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 9:28 AM, Leonard, Constance <constance\_leonard@nps.gov> wrote:

I will pass this on to Lt Roth, but it would be better if the person called when the violator was actually at the park - connie

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Captain Constance Leonard  
Assistant Commander,  
San Francisco Field Office  
415 561 - 5170 Office  
415 559 - 8966 Nextel

**Picavet, Alexandra** <alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
Cc: Constance Leonard <Constance\_Leonard@nps.gov>, Kevin Cochary <Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Todd Roth <Todd\_Roth@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 2:13 PM

Hi Shirwin, did this ever get followed up with?  
Alexandra Picavet

On Mon, Jul 15, 2013 at 12:48 PM, Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> wrote:

Supt's office received a complaint from a Sutro Heights neighbor who documented regular use of the park by neighbors who use it as an off-leash park. Spoke to the neighbor; apparently use is quite regular, M-F around 5. She witnessed an incident between off leash dogs and children which finally prompted her to contact the park. She was concerned that the park was not well signed (we've checked - every entrance has a dogs on leash required sign), and that enforcement was needed to address the attitude that this was the neighborhood off leash park. Gave her the dispatch numbers and said I'd pass the message on to LE.

Any chance of some checking around 5ish on someweekday evenings?

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant

Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

---

**Leonard, Constance** <constance\_leonard@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 2:15 PM

isnt she already? in an indirect and less than efficient way? i passed it on to todd - thank s- c

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Cochary, Kevin** <kevin\_cochary@nps.gov>  
To: "Picavet, Alexandra" <alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 5:16 PM

Cc: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, Constance Leonard <Constance\_Leonard@nps.gov>, Howard Levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>, Todd Roth <Todd\_Roth@nps.gov>, Chad Marin <Chad\_Marin@nps.gov>, Kurt Veeck <Kurt\_Veeck@nps.gov>, Matt Wallat <Matt\_Wallat@nps.gov>, Mike Yost <Mike\_Yost@nps.gov>, Randy Lavoisier <Randy\_Lavoisier@nps.gov>, Scott Larson <Scott\_L\_Larson@nps.gov>, Xave Agnew <Xave\_Agnew@nps.gov>

Alex,

Our supervisors have been copied and will advise staff to check as available.

Kevin Cochary  
Chief Ranger  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
415-289-3131  
415-813-9700 cell  
415-339-9137 fax

On Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 4:39 PM, Picavet, Alexandra <alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov> wrote:

Great. Thanks-

Alexandra Picavet  
Public Affairs Specialist  
Golden Gate National Parks  
[alexandra\\_picavet@nps.gov](mailto:alexandra_picavet@nps.gov)  
415-786-8021 mobile  
[www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)

On Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 4:34 PM, Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> wrote:

Yes, spoke to her and followed up with Todd Roth while Connie was on leave.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Cochary, Kevin" <kevin\_cochary@nps.gov>

Tue, Jul 23, 2013 at 5:27 PM

Thanks, Kevin. We've heard from other neighbors over the past couple of years with the same issue - they would certainly welcome checks of Sutro HP when possible on weekday evenings. Sounds like some education is in order...and good news is that there are signs at all entrances.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: Dicamptodon ensatus siting**

9 messages

---

**Fong, Darren** <darren\_fong@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
Cc: William Merkle <bill\_merkle@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 2:36 PM

Hi Shirwin, this looks more like a dog issue email. Did you want to respond? Thx! Darren

Darren Fong  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Bldg 1061, Fort Cronkhite  
Sausalito, CA 94965  
415-289-1838 (phone)  
415-331-0851 (fax)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Sun, May 19, 2013 at 3:23 PM  
Subject: Dicamptodon ensatus siting  
To: [webmaster@patuxent.usgs.gov](mailto:webmaster@patuxent.usgs.gov)  
Cc: [Darren\\_Fong@nps.gov](mailto:Darren_Fong@nps.gov)

My wife and I saw a Giant Salamander (huge) in The Golden Gate National Recreation Area about a month ago in the Oakwood Valley Creek at the bridge before leaving the trail at the fire road. Sadly the creek runs parallel to the fire road on one side and the trail on the other, and is designated for dogs to be on leash or under voice control. I believe closure to pets and increased enforcement of the Tennessee Valley Trail (TVR) has caused many dog owners to find an alternative. The Oakwood Valley Trail and Rhubarb Trail along Nyhan Creek have become convenient areas for dog owners to exercise bad behavior. Rangers drive about a mile further past these trails on to the TVR presumably to do enforcement of the major trail leading out to the beach. However, pet feces is left on the Oakwood Creek trails and in the habitat while dogs are allowed to run free disrupting the creek and it's banks until "voice control" takes hold, or the dog leaves the creek to catch up with their owner. How much impact will this have on the creek and wildlife? Should the creek be protected? My experience is that it isn't.

Got the contact info from: Open File Report 2006-1066

Distribution and Abundance of California Giant Salamander (*Dicamptodon ensatus*) and Signal Crayfish (*Pacifastacus leniusculus*) in the Upper Redwood Creek Watershed, Marin County, California  
By Darren Fong  
(Division of Natural Resource Management and Science,  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area) and Judd A. Howell

(U.S. Geological Survey, Patuxent Wildlife Research Center)  
In cooperation with the National Park Service U.S.

(b) (6)



---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Fong, Darren" <darren\_fong@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 2:37 PM

Have been in regular contact with this person since last week. Can you give any info on whether giant salamanders could be in this area?

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Fong, Darren** <darren\_fong@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 2:45 PM

Hi Shirwin, yes, giant salamanders have been observed here. The adults breed in the creek and the larvae can be found anytime during the year in the creek. Adults are typically in the riparian areas adjacent. Denuded creek banks probably not ideal habitat conditions for adults. Haven't been to Oakwood for years, so not sure how it looks. D

Darren Fong  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Bldg 1061, Fort Cronkhite  
Sausalito, CA 94965  
415-289-1838 (phone)  
415-331-0851 (fax)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Fong, Darren" <darren\_fong@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 3:01 PM

Are these salamanders a protected species?

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Fong, Darren** <darren\_fong@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 3:07 PM

No special status. D

Darren Fong  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Bldg 1061, Fort Cronkhite  
Sausalito, CA 94965  
415-289-1838 (phone)  
415-331-0851 (fax)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: (b) (6)  
Cc: Darren Fong <Darren\_Fong@nps.gov>  
Bcc: Bill Merkle <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 3:54 PM

Hello (b) (6) your message was forwarded to me for response, and as you know from our discussion, the park does agree with you that wildlife should be protected. That is one of the drivers of our multi-year effort to put a new rule for dog walking into place.

On a side note, I walked part of the Oakwood Valley area this morning and will look into some additional signage, as well as contacting our Stewardship group to see if they can bolster that fence along the restored area on the Oakwood Valley Fire Road.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

(b) (6)  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 4:40 PM

GREAT! Thanks Shirwin that will help a lot, but is the Superintendent's Compendium 1/10/2012 Exhibit 10B (Index incorrectly labeled 10A) correct? It looks like the Fire Road is open to on and off leash, but the Oakwood Valley Trail (both ends) and Rhubarb "upper trail" (beyond the TCSD side where it ties into the Miwok) is closed to pets. Will that be marked at both ends of GGNRA property too? Not that it will make that much difference if the Rangers don't enforce that section. They will remain a popular doggie dump and paly ground. At least it will

have the paper tiger in place.

Thanks again.

(b) (6)

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)]  
**Sent:** Monday, May 20, 2013 3:55 PM  
**To:** (b) (6)  
**Cc:** Darren Fong  
**Subject:** Fwd: Dicamptodon ensatus siting

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 4:51 PM

To: (b) (6)

The exhibit is incorrect about Oakwood Valley - doesn't match the text of the compendium. But am checking about whether we were correct in noting the NPS section of the Rhubarb Trail as closed to dogs. That will take a bit of time, and can be corrected in the next compendium or compendium amendment.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

(b) (6)

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 7:33 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

Thanks again Shirwin.

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)]  
**Sent:** Monday, May 20, 2013 4:52 PM  
**To:** (b) (6)  
**Subject:** Re: Dicamptodon ensatus siting

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Ft Mason Off Leash Dogs**

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Jul 3, 2013 at 9:09 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Fri, Jun 21, 2013 at 4:22 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Ft Mason Off Leash Dogs  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Hello,

I'm concerned about the increasing number of off-leash dogs at Ft Mason park. I particularly choose this park to take my dog for walks because it is an ON-leash park. Most people don't mind off leash dogs if they are well controlled and friendly. Unfortunately, we have had more and more experiences with aggressive dogs and clueless owners. I'm hoping there could possibly be a sign posted stating more clearly that it is indeed an on-leash park. I know that police patrol sometimes but I heard they rarely give out tickets and I haven't seen them for ages.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Dog out of control**

1 message

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Wed, Jun 5, 2013 at 8:14 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: (b) (6)  
Date: Sun, Jun 2, 2013 at 6:50 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Dog out of control  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

Love Stinson Beach! Have a second home on Laurel. Was hiking on the beach early this morning (Sunday June 2) on the Dog side (one can walk for a longer stretch there), when suddenly a very very large St. Bernard (or mix) ran directly at me chasing another dog. I could not avoid him, so crashed onto the sand and in the process re-injured my left knee (have a set of walking poles to help me get back up the Laurel street hill--osteoarthritis.)

Of course, this dog was off-leash, and I have no problem in general with that behavior. But the owner was right there, and obviously did not have control of her dog. I am a great supporter of State Parks and would like to see more ranger action at Stinson on weekends. Thanks for listening!



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**RE: Commercial Dog Walking**

3 messages

**Pelka, John** <JPelka@presidiotrust.gov>

Fri, May 10, 2013 at 1:27 PM

To: (b) (6) &gt;

Cc: Shirwin Smith &lt;Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov&gt;

Mr. Armstrong-

Thank you for your comments and your interest in the Trust's commercial dog management rule. We are still reviewing the over 250 comments received during the public comment period (closed February 25, 2013) but we will be reaching a decision shortly (before July 1) and posting it on our website. Others have expressed the approach that you suggest, and we are taking it into consideration. Please note that Baker Beach is under the jurisdiction of the National Park Service. I have copied my NPS counterpart to pass on your observations regarding the Snowy plovers.

John

JOHN PELKA  
COMPLIANCE MANAGER

THE PRESIDIO TRUST  
103 Montgomery Street  
Post Office Box 29052  
San Francisco, California  
94129-0052

-----Original Message-----

From: (b) (6)  
Sent: Friday, May 10, 2013 11:13 AM  
To: Pelka, John  
Subject: Commercial Dog Walking

Hi! I have a couple of questions. Has the Trust adopted its proposal for Commercial Dog Walkers yet? If so, is there a link to the information in the Federal Register? If not, when might we expect the decision? Also, has the appearance of endangered Snowy plovers on Baker Beach in recent weeks been noticed by the Trust? If so, has their presence been considered in the Proposal (or in any updates or addendums)? If not, please allow me to announce to the Trust the arrival of this endangered species to the north end of Baker Beach (and possibly Marshall's Beach).

