

## **Draft General Management Planning Issues and Menu of Goals**

GMP issues and opportunities are the main topics that the GMP will address and resolve. Each issue/opportunity has four parts: 1) a brief description of the issue/opportunity, 2) a **bolded** statement of what the GMP needs to do in order to address the topic, 3) items to be considered as the planning process explores the issue/opportunity, and 4) goals with other associated goals and elements that can be used to develop GMP alternatives.

### **9. Alcatraz Island National Historic Landmark**

*NOTE: Most of the GMP issues listed in this packet will be addressed at Alcatraz Island National Historic Landmark in addition to the following site specific issue.*

*GMP Issue Statement:*

**The GMP will develop a vision that integrates protection of natural resource values with the preservation of the National Historic Landmark on Alcatraz Island, while providing a high quality national park experience to a diverse range of visitors.**

*Issue Description:*

Alcatraz Island is a designated National Historic Landmark because of its national significance in the areas of military history and social history (penology). Although Alcatraz is a highly visible and popular site in the San Francisco Bay, many of its buildings and landscape features are deteriorating, and sections of its shoreline are eroding. The park is in need of additional financial resources to protect and preserve all of the island's historic landscape resources.

The Island also contains important wildlife habitat, especially for colonial seabirds. Over 1,000 pairs of western gulls nest on the Island and it is home to the largest regional populations of several species of pelagic birds. Conflicts have arisen over management strategies for protecting the Island's cultural and natural resources (e.g., protecting important bird nesting habitat and developing new adaptive uses). Resource management on the Island needs to integrate preservation of both natural and cultural resource values.

Furthermore, Alcatraz Island is an extremely popular park destination, receiving over 1.4 million visitors annually. Improving and managing visitor experience is an important consideration.

*Factors/Considerations:*

- The National Historic Landmark (NHL) status is contingent on protecting a "high degree" of integrity; ruins are generally considered structures without integrity for National Register and NHL purposes. However, most features that we currently consider ruins were included as contributing features to the Landmark when it was so listed in 1986 - these include North and South batteries, office quarters, Warden's residence, and the remains of three apartments on the Parade grounds.
- The current NHL period of significance is 1850-1963.
- The park intends to evaluate the significance of the American Indian occupation and thus possibly amend the NHL period of significance to also include 1969-1971.
- Pier 4 at Fort Mason should be considered an Alcatraz resource for planning purposes.
- Operational limitations exist in terms of self-sufficiency for island water use, waste management, supplies, and utilities
- Coastal erosion or failure is affecting the island's natural and cultural resources
- The harsh marine environment affects historic resources and operational needs
- The island provides important habitat and use areas for certain wildlife species
- User capacity and facility usage are key issues for the site
- The historic resources pose many challenges for visitor access, especially disabled access
- Shoreline stabilization is needed
- Sustainability of park operations

CULTURAL RESOURCES:

Goal 9CulturalA: ***Ruins Management/Tactical Retreat***  
**Preserve only the minimum level of integrity required to retain and preserve NHL status. A "managed ruins" philosophy is utilized for historic structures, and cultural landscapes are allowed to re-wild.**

*Preservation and Tactical Retreat:* Preservation of the minimum level of integrity required to retain the NHL status. A guiding principle is to manage deterioration of historic structures within acceptable limits, allow cultural landscape features to evolve into a wild state, and document archeological sites ahead of imminent loss.

Goal 9CulturalB: ***Cultural Landscapes***

**Focus on cultural landscapes by preserving systems, large scale features, and patterns. Enclose viable buildings and provide the minimum level of utilities needed to allow some visitor services and partner uses.**

*Overall Patterns and Targeted Rehabilitation:* The guiding principle is the preservation of the cultural landscape through an emphasis on systems, large-scale features and overall patterns. Use rehabilitation as a preservation strategy. Enclose viable buildings and provide the minimum level of utilities needed to allow some visitor services and partner use.

Goal 9CulturalC: ***Rehabilitation***

**Buildings are rehabilitated and adaptively re-used for a variety of uses. A diversity of visitor opportunities is available.**

*Widespread Rehabilitation and Better Understanding:* Structures and landscapes are rehabilitated and adaptively re-used