I understand that new public suggestions were taken only up to Jan. 25th, 2013, but please allow me, also, to remind the Trust just what an annoyance and inconvenience these dog walking companies and independent contractors are to park visitors. Why doesn't the Trust regulate this business activity with already-existing Commercial Use Authorization permits system, and then reap the financial benefits therein? The Trust seems to have confused the issue of private citizens walking their own dog(s) with that of private business conducting business activity within the boundaries of this National Park. I could go into great detail of how these individuals detract from the natural beauty and serenity of the park and beaches, damage sensitive habitat, and threaten already threatened wildlife. But to stick to a point, I suggest the method of Commercial Use Authorization permits, which involve fees, liability insurance and automobile insurance (in force when on the job within park boundaries). These costs would, most likely, prove cost-prohibitive to the dog-walker companies and sub-contractors, and would force them to the PROPER city dog parks and off-leash areas

ALREADY IN PLACE. It would, also, relieve the Trust of burden of the "please-all-the-people, all-the- time" assessment of its public responsibility, and allow the Trust to act merely as a regulatory agency, in this specific, particular instance. If the regulation is in place, it should be no surprise to anyone that it is enforced. Only after the dog walking companies are reduced or eliminated from National Park areas can we truly assess the impact of private dog owners walking their own dogs. It is these private owners (in large numbers, organized in groups) that threaten to thwart your Proposal. So, why not split the Proposal into "Private Use" and "Business Use" sections, and see how that sits with the public?

Sincerely,

(b) (6)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 3:39 PM

To: (b) (6)

Bcc: Bill Merkle <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>

Hello (b) (6) John Pelka of the Presidio Trust forwarded your message to me regarding the sighting of snowy plovers on Baker Beach. Although we've long been aware of snowy plovers on Ocean Beach and in the Wildlife Protection Area at Crissy Field, we're not aware of plovers being present on north Baker Beach. We'd be most interested in your source of information or documentation you have on the sightings.

Thank you for your interest in this threatened species -

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

(b) (6)

Sat, May 18, 2013 at 10:17 PM

To: shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

I actually saw flocks (different?) of about twenty birds foraging in the surf three times in late April and early May, mornings from 10am to noonish. It's very endearing to watch them move in and out with the surf, barely out of water's reach, like little golf balls with legs..... The last time (in early May), two off-leash dogs scared them off. Just dogs playing, but the plovers didn't appreciate the mirth. I go beaching weather-permitting, but I haven't spotted them recently. I'll keep watch, and keep you posted of my next sighting.

Thanks

(b) (6)

May 15, 2013 03:39:50 PM, [shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov) wrote:

(b) (6) John Pelka of the Presidio Trust forwarded your message to me regarding the sighting of snowy plovers on Baker Beach. Although we've long been aware of snowy plovers on Ocean Beach and in the Wildlife Protection Area at Crissy Field, we're not aware of plovers being present on north Baker Beach. We'd be most interested in your source of information or documentation you have on the sightings.

>Thank you for your interest in this threatened species -

>Shirwin SmithManagement AssistantGolden Gate National Recreation Area

Ft. Mason, Building 201San Francisco, CA 94123415-561-4947 (o)415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Dog Feces Tam Valley GGNRA Trails**

3 messages

---

**Su, George** <george\_su@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 14, 2013 at 8:53 AM

Thanks. :o)

Sincerely,

George Su :o)  
Multimedia Specialist / Park Web Administrator  
Multimedia Volunteer Coordinator  
Division of Interpretation & Education

Golden Gate National Recreation Area, Muir Woods National Monument, &amp; Fort Point National Historic Site

Fort Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123

phone (415) 561-4758

Twitter  
@RangerBenyBison  
@GoldenGateNPS  
@FortPointNPS  
@MuirWoodsNPSemail: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)  
web: [www.nps.gov/goga](http://www.nps.gov/goga)  
[www.nps.gov/fopo](http://www.nps.gov/fopo)  
[www.nps.gov/muwo](http://www.nps.gov/muwo)

---

The National Park Service cares for special places saved by the American people so that all may experience our heritage.

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA

---

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Mon, May 13, 2013 at 10:53 AM  
Subject: From NPS.gov: Dog Feces Tam Valley GGNRA Trails  
To: [george\\_su@nps.gov](mailto:george_su@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

I live within walking distance of trails in the Tennessee Valley Golden Gate National Recreation Area. I walk along Tennessee Valley Road (TVR) to the Rhubarb Trail to the Miwok, down TVR to the Oakwood Valley trail and fire road back to TVR. Unfortunately, the road and trails are littered with fresh dog feces. Frequently, I see plastic bags of it left on the trail awaiting pickup on the return trip I suppose. Regardless, I have observed more dogs off lease than on and many dogs allowed loose off trail, and a good distance from the owner. Dogs are also being allowed in Oakwood Valley creek at the bridge where the trail and fire road meet. I saw a very large salamander at the bridge about a month ago, but not since dogs have been in the creek. Today I passed a young lady jogging along the Oakwood Valley Trail. She was well out of sight before a dog came ambling down the trail apparently following the jogger, because no one was following the dog. An otherwise pleasant and enjoyable walk is interrupted by the need to watch your step rather than looking at the beauty of Tam Valley. I frequently hear dogs barking and owners trying to get "control" of their dog(s) instead of animal sounds. Not sure what can be done to enforce good behavior on the trail other than to keep pets off of it.

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, May 14, 2013 at 4:08 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) your email regarding your experiences walking in the Tennessee Valley area was forwarded to me for response, as I'm the point person for the park's dog management project.

Currently, as a result of a federal court decision in 2005, the dog walking status here is a mix of areas open to on leash dog walking, voice control dog walking and areas closed to dogs - although in all those areas the regulation to pick up after your dog still applies.

Tennessee Valley Trail, is closed to dog walking, and signed as such, but as we know from citations issued, many appear to ignore the signs. The Miwok Trail that goes north from the Tennessee Valley parking lot is an on leash trail. Oakwood Valley, however, is open to voice control. The Rhubarb Trail is largely on Tamalpais Community Services District land, but partly on GGNRA land. That too is an on leash trail.

The goal of our dog management planning effort is to bring a more understandable, and balanced approach to where and how dog walking is allowed in GGNRA -while protecting both resources and visitors. Information on that project is on the park's website at: <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

The next phase of the project is the release of the Supplemental EIS (SEIS) for Dog Management for public comment. Notice of the SEIS will go out to all on our email contact list; if you are not on that list yet, may I add you? We would appreciate having your input in the planning process

Thank you for contacting us with your concerns.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/contacts.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

I live within walking distance of trails in the Tennessee Valley Golden Gate National Recreation Area. I walk along Tennessee Valley Road (TVR) to the Rhubarb Trail to the Miwok, down TVR to the Oakwood Valley trail and fire road back to TVR. Unfortunately, the road and trails are littered with fresh dog feces. Frequently, I see plastic bags of it left on the trail awaiting pickup on the return trip I suppose. Regardless, I have observed more dogs off lease than on and many dogs allowed loose off trail, and a good distance from the owner. Dogs are also being allowed in Oakwood Valley creek at the bridge where the trail and fire road meet. I saw a very large salamander at the bridge about a month ago, but not since dogs have been in the creek. Today I passed a young lady jogging along the Oakwood Valley Trail. She was well out of sight before a dog came ambling down the trail apparently following the jogger, because no one was following the dog. An otherwise pleasant and enjoyable walk is interrupted by the need to watch your step rather than looking at the beauty of Tam Valley. I frequently hear dogs barking and owners trying to get "control" of their dog(s) instead of animal sounds. Not sure what can be done to enforce good behavior on the trail other than to keep pets off of it.

(b) (6)

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 1:56 AM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thank you for your response. Yes please add me to the list.

My opinion is that dogs should not be allowed off lease in the GGNRA. Although it may not prevent pet owners from leaving their dogs' business on the path, they will have to stand a little closer to their animal while it happens.

A great deal of effort and money is invested in invasive plant removal and habitat restoral in GGRNA. Allowing pets to run free, as many of the people I observe almost daily do, damages the environment and is not in the public interest. I see no enforcement of [36 CFR § 2.15](#), [36 CFR § 2.1](#), [36 CFR § 2.2](#), or [36 CFR § 2.34\(a\)\(4\)](#); consequently, current policy only serves dog owners and they take full advantage of it. Dogs run loose in the habitat, wild animals are at risk, and feces is left on and off the trail. Having dogs under voice control is a joke and does not protect fragile GGNR or others on the trail. A few days ago a dog owner allowed his 2 dogs (off lease) to run , urinate and dig in a clearly marked "revegetation area".

I invite you, and anyone else eager to have the experience, to walk on the Rhubarb and Oakwood Valley trails. Although the bad behavior of pet owners is a huge distraction, the walk is still worth it.

Thank you again for a prompt response.

Sincerely,

(b) (6)

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)]

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 14, 2013 4:09 PM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Subject:** Re: From NPS.gov: Dog Feces Tam Valley GGNRA Trails

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: moss beach horse and dog issue**

1 message

**Christine B. Carey** <cbcarey@nps.gov>

Mon, May 6, 2013 at 2:23 PM

To: Shirwin Smith &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;, Howard Levitt &lt;howard\_levitt@nps.gov&gt;

Not sure if Hilary mentioned this to you, but figured it was also worth passing along...

(b) (6) emailed me indicating he heard about this incident and was inquiring whether we had any details to share.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Hobbs, Hilary** <hilary\_hobbs@nps.gov>

Date: Mon, May 6, 2013 at 12:35 PM

Subject: re: moss beach horse and dog issue

To: Christine Carey &lt;christine\_carey@partner.nps.gov&gt;

Hi Christine-

(b) (6) did mention to me a few weeks ago a recent horse and dog encounter (possibly a bite) with one of her borders, which was on the trail at Rancho. This came up in context of my conversation with her about (b) (6) stopping by the stables to discuss signs and dog issues.

I sent her the following response (pulled from a very similar incident in Marin that same week). Not sure if she ever contacted dispatch or filed a report.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hilary Hobbs  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
(415) 561-4943

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Hobbs, Hilary** <hilary\_hobbs@nps.gov>

Date: Tue, Apr 16, 2013 at 11:40 AM

Subject: dog follow-up

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6)

I wanted to follow up on the incident you mentioned in our phone conversation yesterday with a run-in between an off leash dog and one of your borders on the trail.

If any incidents like this take place with an off-lease dog going after a horse (or biker, or walker, for that matter), whether on the trail or within your leased area, we would like the person involved to file a report. This can both help either with an immediate response if necessary, or if not this will enable us to clearly track any ongoing issues so that they can be factored into long-term management decisions and know where there are repeat problems.

Reporting information below:

>>Smith, Shirwin <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

9:25 AM (2 hours ago)

to me, Jessica, Kevin, Randolph

Hi Hilary, please have the rider involved call park dispatch non-emergency number (415-561-5505) to have a report taken on the incident, and pls let the stables know we really need to have any incidents reported to alert us to problems. They can call for a ranger when the incident occurs (415-561-5656) or use the non-emergency number above to have a report taken even a day or more after. Sooner is better, of course.

---

---

Hilary Hobbs  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
(415) 561-4943



SEARCH | INTERNAL | HELP | CONTACT

## Re: Enforcement Of Leash Laws In GGNRA

Levitt, Howard <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:58 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>, Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Dear (b) (6)

Here's what we're doing -

1. Followed up with witness to insure that a formal report was filed on the gosling incident (formal report indicated one gosling killed, vs preliminary report of two killed - still completely unacceptable). Also received video of incident from Wild Equity.
2. Issued press release to media and stakeholder groups, including dog groups, about dog owner responsibility to maintain control of dogs. Text of the release is attached.
3. Note that the press release included a reminder for people to immediately report problems - our law enforcement staff cannot be everywhere at all times, so in-the-moment reporting to Park Dispatch at least gives us the chance to contact offenders.

May we add your name and email address to our list to receive the Supplemental EIS/Dog Mgt Plan for the park? We expect to release it later this spring or early summer. This plan describes our recommendations for dog mgt in 22 areas of the park. Want to receive a copy?

Howard Levitt

On Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:38 AM, Jeff Hoffman <jdh\_54@att.net> wrote:

Dear Mr. Levitt,

Dogs do not belong in parks that have wildlife, because they chase, harass and kill wildlife. Even if they are on leash, dogs cause unnatural and harmful stress to wildlife that makes it harder for that wildlife to survive.

Now I read that two goslings were killed by offleash dogs. It is not clear to me from the article which of the three dogs killed the goslings or if more than one did, but the problem is that those dogs were there at all. At the very least you must start vigorously enforcing the leash laws in the GGNRA. If you fail to do so, some of us intend to take legal action against you for violation of laws such as the Organic Act, the Migratory Bird Treaty Act and the Endangered Species Act. Enforcing the leash laws is not only the ethical and moral thing to do, it is legally required of you. You are legally required, first and foremost, to protect the "resources" (i.e., wildlife) in the GGNRA. Please do so by enforcing your leash laws.

Please let me know what you intend to do about this serious problem.

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Howard Levitt  
Director of Communications and Partnerships  
Golden Gate National Parks  
[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)  
415-561-4730

 **Dog Owner Responsibility Press ReleaseFINAL.doc**  
34K

(b) (6)

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:06 PM

To: "Levitt, Howard" <[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)>  
Cc: Brent Plater <[bplater@wildequity.org](mailto:bplater@wildequity.org)>, Shirwin Smith <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)>

Dear Mr. Levitt,

A press release? Seriously? Dog owners who allow their dogs in wildlife areas don't care about wildlife, so this press release has no chance of being effective. Moreover, dogs have been a major problem in the GGNRA even before it was under that jurisdiction, so this amounts to no response at all as far as I'm concerned. This problem should have been dealt with by the Park Service years ago, and it gets worse every year because you refuse to do so.

Instead of an ineffective reaction like a press release, you should be doing all you can to completely remove dogs from the parks. You could start by strongly enforcing the leash laws, making all areas of the GGNRA that support wildlife off limits to off leash dogs, and prioritizing this issue by having constant law enforcement in the problem areas (Crissy Park, Ocean Beach, and Fort Funston to name the three that come to mind immediately).

Dogs, especially off leash dogs, are the biggest problem in the GGNRA and have been for many years, yet you give this issue no priority. For example, you have lifeguards driving on Ocean Beach, but they told me that they have no authority or training to do anything about the off leash dogs that I pointed out. This is completely unacceptable! Dogs are an exponentially bigger problem at Ocean Beach than people drowning, because the dogs are there every minute of every day causing problems for wildlife and other people. Drownings at Ocean Beach are rare, and when they do happen your lifeguards would probably not be able to help. Your employees should, at the very least, be enforcing the leash law while acting as lifeguards, though I'd be happy to sacrifice the latter for better leash law enforcement.

Dogs are not compatible with wildlife, period. If you do not reign in these inconsiderate dog owners and their dogs, we intend to take legal action to force you to do so, as I stated in my previous email. Issuing a press release on this issue is beyond far too little and far too late, it's laughable.

(b) (6)

**From:** "Levitt, Howard" <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>; Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

**Sent:** Thu, May 2, 2013 10:58:28 AM

**Subject:** Re: Enforcement Of Leash Laws In GGNRA

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Howard Levitt** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 11:53 PM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>, Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Appreciate your viewpoint. Want to receive the Supplemental EIS/Dog Mgt Plan? HL

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Levitt, Howard** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Fri, May 3, 2013 at 10:30 AM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Will do. Make sure we hear your comments on the Supplemental Plan. HL

On Fri, May 3, 2013 at 10:00 AM, (b) (6) wrote:

Yes, please add me to your list. Thank you for your responses.

---

**From:** Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>; Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

**Sent:** Thu, May 2, 2013 11:53:43 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[View this message in your inbox](#)

## Re: Enforcement Of Leash Laws In GGNRA

Levitt, Howard <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:58 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>, Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Dear (b) (6):

Here's what we're doing -

1. Followed up with witness to insure that a formal report was filed on the gosling incident (formal report indicated one gosling killed, vs preliminary report of two killed - still completely unacceptable). Also received video of incident from Wild Equity.
2. Issued press release to media and stakeholder groups, including dog groups, about dog owner responsibility to maintain control of dogs. Text of the release is attached.
3. Note that the press release included a reminder for people to immediately report problems - our law enforcement staff cannot be everywhere at all times, so in-the-moment reporting to Park Dispatch at least gives us the chance to contact offenders.

May we add your name and email address to our list to receive the Supplemental EIS/Dog Mgt Plan for the park? We expect to release it later this spring or early summer. This plan describes our recommendations for dog mgt in 22 areas of the park. Want to receive a copy?

Howard Levitt

On Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:38 AM, (b) (6) wrote:

Dear Mr. Levitt,

Dogs do not belong in parks that have wildlife, because they chase, harass and kill wildlife. Even if they are on leash, dogs cause unnatural and harmful stress to wildlife that makes it harder for that wildlife to survive.

Now I read that two goslings were killed by offleash dogs. It is not clear to me from the article which of the three dogs killed the goslings or if more than one did, but the problem is that those dogs were there at all. At the very least you must start vigorously enforcing the leash laws in the GGNRA. If you fail to do so, some of us intend to take legal action against you for violation of laws such as the Organic Act, the Migratory Bird Treaty Act and the Endangered Species Act. Enforcing the leash laws is not only the ethical and moral thing to do, it is legally required of you. You are legally required, first and foremost, to protect the "resources" (i.e., wildlife) in the GGNRA. Please do so by enforcing your leash laws.

Please let me know what you intend to do about this serious problem.

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Howard Levitt  
Director of Communications and Partnerships  
Golden Gate National Parks  
[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)  
415-561-4730

 **Dog Owner Responsibility Press ReleaseFINAL.doc**  
34K

(b) (6)

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 10:06 PM

To: "Levitt, Howard" <[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)>  
Cc: Brent Plater <[bplater@wildequity.org](mailto:bplater@wildequity.org)>, Shirwin Smith <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)>

Dear Mr. Levitt,

A press release? Seriously? Dog owners who allow their dogs in wildlife areas don't care about wildlife, so this press release has no chance of being effective. Moreover, dogs have been a major problem in the GGNRA even before it was under that jurisdiction, so this amounts to no response at all as far as I'm concerned. This problem should have been dealt with by the Park Service years ago, and it gets worse every year because you refuse to do so.

Instead of an ineffective reaction like a press release, you should be doing all you can to completely remove dogs from the parks. You could start by strongly enforcing the leash laws, making all areas of the GGNRA that support wildlife off limits to off leash dogs, and prioritizing this issue by having constant law enforcement in the problem areas (Crissy Park, Ocean Beach, and Fort Funston to name the three that come to mind immediately).

Dogs, especially off leash dogs, are the biggest problem in the GGNRA and have been for many years, yet you give this issue no priority. For example, you have lifeguards driving on Ocean Beach, but they told me that they have no authority or training to do anything about the off leash dogs that I pointed out. This is completely unacceptable! Dogs are an exponentially bigger problem at Ocean Beach than people drowning, because the dogs are there every minute of every day causing problems for wildlife and other people. Drownings at Ocean Beach are rare, and when they do happen your lifeguards would probably not be able to help. Your employees should, at the very least, be enforcing the leash law while acting as lifeguards, though I'd be happy to sacrifice the latter for better leash law enforcement.

Dogs are not compatible with wildlife, period. If you do not reign in these inconsiderate dog owners and their dogs, we intend to take legal action to force you to do so, as I stated in my previous email. Issuing a press release on this issue is beyond far too little and far too late, it's laughable.

(b) (6)

**From:** "Levitt, Howard" <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>; Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

**Sent:** Thu, May 2, 2013 10:58:28 AM

**Subject:** Re: Enforcement Of Leash Laws In GGNRA

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Howard Levitt** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Thu, May 2, 2013 at 11:53 PM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>, Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Appreciate your viewpoint. Want to receive the Supplemental EIS/Dog Mgt Plan? HL

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Levitt, Howard** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Fri, May 3, 2013 at 10:30 AM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Will do. Make sure we hear your comments on the Supplemental Plan. HL

On Fri, May 3, 2013 at 10:00 AM, (b) (6) wrote:

Yes, please add me to your list. Thank you for your responses.

---

**From:** Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Brent Plater <bplater@wildequity.org>; Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

**Sent:** Thu, May 2, 2013 11:53:43 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Calif. State Ranger responding to 4/17 dog bite on Ranch Coral. de Tierra**

1 message

---

**Marks, James** <james\_marks@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 3:46 PM

Shirwin,

California State Park ranger, Brandon Wainright out of Halfmoon Bay State Park office at (650) 726-8804 worked on a dog bite incident at Rancho Corral de Tierra. Ranger Wainright called asking for help putting the correct codes on his report. I referred him to dispatch at 415-561-5505 and Karen Zavenelli at (415) 289-3130.

James

--

James Marks  
Pacific West Information Center (PWIC)  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Office of Public Affairs and Special Park Uses  
Building 201 Fort Mason  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4700 PWIC information office  
415-561-4374 permit request office  
415-740-8062 Cell  
415-921-1781 FAX

Permit applications, insurance requirements and other information:

<http://www.nps.gov/goga/planyourvisit/permits.htm>



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fw: GGAS blog post on unleashed dog attack on goslings at Crissy Field**

10 messages

---

**Francis Dean** <frank\_dean@nps.gov>  
To: Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov, shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

Fri, Apr 19, 2013 at 11:28 AM

Shirwin,

Can you reach out to Michael for more info? Howard and I are out.

Thanks,

Frank Dean  
General Superintendent  
Golden Gate  
National Recreation Area  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
(415) 561-4720

---

**From:** Michael Lynes [mailto:mlynes@goldengateaudubon.org]**Sent:** Friday, April 19, 2013 11:06 AM**To:** frank\_dean@nps.gov <frank\_dean@nps.gov>; howard\_levitt <Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov>;  
Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>; Daphne Hatch <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>**Cc:** Ilana DeBare <idebare@goldengateaudubon.org>; Noreen Weeden <nweeden@goldengateaudubon.org>**Subject:** GGAS blog post on unleashed dog attack on goslings at Crissy Field

Superintendent Dean and GGNRA Staff:

On Wednesday, one of our members reported to us that three unleashed dogs attacked goslings at Crissy Field, killing two. I have called Howard about this, but not yet heard back.

We've decided to post a blog piece about it at <http://www.goldengateaudubon.org/blog-posts/two-goslings-gone-in-the-jaws-of-unleashed-dogs/>. We are also reaching out to local press, though given the Chronicle's biased reporting in favor of off-leash dogs in the past, we don't expect much follow-up.

As you well know, this is just an example of what goes on every day in the GGNRA without sensible regulation of off-leash dogs or enforcement. This time, it just happened to be one of our members (herself, a dog walker) who witnessed it. NPS' own incident reports—which are only a fraction of events occurring in the park—indicate that these sorts of events are common.

As is common in events such as these, the owners fled the scene before they could be held responsible for their actions—a further demonstration that the dog-owning community in San Francisco does not take responsibility for the environmental impacts of their actions.

Some may dismiss this because these are Canada Geese, which many perceive as a pest. But we know that other, less "pesky" wildlife are constantly harassed by wildlife in your park—to say nothing of other park visitors. Our member was very traumatized by seeing this occur—as were other onlookers—and their experience of the park has been severely degraded.

This is also inhumane. Goslings--or adult birds--should be torn to shreds on NPS land. If the predation were natural (say, coyotes or bobcats), then we understand the natural cycle. But here, out-of-control dogs attacked and killed the goslings for fun. With all the talk about needing off-leash recreation for "humane" reasons for dogs, there seems to be very little consideration of the inhumane treatment of birds and other wildlife that are their playthings.

You'll also note that the event occurred with multiple off-leash dogs forming a little pack to attack the wildlife. As you consider rules for the number of off-leash dogs to be allowed and commercial dog-walking in the park, please remember this event. Even three dogs "packing" together can wreak havoc.

Finally, please also note that this once again shows that "voice control" is nothing more than a myth. At a minimum, NPS should acknowledge that fact in the dog management plan. These owners--like most--had no voice control over their animals, and once the dogs had the scent, there was no calling them back until the goslings were killed.

While we can blame the dogs, or dog owners, ultimately the responsibility for maintaining order falls on the NPS. We know you are working on a revised plan, but by all accounts it appears it will be even weaker than the prior version. What will it take before the values of other park visitors and the resources NPS is tasked with stewarding will take precedence over dog owners? Off-leash dogs have already attacked wildlife and people--even NPS staff. Will it take a human fatality to bring some perspective to this issue?

Until GGNRA steps up and imposed a sensible rule with enforcement, off-leash dogs will continue attacking wildlife, horses, each other and people, continually degrading the park's resources and its value to other park users.

Thank you,  
Mike Lynes

--

Executive Director  
Golden Gate Audubon Society  
2530 San Pablo Ave, Suite G  
Berkeley, CA 94702  
Office: (510) 843-9912  
Cell: (510) 847-9393  
Fax: (510) 843-5351  
[mlynes@goldengateaudubon.org](mailto:mlynes@goldengateaudubon.org)  
[www.goldengateaudubon.org](http://www.goldengateaudubon.org)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>  
To: Francis Dean <[frank\\_dean@nps.gov](mailto:frank_dean@nps.gov)>  
Cc: Howard Levitt <[Howard\\_Levitt@nps.gov](mailto:Howard_Levitt@nps.gov)>

Fri, Apr 19, 2013 at 11:30 AM

Already checking to see if report was taken on this.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Levitt, Howard** <[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>  
Cc: Frank Dean <[frank\\_dean@nps.gov](mailto:frank_dean@nps.gov)>, Alexandra Picavet <[alexandra\\_picavet@nps.gov](mailto:alexandra_picavet@nps.gov)>, Kevin Cochary

Fri, Apr 19, 2013 at 11:41 AM

<Kevin\_Cochary@nps.gov>

Also got a call from (b) (6) asking if we planned to do any media release about this. He says he has video of the attack. I think if we can confirm the attack, we should get the news out there. Shirwin, let me know what you find out. HL

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Howard Levitt  
Director of Communications and Partnerships  
Golden Gate National Parks  
[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)  
415-561-4730

---

**Francis Dean** <frank\_dean@nps.gov>

Fri, Apr 19, 2013 at 12:00 PM

To: Howard\_Levitt@nps.gov, shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

Cc: Alexandra\_Picavet@nps.gov, kevin\_cochary@nps.gov

We should get more of this out there including Mike Coffey's situation and other recent outcomes and reactions with the police horse. Not sure how to communicate it however, as it could lead to counter efforts as we roll out our dog plan, which is more important in the long run.

Frank Dean  
General Superintendent  
Golden Gate  
National Recreation Area  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
(415) 561-4720

---

**From:** Levitt, Howard [mailto:[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)]

**Sent:** Friday, April 19, 2013 11:41 AM

**To:** Smith, Shirwin <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>

**Cc:** Frank Dean <[frank\\_dean@nps.gov](mailto:frank_dean@nps.gov)>; Alexandra Picavet <[alexandra\\_picavet@nps.gov](mailto:alexandra_picavet@nps.gov)>; Kevin Cochary <[Kevin\\_Cochary@nps.gov](mailto:Kevin_Cochary@nps.gov)>

**Subject:** Re: Fw: GGAS blog post on unleashed dog attack on goslings at Crissy Field

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Cochary, Kevin** <[kevin\\_cochary@nps.gov](mailto:kevin_cochary@nps.gov)>

Sat, Apr 20, 2013 at 9:41 PM

To: "Levitt, Howard" <[howard\\_levitt@nps.gov](mailto:howard_levitt@nps.gov)>

Cc: Frank Dean <[frank\\_dean@nps.gov](mailto:frank_dean@nps.gov)>, Kevin Cochary <[kevin\\_cochary@nps.gov](mailto:kevin_cochary@nps.gov)>, Alexandra Picavet <[alexandra\\_picavet@nps.gov](mailto:alexandra_picavet@nps.gov)>, "Smith, Shirwin" <[shirwin\\_smith@nps.gov](mailto:shirwin_smith@nps.gov)>, Randy Lavoisier <[Randy\\_Lavoisier@nps.gov](mailto:Randy_Lavoisier@nps.gov)>

Xave,

Would you follow-up and determine if a report was taken? If not please initiate an investigation. This really unfortunate to lose wildlife to a dog attack. We need to get a copy of the video. I would like to see this case prosecuted.

Thanks

sent from my cell  
Kevin Cochary  
Chief Ranger

Golden Gate NRA  
415-289-3131  
415-813-9700 cell

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 1:37 PM  
To: "Cochary, Kevin" <kevin\_cochary@nps.gov>  
Cc: "Levitt, Howard" <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>, Frank Dean <frank\_dean@nps.gov>, Alexandra Picavet <alexandra\_picavet@nps.gov>, Randy Lavoisier <Randy\_Lavoisier@nps.gov>, Xave Agnew <xave\_agnew@nps.gov>

Not sure if I passed the word to all that I spoke to the witness on Friday; she agreed to call Dispatch to ask that a report be taken. She told me that Dispatch said an officer would contact her to do so. Witness name: (b) (6) (b) (6) (info from Dispatch service call record).

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Howard Levitt** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov> Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 2:48 PM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Is the report filed?

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 2:59 PM  
To: Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Left message with witness just now to see if she got a call.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Howard Levitt** <howard\_levitt@nps.gov> Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 3:10 PM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thanks- when we hear a report has been filed, we'll pull the trigger on the press release.

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: Howard Levitt <howard\_levitt@nps.gov>

Mon, Apr 22, 2013 at 3:27 PM

Left mess. with Jennifer Scarlett/SFSPCA just now to let her know about issue and how we'd mention the open space training. Just so she knows, and in case she wants to add any language...

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: Dog issues at stables**

1 message

---

**Hobbs, Hilary** <hilary\_hobbs@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
Cc: Jessica Carter <Jessica\_Carter@nps.gov>

Mon, Apr 15, 2013 at 5:01 PM

Hello Shirwin-

I wanted to pass along the below report from Miwok Stables involving the most recent dog encounter. They continue to be frustrated with off-lease dogs in the area, in this case not just on the trails, but running into Miwok's assigned area and causing injuries in the riding ring.

In a similar incident, Ember Ridge at Rancho reported to me this morning that an off-leash dog on the trails by the stables bit one of their border's horses this weekend.

Should I request that either party file some sort of official report, or follow up with NPS in some way? Do you have any other information or update I can send to Linda from Miwok, who is complaining about lack of NPS leash enforcement in this area? Or, would you like to contact her directly?

Thanks,  
Hilary

---

Hilary Hobbs  
Business Management Division  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
(415) 561-4943

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Livery Office** <liveryoffice@miwokstables.com>  
Date: Mon, Apr 15, 2013 at 3:47 PM  
Subject: DOGS  
To: Hilary Hobbs <hilary\_Hobbs@nps.gov>

Hi Hilary

I just wanted you to be aware of this  
On Sunday a dog was loose in the parking lot/trail? and it ran into the arena while we were having a class, chased the horses and a lady fell off, she has a black eye and a bruised tailbone and is pretty sore.  
I was not here, but the dog thing is getting out of control, because there is never anyone here to enforce the rules.  
Any suggestions  
Linda

Miwok Livery, Inc.  
701 Tennessee Valley Road  
Mill Valley, CA 94941  
415.389.9414 or 415/383-8048  
[liveryoffice@miwokstables.com](mailto:liveryoffice@miwokstables.com)  
[www.miwokstables.com](http://www.miwokstables.com)

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Fwd: Dog issues at stables

[www.facebook.com/miwokstables](http://www.facebook.com/miwokstables) - like us!



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

---

## Fwd: NPS Volunteers at Crissy Field Today - afraid of dogs and not aware that they would be around them

5 messages

---

**Me** (b) (6)  
To: Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov

Sat, Mar 16, 2013 at 12:52 PM

Hi Shirwin

Thought you might be interested in this

I think that (b) (6) makes some excellent suggestions

Let's talk on Monday about this

Thanks (b) (6)

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** (b) (6)  
**Date:** March 16, 2013, 11:55:34 AM PDT  
**To:** walters martha (b) (6)  
**Subject: NPS Volunteers at Crissy Field Today - afraid of dogs and not aware that they would be around them**

Hi (b) (6)

I hope that you are well.

I just wanted to pass on an observation and thoughts about volunteers who were on the east beach of Crissy Field this morning (mostly near the outlet for the lagoon,) for what it is worth:

There was a group of young volunteers (wearing orange vests labeled "NPS" on the back) who were doing beach cleaning - they had long "tongs" and buckets. I was walking in a southwest direction from the edge of the water up toward the pedestrian bridge with (b) (6) about 10 feet in front of me and, as (b) (6) got within about 5 feet of one of the volunteers (passing by to the side, not walking toward her), that volunteer screamed and ran, causing another volunteer who was close by to scream. They both then hung onto each other and giggled.

I stopped and asked if they were afraid of the dog and they said yes and that they didn't know what it would do. I told them that she wouldn't do anything to them (and in fact, (b) (6) seemed somewhat oblivious to the whole situation and certainly ignored the girls) and advised them that screaming and running away from a dog is not a good reaction when they are afraid - that generally they should just be quiet and still if they don't want to provoke an animal. I then asked them where they were from and they said that they were volunteering with "the Golden Gate National Parks" as students from Lowell High School. At least one of two volunteers who had screamed - both girls - was a freshman at Lowell.

As I continued my walk, I began to wonder if anyone had mentioned to the volunteers that they

would be working in an area where they might encounter dogs, including off-leash dogs. On my way back, heading east, I asked another two young female volunteers (after thanking them for the work they were doing), whether they knew there might be dogs around them, and they said "no", that no one had mentioned it. (Those two girls were not afraid of (b) (6) )

It seems to me an obvious courtesy on the part of the volunteer organizers to inform their volunteers of the conditions in which they will be working, and hopefully it is just an oversight on the GGNPC/NPS' part. I just took a look on the GGNPC's site and found what I believe to be the volunteer event that the girls were participating in today - there is nothing about dogs although other "conditions" are mentioned. <http://www.parksconservancy.org/events/volunteer-events/landscape-maintenance/goga-maintenance/presidio/goga-maintenance-presidio-15.html>

It makes me wonder if they GGNPC/NPS conducts any exit interview/survey with their volunteers and if they ask them about encounters with dogs (or bicycles, etc.)...

That's it. I thought it might be a good idea to share this.

best -

(b) (6)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Mar 18, 2013 at 9:26 AM

To: Jeffrey Obirek <jeffrey\_obirek@nps.gov>, DShea@parksconservancy.org

Hi guys, see message from dog walker below. I agree with Martha that there are some good ideas there, but it's also a reminder to us that some people are indeed fearful of dogs...

Would like your thoughts about this - best way to address with our vol groups.

Thanks!

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Obirek, Jeffrey** <jeffrey\_obirek@nps.gov>

Mon, Mar 18, 2013 at 10:12 AM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Cc: DShea@parksconservancy.org, Laura Elze <laura\_elze@nps.gov>, Danny Collman <dan\_collman@nps.gov>

I cc'd Laura Elze on this, not sure if it was our program or Natural Resources.

My initial feeling is that it is perfectly ok for someone to be afraid of dogs, visitor or volunteer - could she have not just seen that a high school aged student was nervous, and as the guardian of the dog, called her away? That seems to me to be where this could have ended.

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Jeff Obirek  
Maintenance Mechanic Supervisor  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area - Presidio  
415-561-2868 (office)  
415-705-9619 (cell)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> Mon, Mar 18, 2013 at 10:35 AM  
To: "Obirek, Jeffrey" <jeffrey\_obirek@nps.gov>  
Cc: DShea@parksconservancy.org, Laura Elze <laura\_elze@nps.gov>, Danny Collman <dan\_collman@nps.gov>

Totally agree, but thought there is some value to letting people know before they volunteer that they'll be working in an area where dogs are allowed off leash, altho the dogs must be under voice control.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Denise Shea** <DShea@parksconservancy.org> Mon, Mar 18, 2013 at 10:39 AM  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>, "Obirek, Jeffrey" <jeffrey\_obirek@nps.gov>  
Cc: Laura Elze <laura\_elze@nps.gov>, Danny Collman <dan\_collman@nps.gov>

Agreed on both comments. It's easy enough for us to add something to the website and our group confirmations for popular dog destinations, i.e. Crissy and Fort Funston. And we can certainly mention it to folks when we are coordinating programs.

FYI – this first time I've heard of this being an issue, but it's worth being proactive.

Thanks! - Denise

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:shirwin\_smith@nps.gov]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 18, 2013 10:36 AM  
**To:** Obirek, Jeffrey  
**Cc:** Denise Shea; Laura Elze; Danny Collman  
**Subject:** Re: NPS Volunteers at Crissy Field Today - afraid of dogs and not aware that they would be around them

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: owner of "Stella"**

2 messages

---

**Coffey, Mike** <michael\_coffey@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Thu, Feb 28, 2013 at 6:01 PM

Hey Shirwin:

Here's the owner information of the dog bite guy from Robert Lewis. See below.  
?Maybe hook him up with Linda and the FOFU dog people?

We're all about the emotional healing here in Maintenance. ?Can't we all just get along?  
Thanks,  
Mike C.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Lewis, Robert** <robert\_h\_lewis@nps.gov>  
Date: Thu, Feb 28, 2013 at 1:19 AM  
Subject: owner of "Stella"  
To: Mike Coffey <michael\_coffey@nps.gov>

Mike,

I spoke with the owner of the dog that bit you, (b) (6). His name was (b) (6). He lives in (b) (6). He was very apologetic. He wanted me to convey to you how sorry he was. He also wanted to "make it right". If there is anything you want him to do, he is open to hearing it. You can reach him at (b) (6).  
-r.

--

-r.  
Robert Lewis  
Park Ranger  
Sun, Mon, Tue are my days off

--

Michael Coffey  
NPS/GOGA/Maintenance/Ocean District  
Cell- 510.205.5568

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Coffey, Mike" <michael\_coffey@nps.gov>

Fri, Mar 1, 2013 at 9:03 AM

Excellent. I'm asking SFSPCA folks about best next step for the dog (training..) and I will mention this to Linda when I speak to her today.

Shirwin

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Fwd: owner of "Stella"

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: Aggressive off leash dog at fort funston**

1 message

---

**David Shaw** <DShaw@parksconservancy.org>  
To: "Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov" <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Feb 18, 2013 at 12:07 PM

Here's another one.  
David

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: (b) (6)  
Date: February 15, 2013, 4:31:21 PM PST  
To: <tellmemore@parksconservancy.org<mailto:tellmemore@parksconservancy.org>>  
Subject: Aggressive off leash dog at fort funston

Hello

I called the office at 415 561 4700 and spoke with a gentleman about being attacked by an aggressive off leash pit bull today at Fort Funston. Although he was very helpful I would like to get the number of his supervisor so I can discuss appropriate methods to use to protect my safety in the event of future attacks. In the five 2 hour walks I have taken on this beach I have been confronted by 3 aggressive off leash dogs that did not respond to the persons voice commands after they began harassing me.

Thank you for your time and consideration

(b) (6)

A large black rectangular redaction box covers the signature and contact information of the sender.



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## GGNRA Dog management project contact list

2 messages

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Feb 19, 2013 at 4:52 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello Mark, this confirms that you've been added to the email contact list for the dog management project here at Golden Gate National Recreation Area (GGNRA). As I mentioned, a Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement on our draft dog management plan will be released for public comment in the near future - we anticipate March - and all on our contact list will be notified of the document's release and how to review/submit comments.

Meanwhile, for background information about the dog management plan, you can go to <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm> At that site you'll also see a link to current dog walking regulations in the park.

Thank you again for checking in with us about dog management issues - hope that future long walks will be less eventful.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

---

(b) (6)

Tue, Feb 19, 2013 at 7:35 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Thanks for talking with me about this and I will be happy to contribute

Sincerely

(b) (6)

[Quoted text hidden]

--  
(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## Fwd: Ocean Beach dog leash

1 message

---

**David Shaw** <DShaw@parksconservancy.org>  
To: "Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov" <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Feb 18, 2013 at 12:07 PM

Hi Shirwin:  
This came in via our website over the weekend.  
David

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Hiromi <sup>(b) (6)</sup>  
Date: February 17, 2013, 10:38:14 AM PST  
To: "tellmemore@parksconservancy.org" <mailto:tellmemore@parksconservancy.org>"  
<tellmemore@parksconservancy.org" <mailto:tellmemore@parksconservancy.org>>  
Subject: Ocean Beach dog leash

Hi I'm live in near ocean beach, I walked on the beach this morning, the dog chasing to snowy prober, I saw so many times dog no leash. Chasing little bird, harassment. Please protect them and patrol more at ocean beach.

Thank you

<sup>(b) (6)</sup>

---

### 2 attachments

 **IMG\_4972.MOV**  
260K

 **ATT00001.htm**  
1K



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## GGNRA Dog Management mailing list

6 messages

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 12:43 PM

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) this confirms that you've been added to the email contact list for the dog management project here at Golden Gate National Recreation Area. You may know that a Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement on our draft dog management plan will be released for public comment in the near future - we anticipate late February at this point - and all on our contact list will be notified of the document's release and how to review/submit comments.

Meanwhile, for background information about the dog management plan, you can go to <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm> At that site you'll also see a link to current dog walking regulations in the park.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

---

(b) (6)

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 1:26 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Thanks  
here is my issue

every day the area between mountain lake park and Presidio golf course is literally mobbed with dogs. It is a little scary so many dog off leash, tend to get a little aggressive. You are stopped by dogs, dogs jump on you, i have even witnesses dog walkers screaming and shouting at each other. On more than one occasion i have had to ask them to clean up the dog poo they pretended not to see.

i took a short video, then stopped because the walkers get aggressive and don't want you to take pictures. They say the owners don't want their dog photographed or filmed. This might be a good option, put in a camera and notified people that you will be constantly filmed on this pathway

I walked literally 30 second to the dog park, mountain lake and as you can see from the picture there is not one person there

Cheers

(b) (6)

**From:** "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Sent:** Tue, January 29, 2013 12:44:21 PM

**Subject:** GGNRA Dog Management mailing list

[Quoted text hidden]

**3 attachments**



**dog3.jpg**  
872K



**DOGS2.jpg**  
1483K

 **DOGS.3gp**  
184K

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 1:52 PM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Bcc:** TLombardi@presidiotrust.gov

Hello again, the area you've provided information about is managed by the Presidio Trust, not the National Park Service (Golden Gate National Recreation Area).

I'll forward your message to the Presidio Trust (Tia Lombardi), for follow up.

Thanks for taking the time to contact us.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Lombardi, Tia** <TLombardi@presidiotrust.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 1:54 PM

Thank you, Shirwin...I'll follow up (as best I can).

T

[Quoted text hidden]

---

(b) (6)

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 1:56 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

thank you, its been VERY difficult trying to find the right contact person  
thank you for passing on  
The Presidio Trust passed me to you

Cheers

(b) (6)

---

**From:** "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

**To:** (b) (6)

**Sent:** Tue, January 29, 2013 1:52:43 PM

**Subject:** Re: GGNRA Dog Management mailing list

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: TLombardi@presidiotrust.gov

Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 2:16 PM

and round we go...

Thx Tia

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)

Date: Tue, Jan 29, 2013 at 1:56 PM

Subject: Re: GGNRA Dog Management mailing list

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - GGNRA Dog Management mailing list

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

**Fwd: From NPS.gov: Offleash dogs and dog poo in the Presidio**

5 messages

---

**Hatch, Daphne** <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin\_Smith <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 8:14 AM

Do you know who I should refer this email to with the Trust and Park Police?

Daphne

Chief of Natural Resource Management & Science  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Fort Mason, Bldg 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
(415) 289-1840 office  
(415) 331-0851 fax  
[daphne\\_hatch@nps.gov](mailto:daphne_hatch@nps.gov)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Sun, Jan 27, 2013 at 10:25 PM  
Subject: From NPS.gov. Offleash dogs and dog poo in the Presidio  
To: [daphne\\_hatch@nps.gov](mailto:daphne_hatch@nps.gov)

Email submitted from: (b) (6) at /goga/parkmgmt/staffandoffices.htm

Mailing Address:

(b) (6)

Today I had the pleasure of doing a bit of walking in the Presidio. I love the Presidio so much (major reason of why I live in the Richmond District) but I was so sad to see so much trash in the bushes by the trails, which included bagged dog poo. There was also quite a bit of dog poo on the trails, both bagged and not. This is both disgusting and a health hazard. I also noted one off-leash dog after another at the native-planted El Polín Springs area, where there is even signage (that hasn't yet been removed or vandalized). I asked one dog owner (with two large dogs trampling a freshly native-planted area) if he knew the area required leashing and he replied "yes, technically". So he knows that there is little (if any) enforcement regarding dog management in the Presidio and dog owners can basically do what they please. Recalcitrant dog owners continue to bring down the enjoyment level of the Golden Gate National Recreation Area when they treat the place as a dog latrine/exercise area. Also, there was a sign indicating that dogs must be leashed in the area behind the restored Merchant Marine Hospital that has somehow disappeared. Is that area now officially an off-leash ok area or not? Thanks for listening!

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:05 AM

To: "Hatch, Daphne" <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>

Tia Lombardi.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Hatch, Daphne" <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:29 AM

and Connie for the PP.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

On Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 8:14 AM, Hatch, Daphne <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov> wrote:  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Hatch, Daphne** <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:46 AM

Do you have Tia and Connie's emails? I'm assuming [tlombardi@presidiotrust.gov](mailto:tlombardi@presidiotrust.gov), but Connie doesn't pop up in gmail so not sure of hers.

Thanks.  
Daphne

Chief of Natural Resource Management & Science  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Fort Mason, Bldg 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
(415) 289-1840 office  
(415) 331-0851 fax  
[daphne\\_hatch@nps.gov](mailto:daphne_hatch@nps.gov)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Hatch, Daphne" <daphne\_hatch@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:52 AM

Right for Tia. Connie is [Constance\\_Leonard@nps.gov](mailto:Constance_Leonard@nps.gov)

Shirwin Smith

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Fwd: From NPS.gov: Offleash dogs and dog poo in the Presidio

Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

## Signage on SCA Trail

3 messages

Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Sat, Jan 26, 2013 at 3:50 PM

To: Keith Stegall &lt;Keith\_Stegall@nps.gov&gt;, Julie English &lt;julie\_english@nps.gov&gt;

Keith/Julie - do you have any info on the status of regulatory signage on the SCA Trail? See message below.

Thx -

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
 Management Assistant  
 Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
 Ft. Mason, Building 201  
 San Francisco, CA 94123  
 415-561-4947 (o)  
 415-716-9999 (c)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
 Date: Sat, Jan 26, 2013 at 3:47 PM  
 Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease  
 To: [Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)

Dear Shirwin,

I just wanted to follow-up on my original email from last September. This morning I saw a dead coyote on the SCA which looked as if it may have been shot which further prompted me to write. I did report the coyote to the Headlands Visitors' Center today. Since I commented about dogs off lease on the SCA trail I've noticed that there is currently no signage ("No Pets" or "SCA") at the SCA trailhead where it junctions w/ Alta and Rodeo. I recall one in the past but there in none now as there is at the SCA junction w/ Costal. As a result I've continued to witness dogs on the SCA and they are almost always off-lease. Given the dead coyote on the trail I'm concerned about how much dog presence on this trail is disrupting local wildlife - especially since the dogs are usually on & off trail. The HVC said the dead coyote would be investigated and I'm hoping that adequate "no pet" signage can be added as well.

Thanks,

(b) (6)

--- On Thu, 9/27/12, [Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov) <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)> wrote:

From: [Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov) <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)>  
 Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease  
 To: (b) (6)  
 Date: Thursday, September 27, 2012, 3:03 PM

Hi (b) (6) - this confirms that you've been added to the dog management project email list. We appreciate your interest in this project.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

(b) (6)

To

[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)

09/27/2012 10:15

cc

AM

Subject

Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

Dear Shirwin,

Thanks for the reply. Yes please add me to the Dog Management Project mailing list. I firmly believe that all trail users can share the trails including dogs & dog owners. Unfortunately there are exceptions out there who challenge our co-use of the trails.

Thanks,  
Ron

-- On Tue, 9/25/12, [Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov) <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)> wrote:

From: [Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov) <[Shirwin\\_Smith@nps.gov](mailto:Shirwin_Smith@nps.gov)>

Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

To: (b) (6)

Date: Tuesday, September 25, 2012, 10:01 AM

Hello (b) (6) your message (attached below) to the Superintendent was reviewed and then forwarded to me as the park lead on the dog management project. First, we regret that you had such an unpleasant

experience during your run in the Headlands two weekends ago. The dog walker's conduct was certainly unacceptable, especially since they were on a trail which is signed as closed to dog walking.

You may be aware that GGNRA is currently involved in a dog management project with the goal of establishing a new dog walking regulation for this park, with the intent of providing a variety of quality, safe visitor experiences - including dog walking - while protecting park resources. A Draft Plan/Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) was released in 2011 for public comment; as a result of the substantive comments received, and additional information available to us, we will be releasing a Supplemental EIS early next year for further public comment.

With your concerns, I would like to add you to the project email list so that you will be notified when the document is available for review and comment. Please let me know if you would like to be added, and for additional information about the project, please see:  
<http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

Finally, in case you are ever in any GGNRA site and want to either report an incident or need assistance from our law enforcement staff, here are numbers for the park's 24/7 dispatch center: for non-emergency calls (reporting an incident), 415-561-5505; for law enforcement assistance/emergencies, call 911 or 415-561-5656.

Thank you for taking the time to let us know about this incident; the information you provided has also been forwarded to our law enforcement division for their information and awareness.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

Dear Superintendent Dean, I'm writing to bring to your attention regarding a dog encounter that occurred today (9/16/12 around noon). I was running on the SCA trail returning to the GG Bridge. On the SCA I passed a couple (male - white 30s 6', female - white, 30s, 5'6") after passing them about 20 yards later a chocolate full grown labrador came running at me full-speed. I stopped and braced myself to be pounced on and perhaps bitten but the dog ran around me at the last second. I turned around as the couple called to the dog and it stopped next to them. As I ran back I yelled to the couple to put their dog on a leash. They yelled back that they didn't have to and basically told me to mind my own business. Then the dog comes running after me - I'm not sure if they commanded it to chase me but they

never leashed it or grabbed onto it's collar. The dog was a few feet from me growling and barking. Having been bit before on trail by a "friendly" dog I was very upset and feared getting bitten again. The couple made no attempt to come after their dog and after about 30 seconds it returned to them and I ran back to the GGB. I have noticed a number of unleashed dogs on the SCA and given it's narrow single track it's not ideal but this situation scared me and I really felt I was gonna get bit. I know resources

are tight but enforcement and/or better signage might help deter these situations in the future. I greatly enjoy the peace and tranquility the Headlands provides but these situations rob me of those pleasures. Thanks for reading. Respectfully, <sup>(b) (6)</sup> [REDACTED]

---

**English, Julie** <julie\_english@nps.gov>  
To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
Cc: Keith Stegall <keith\_stegall@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 7:07 AM

Shirwin - We will check it out and if the sign is missing we will replace it. Julie  
[Quoted text hidden]

--

Julie English  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Sign shop  
1227 Ruckman Ave  
San Francisco, CA 94129  
415-561-2828

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: Bill Merkle <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:28 AM

FYI  
[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

# Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

4 messages

(b) (6)

Sat, Jan 26, 2013 at 3:47 PM

To: Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov

Dear Shirwin,

I just wanted to follow-up on my original email from last September. This morning I saw a dead coyote on the SCA which looked as if it may have been shot which further prompted me to write. I did report the coyote to the Headlands Visitors' Center today. Since I commented about dogs off lease on the SCA trail I've noticed that there is currently no signage ("No Pets" or "SCA") at the SCA trailhead where it junctions w/ Alta and Rodeo. I recall one in the past but there in none now as there is at the SCA junction w/ Costal. As a result I've continued to witness dogs on the SCA and they are almost always off-lease. Given the dead coyote on the trail I'm concerned about how much dog presence on this trail is disrupting local wildlife - especially since the dogs are usually on & off trail. The HVC said the dead coyote would be investigated and I'm hoping that adequate "no pet" signage can be added as well.

Thanks,

(b) (6)

--- On Thu, 9/27/12, Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov> wrote:

From: Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

To: (b) (6)

Date: Thursday, September 27, 2012, 3:03 PM

Hi (b) (6) - this confirms that you've been added to the dog management project email list. We appreciate your interest in this project.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

(b) (6)

To

Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov

09/27/2012 10:15

cc

AM

Subject  
Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

Dear Shirwin,

Thanks for the reply. Yes please add me to the Dog Management Project mailing list. I firmly believe that all trail users can share the trails including dogs & dog owners. Unfortunately there are exceptions out there who challenge our co-use of the trails.

Thanks,

(b) (6)

-- On Tue, 9/25/12, Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov> wrote:

From: Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov <Shirwin\_Smith@nps.gov>

Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

To: (b) (6)

Date: Tuesday, September 25, 2012, 10:01 AM

Hello (b) (6) your message (attached below) to the Superintendent was reviewed and then forwarded to me as the park lead on the dog management project. First, we regret that you had such an unpleasant experience during your run in the Headlands two weekends ago. The dog walker's conduct was certainly unacceptable, especially since they were on a trail which is signed as closed to dog walking.

You may be aware that GGNRA is currently involved in a dog management project with the goal of establishing a new dog walking regulation for this park, with the intent of providing a variety of quality, safe visitor experiences - including dog walking - while protecting park resources. A Draft Plan/Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) was released in 2011 for public comment; as a result of the substantive comments received, and additional information available to us, we will be releasing a Supplemental EIS early next year for further public comment.

With your concerns, I would like to add you to the project email list so that you will be notified when the document is available for review and comment. Please let me know if you would like to be added, and for additional information about the project, please see:  
<http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/dog-management.htm>

Finally, in case you are ever in any GGNRA site and want to either report an incident or need assistance from our law enforcement staff, here are numbers for the park's 24/7 dispatch center: for non-emergency calls (reporting an incident), 415-561-5505; for law enforcement assistance/emergencies, call 911 or 415-561-5656.

Thank you for taking the time to let us know about this incident; the information you provided has also been forwarded to our law enforcement division for their information and awareness.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

Dear Superintendent Dean, I'm writing to bring to your attention regarding a dog encounter that occurred today (9/16/12 around noon). I was running on the SCA trail returning to the GG Bridge. On the SCA I passed a couple (male - white 30s 6', female - white, 30s, 5'6") after passing them about 20 yards later a chocolate full grown labrador came running at me full-speed. I stopped and braced myself to be pounced on and perhaps bitten but the dog ran around me at the last second. I turned around as the couple called to the dog and it stopped next to them. As I ran back I yelled to the couple to put their dog on a leash. They yelled back that they didn't have to and basically told me to mind my own business. Then the dog comes running after me - I'm not sure if they commanded it to chase me but they never leashed it or grabbed onto it's collar. The dog was a few feet from me growling and barking. Having been bit before on trail by a "friendly" dog I was very upset and feared getting bitten again. The couple made no attempt to come after their dog and after about 30 seconds it returned to them and I ran back to the GGB. I have noticed a number of unleashed dogs on the SCA and given it's narrow single track it's not ideal but this situation scared me and I really felt I was gonna get bit. I know resources are tight but enforcement and/or better signage might help deter these situations in the future. I greatly enjoy the peace and tranquility the Headlands provides but these situations rob me of those pleasures. Thanks for reading. Respectfully, <sup>(b) (6)</sup> [REDACTED]

To: (b) (6)

Hello (b) (6) - thank you for the report of the dead coyote; have passed your info on to our Wildlife Ecologist and to our Trails/Sign folks asking for status of regulatory signs up there.

Thank you for reporting what you saw to the Headlands Visitor Center; did they have you fill out any kind of statement?

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]

(b) (6)

Sat, Jan 26, 2013 at 8:50 PM

To: ShirwinSmith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Your welcome. I didn't fill out a written report - they told me it had already been reported and was being worked on. Let me know if I should. I hope foul play was not involved.

Take care,  
Ron

--- On Sat, 1/26/13, Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov> wrote:

From: Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Subject: Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

To: (b) (6)

Date: Saturday, January 26, 2013, 3:54 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

Smith, Shirwin <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Mon, Jan 28, 2013 at 10:05 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: Bill Merkle <Bill\_Merkle@nps.gov>

Sounds like a report was taken, but if you want to be sure, you can always call our Dispatch office on their non-emergency line (415-561-5505) and ask to have a report taken. If you given them the day and location, they may be able to tell you right then if a report already exists.

I've also copied Bill Merkle, the park's Wildlife Biologist, who may want to talk with you to get a few additional details, if that is alright with you.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201

12/23/13

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Re: From NPS.gov: Dogs Off Lease

San Francisco, CA 94123

415-561-4947 (o)

415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## Beach Policy

1 message

(b) (6)

Sat, Jul 6, 2013 at 12:28 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Hello Shirwin,

We've traded some emails in the past regarding different issues at Ocean Beach. Right now I'm trying to understand, once again, the beach policy by the park service regarding dogs.

Let me state up front that I love dogs, and in the future plan to get a rescue dog of my own. My difficulty is in the irresponsible owners that use Ocean Beach for the recreation of their dogs; and their inability to properly control them.

Today on my run I was harassed by a large husky that was running near two women. I yelled "no," and he moved away- but I'm left feeling frustrated that I have to contend with this type of thing so frequently.

A couple of years ago I encountered two rangers who were giving tickets out: "like candy." They said they came occasionally and ticketed owners who have their dogs off leash.

I've seen them once, in many years of visiting the beach. It seems to be a question of enforcement of existing laws.

Can you see any possibility of an increase in enforcement?

I feel somewhat conflicted, as I understand the desire to have one's dogs playing on the beach- but too many owners do not have their pets under control. So it is a matter of one bad apple...

I'd love to hear your perspective on this matter. I will not give up using the beach that is so near my home, nor do I believe I should have to.

Sincerely,

(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

---

## GGNRA Rec Area

4 messages

(b) (6)

Sat, May 18, 2013 at 12:26 AM

To: jelam@tcsd.us, "Smith, Shirwin" &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

Cc: frank\_dean@nps.gov

Mr. Elam,

Please accept my apologies and extend them to any of the folks I met on the trail 5/17/13 in the event they contact you.

The lack of signage and enforcement consistent with current NPS trail rules leaves trails open to interpretation and vulnerable. Ms. Smith and I talked this afternoon and I have a much better understanding of the complex situation in the Recreation Area. I remembered seeing the Tennessee Valley Trail some years ago with people walking dogs and some feces along the trail, but Ms. Smith assured me that has changed and may be a much better route to take. Seems a shame to drive past the place I could go from home for a quick walk, but I do have the technology and will explore my options. I conclude closure to pets on the Tennessee Valley trail, and increased enforcement, have driven dog owners to areas leading up to the protected trail. Regardless, I will find a less dog friendly path to exercise myself and promise not to foul it on my way. It may not be as good as Tennessee Valley Road access to the Rhubarb and Oakwood Valley, but it will be less stressful and I will not have to do as much trail dancing around the hazards.

Ms. Smith,

Thank you again for taking the time to help me better understand GGNRA Rec Area access. Better signage would be an improvement, but of course not solve the problem for dog owners and/or anyone looking for peaceful stroll. I'll leave the trails for the dogs to roam free, play in the creeks, and litter the trails for now. However, I will join the upcoming debate in an effort push for better animal control and protection of habitat. Please thank Ranger Airey for his professionalism onsite and personnel I talked with over the phone. They were informative and helpful. My wife and I talked about it, and believe a logical recourse is to avoid nearby trails, provide comments for the upcoming rule discussion, and reach out to Congressional Representatives in an attempt to alter the potentially tragic results of leaving dog feces on and off trails.

Thanks for understanding my frustration and angst at the flagrant disregard for the habitat, and for the critters in it. Sorry for the late message, but a late dinner with guests...

Thanks again

Sincerely,

(b) (6)

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Sun, May 19, 2013 at 11:28 AM

To: (b) (6)

Thank you for your thoughtful response, and I agree that it's frustrating to have to relocate to have a desirable experience. Now I just hope that the Tennessee Valley Trail lives up to my billing. We do have people go there with dogs, but it is well signed at the parking lot gate and citations are issued. I'll just give you a heads-up that care of the 1979 Pet Policy, you may see dog walkers (should be on-leash) crossing the TV Trail where the Coastal Trail crosses Tennessee Valley. That is allowed, one of the wrinkles of the current situation; you'll see the Coastal Trail from Hill 88 to Muir Beach listed as an on leash trail on our web site.

Shirwin

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

(b) (6)

Sun, May 19, 2013 at 1:12 PM

To: "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thank you for taking time to listen and .

I've done some more research on the GGNRA site and see that the portion of the Rhubarb I was on is Rec Area land;. moreover, the Superintendent's Compendium of 1/10/2012 page 19 clearly marks it as "CLOSED to pets..." In addition the color coded map (marked Exhibit 10B but not listed correctly on Page 31 index of exhibits) shows which trails require leash versus voice control, but it appears trails not color coded closed to pets which includes Rhubarb and Oakwood Valley Trails? The fire road I walk on is voice control but the revegetation area is at risk from being trampled by these animals. Seems to me the Rangers should have that information posted, and in their vehicle to hand out as needed.



NPS Managed Lands  
 Major Streets and Roads  
 Trails and Fire Roads

**Pet Policy**

**Area Policy**

No Dogs  
 Voice Control

**Trails Policy\***

On Leash  
 Voice Control

\* Trails not colored are prohibited to dogs

I do have another question

<http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/pets.htm>

<http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/upload/GGNRA-2012-Compendium.pdf>

If Mr. Dean is not troubled by the information I've provided and the flagrant abuse of protected trails/habitat/creeks in Tennessee Valley, a couple of tree shaded trails good for a walk under any condition is in serious trouble. They've definitely been harmed in my view, and the creeks and wildlife continue being damaged daily. The worst part of this is that there appears to be a lot of talk about protecting GGNRA lands, but enforcement is lacking and the average guy trying to take a walk is browbeaten out of the picture. <http://www.nps.gov/goga/parkmgmt/upload/GGNRA-2012-Compendium>

Sorry, but the more I look at this the more it gets under my skin. The part of the Rhubarb trail under TCSD control is not where I was when the lady with 2 dogs indicated the TCSD GM said it was okay for her and dogs. Hopefully that will be cleared up and the trail

Who pays for creek cleanup to remove debris tossed into it? Why aren't Rangers and the office I called for help more knowledgeable of the Compendium? What are the penalties for violation of CFR 36 relevant to dog issues? Ticket, fines?...

Sorry here I go again.

Thanks again,

Sincerely,

(b) (6)

**From:** Smith, Shirwin [mailto:shirwin\_smith@nps.gov]

**Sent:** Sunday, May 19, 2013 11:28 AM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Subject:** Re: GGNRA Rec Area

[Quoted text hidden]

(b) (6)

Mon, May 20, 2013 at 11:18 AM

To: Jon Elam <Jelam@tcsd.us>

Cc: "Bartschat, Steffen" <Bartschat\_Steffen@gsb.stanford.edu>, Gretchen Stagg <gs.tcsd@gmail.com>, (b) (6)

(b) (6), (b) (6), (b) (6),  
frank\_dean@nps.gov, "Smith, Shirwin" <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Thanks Jon, good information I was looking for new places this morning.

I thought I'd found the perfect tree shaded path with the occasional snake, slug, or even Giant Salamander sighting in the creek, but the Rhubarb/Oakwood Valley appear to be the Bay Area dog park rather than the fragile environment protected by Federal Regulations. Apparently, the Superintendent's Compendium 2012 regarding dog use is impotent at best. Signage is lacking and I guess people rightfully assume there are no rules. As stated before my daily observation was dogs off leash in habitat and feces plus bags of it littered on the Oakwood/Rhubarb. That really ruins the experience anyway.

I'll stay off the Oakwood/Rhubarb trails for now to avoid the hassle and hostility. I'll just send correspondence to Congress and the NPS asking for enforcement of current regulations, and to environmental advocates as well. Dogs are natural predators that I understand will harass or even kill native wildlife if not restrained. I don't think the "voice control" I've observed is effective and dogs pose several threats to Rec Area natural resources. They mark territories with scent and can spread diseases to native wildlife and habitat, which in theory are protected

within NPS boundaries. I guess parts of the Rhubarb fall outside that protected zone and can be considered wild for unfettered use. Behavior on the Oakwood I hope Rhubarb maintenance and cleanup are funded by donation and not monies we pay to TCSD for services.

Sincerely,

Thanks again

(b) (6)

---

**From:** Jon Elam [mailto:[Jelam@tcsd.us](mailto:Jelam@tcsd.us)]

**Sent:** Monday, May 20, 2013 9:14 AM

**To:** (b) (6)

**Cc:** Bartschat, Steffen; Gretchen Stagg ; (b) (6)

**Subject:** RE: GGNRA Rec Area

(b) (6) Thanks you for the thought and energy you put into laying out your experiences on our Rhubarb Trail. TCSD share of that trail runs from the little bridge across from Oakwood Valley down to where the GGNRA crews are building a new bridge crossing it or about one mile. TCSD has always allowed people to run or walk their dogs on the trail, we have not had complaints or problems over the years that I am aware of. Bikes are not allowed but several folks every day ride it and we have not caught them yet but those are posted. The trail from our survey gets minimal use in the range of 20-30 people a day. Way less that the GGNRA trails across the road and out to the Beach. We do try and keep the weeds cut back and make it as save as possible but it is a wildlife area. We noted the junk that was dropped into the canyon last week and will get our crews as time allows to rappel down the side and pull the junk up. It is the first time I remember anything like that occurring. In fact it is rather amazing given the amount of junk that is along the roadways that Tennessee Valley road remains as clean as it does. I note that you would like to move to a quieter trail and location and would suggest the Laurel Canyon Trail that extends from the end of Laurel (off of Marin Ave and connects to the Miwok Trail. No dogs and very peaceful and pleasant, but it is a hard walk at least going up. Thanks for your good work on this and sorry it caused you so much stress.

---

**From:** (b) (6)

**Sent:** Saturday, May 18, 2013 12:26 AM

**To:** Jon Elam; Smith, Shirwin

**Cc:** [frank\\_dean@nps.gov](mailto:frank_dean@nps.gov)

**Subject:** GGNRA Rec Area

[Quoted text hidden]



## Re: alta trail

Shirwin Smith

(b) (6)

Wed, Aug 21, 2013 at 11:44 AM

To: (b) (6)

Cc: shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

Hi (b) (6) - although our (GGNRA's) dog management plan is still a couple of years away from completion, we are considering whether an interim action is possible to address commercial dog walking in Marin and SF, in light of new rules by 2 neighboring agencies - Tiburon and San Francisco (limiting # of dogs per walker). Right now, we are limited in what we can do. But want you to have park contact numbers in case you need them while on park lands: 415-561-5656 is the park dispatch's emergency number (24/7 way to reach our law enforcement staff). To have a report taken on an incident, you can call the non-emergency number 415-561-5505.

Are you on the park's dog management contact list? May I add you so that you'll be alerted when there is an opportunity for the public to weigh in?

Shirwin

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 21, 2013, at 11:10 AM,

(b) (6)

wrote:

Hi Shirwin

I have an unusual question. (b) (6) and I walk our dogs on the alta trail every day. The amount of dog poop that is on the trail is disgusting. We were walking behind a dog walker (it's dog walker territory unfortunately) whose dog pooped in front of us and when he kept walking I called him and told him that his dog had pooped and he told me to mind my own business and kept walking. Is there anything that can be done by the Park service to solve this problem? The dog walkers have become a menace up there - a lot of them have about ten dogs at a time and their is now way they can tend to the dogs and pickup after them. The area is littered with dog poop and is no longer a pleasant place to take a walk.

I am clutching at straws and thought I would start by asking you what can be done.

I miss not seeing you at the board meetings.

(b) (6)



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

## Fwd: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek

2 messages

**Fong, Darren** <darren\_fong@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 4:40 PM

Just got this– did you want to respond? Thx!

Darren Fong  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Bldg 1061, Fort Cronkhite  
Sausalito, CA 94965  
415-289-1838 (phone)  
415-331-0851 (fax)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6)  
Date: Wed, May 15, 2013 at 11:26 AM  
Subject: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek  
To: [Darren\\_fong@nps.gov](mailto:Darren_fong@nps.gov)

Hi Darren I forgot to mention that there has been a rash of illegal dumping IN THE CREEK (Nyhan) along Tennessee Valley Rd. The last drop was way up by the stable, 15 to 20 feet down the bank and into the stream. I believe this last dump is on park lands. The GGNRA web site is very confusing as we are looking at it right now. So that is the Park's responsibility, too. If everybody is clear, that is a start. I want to share with you that (b) (6) my husband, and I saw the largest salamander thwat I have ever seen, between 12 and 15 inches!!!, under the main bridge on the Oakwood Valley Trail. It distresses me to see dogs down in there!~A

My husband, (b) (6) has been exercising daily by fast walking up to the stables and on the way back he takes the Oakwood Valley Creek loop. We have both been distressed by the incredible amount of dog feces on the trail and watching dogs roam at large, off leash and far from the owner's ability to control them by voice command, indeed the owner often can't even see what his dog is doing. Even when the dogs are with the owners, we have observed them allow their dogs to run through the creek, dig in the restoral areas and chase animals! He actually looked GGNRA up on line and found there are plenty of regs, but these aren't posted anywhere at the site, so that is on the park. He also found a GGNRA comments page where the dog owners from San Francisco don't have any/enough open spaces to let their dogs run around in, so the word is out that this trail is THE place to bring your dog to run around off leash. Also, he spoke with one of the regulars who habitually lets her dog run far from her view, and she said that this is an **"open area"** where dogs are allowed to run off leash (!) and that plenty of rangers have seen her run with her dog off leash and have said nothing. Jerry pointed out that the park rules on line, are very specific about the dogs' needing to be under voice command .Indeed, the trail, portion of the loop IS for leashed dogs, ONLY, but that seldom happens. Looking at the Park's own web page, there are conflicting designations for the Oakwood Valley Trail!!!! ARRRRG!

There are, of course, responsible dog owners, BUT with the city of SF coming to use this area as their "dog park" the sheer numbers of those owners who are not responsible is causing a lot of damage. It is impossible to give a dog voice commands without watching the dog! Muir Beach suffers from a similar fate. Last year I was painting

next to the bridge, above the clearly marked habitat restoral areas along the bank, and dog owners regularly watched their dogs run around the posted area and down in the creek there, too. This is public property. Rangers and park rules are supposed to safeguard the health of this area. As you well know, Nyhan Creek, and Oakwood Valley Creek, its tributary, is the only creek in Tam Valley that still has any fish. This habitat is crucial for what's left of them. I am cc'ing this to others, and hope that steps can be taken to protect this last vestige of this area's wild streams.

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Fong, Darren" <darren\_fong@nps.gov>

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 4:43 PM

She sent this to me directly earlier today, since I've been corresponding with her husband about these same issues yesterday and today. So pretty much have it covered. But I will probably also send a response to her.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

## Fwd: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek

2 messages

**Fong, Darren** <darren\_fong@nps.gov>  
To: Shirwin Smith <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 4:40 PM

Just got this– did you want to respond? Thx!

Darren Fong  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Bldg 1061, Fort Cronkhite  
Sausalito, CA 94965  
415-289-1838 (phone)  
415-331-0851 (fax)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: (b) (6) >  
Date: Wed, May 15, 2013 at 11:26 AM  
Subject: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek  
To: [Darren\\_fong@nps.gov](mailto:Darren_fong@nps.gov)

Hi Darren I forgot to mention that there has been a rash of illegal dumping IN THE CREEK (Nyhan) along Tennessee Valley Rd. The last drop was way up by the stable, 15 to 20 feet down the bank and into the stream. I believe this last dump is on park lands. The GGNRA web site is very confusing as we are looking at it right now. So that is the Park's responsibility, too. If everybody is clear, that is a start. I want to share with you that (b) (6) my husband, and I saw the largest salamander thwat I have ever seen, between 12 and 15 inches!!!, under the main bridge on the Oakwood Valley Trail. It distresses me to see dogs down in there!~A

My husband, (b) (6) has been exercising daily by fast walking up to the stables and on the way back he takes the Oakwood Valley Creek loop. We have both been distressed by the incredible amount of dog feces on the trail and watching dogs roam at large, off leash and far from the owner's ability to control them by voice command, indeed the owner often can't even see what his dog is doing. Even when the dogs are with the owners, we have observed them allow their dogs to run through the creek, dig in the restoral areas and chase animals! He actually looked GGNRA up on line and found there are plenty of regs, but these aren't posted anywhere at the site, so that is on the park. He also found a GGNRA comments page where the dog owners from San Francisco don't have any/enough open spaces to let their dogs run around in, so the word is out that this trail is THE place to bring your dog to run around off leash. Also, he spoke with one of the regulars who habitually lets her dog run far from her view, and she said that this is an **"open area"** where dogs are allowed to run off leash (!) and that plenty of rangers have seen her run with her dog off leash and have said nothing. Jerry pointed out that the park rules on line, are very specific about the dogs' needing to be under voice command .Indeed, the trail, portion of the loop IS for leashed dogs, ONLY, but that seldom happens. Looking at the Park's own web page, there are conflicting designations for the Oakwood Valley Trail!!!! ARRRRG!

There are, of course, responsible dog owners, BUT with the city of SF coming to use this area as their "dog park" the sheer numbers of those owners who are not responsible is causing a lot of damage. It is impossible to give a dog voice commands without watching the dog! Muir Beach suffers from a similar fate. Last year I was painting

next to the bridge, above the clearly marked habitat restoral areas along the bank, and dog owners regularly watched their dogs run around the posted area and down in the creek there, too. This is public property. Rangers and park rules are supposed to safeguard the health of this area. As you well know, Nyhan Creek, and Oakwood Valley Creek, its tributary, is the only creek in Tam Valley that still has any fish. This habitat is crucial for what's left of them. I am cc'ing this to others, and hope that steps can be taken to protect this last vestige of this area's wild streams.

---

**Smith, Shirwin** <shirwin\_smith@nps.gov>  
To: "Fong, Darren" <darren\_fong@nps.gov>

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 4:43 PM

She sent this to me directly earlier today, since I've been corresponding with her husband about these same issues yesterday and today. So pretty much have it covered. But I will probably also send a response to her.

Shirwin Smith  
Management Assistant  
Golden Gate National Recreation Area  
Ft. Mason, Building 201  
San Francisco, CA 94123  
415-561-4947 (o)  
415-716-9999 (c)

[Quoted text hidden]



Smith, Shirwin &lt;shirwin\_smith@nps.gov&gt;

## Fwd: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek

1 message

(b) (6)

Wed, May 15, 2013 at 11:50 AM

To: shirwin\_smith@nps.gov

Thanks for your attention!~April Post

----- Forwarded Message -----

From: (b) (6)

To: Darren fong &lt;Darren\_fong@nps.gov&gt;

Sent: Wed, 15 May 2013 18:26:10 -0000 (UTC)

Subject: Oak Valley Creek/Nyhan Creek

Hi Darren I forgot to mention that there has been a rash of illegal dumping IN THE CREEK (Nyhan) along Tennessee Valley Rd. The last drop was way up by the stable, 15 to 20 feet down the bank and into the stream. I believe this last dump is on park lands. The GGNRA web site is very confusing as we are looking at it right now. So that is the Park's responsibility, too. If everybody is clear, that is a start.

I want to share with you that (b) (6) my husband, and I saw the largest salamander thwat I have ever seen, between 12 and 15 inches!!!, under the main bridge on the Oakwood Valley Trail. It distresses me to see dogs down in there!~A

My husband, (b) (6) has been exercising daily by fast walking up to the stables and on the way back he takes the Oakwood Valley Creek loop. We have both been distressed by the incredible amount of dog feces on the trail and watching dogs roam at large, off leash and far from the owner's ability to control them by voice command, indeed the owner often can't even see what his dog is doing. Even when the dogs are with the owners, we have observed them allow their dogs to run through the creek, dig in the restoral areas and chase animals! He actually looked GGNRA up on line and found there are plenty of regs, but these aren't posted anywhere at the site, so that is on the park. He also found a GGNRA comments page where the dog owners from San Francisco don't have any/enough open spaces to let their dogs run around in, so the word is out that this trail is THE place to bring your dog to run around off leash. Also, he spoke with one of the regulars who habitually lets her dog run far from her view, and she said that this is an "open area" where dogs are allowed to run off leash (!) and that plenty of rangers have seen her run with her dog off leash and have said nothing. (b) (6) pointed out that the park rules on line, are very specific about the dogs' needing to be under voice command. Indeed, the trail, portion of the loop IS for leashed dogs, ONLY, but that seldom happens. Looking at the Park's own web page, there are conflicting designations for the Oakwood Valley Trail!!!! ARRRRG!

There are, of course, responsible dog owners, BUT with the city of SF coming to use this area as their "dog park" the sheer numbers of those owners who are not responsible is causing a lot of damage. It is impossible to give a dog voice commands without watching the dog! Muir Beach suffers from a similar fate. Last year I was painting next to the bridge, above the clearly marked habitat restoral areas along the bank, and dog owners regularly watched their dogs run around the posted area and down in the creek there, too. This is public property. Rangers and park rules are supposed to safeguard the health of this area. As you well know, Nyhan Creek, and Oakwood Valley Creek, its tributary, is the only creek in Tam Valley that still has any fish. This habitat is crucial for what's left of them. I am cc'ing this to others, and hope that steps can be taken to protect this last vestige of this area's wild streams.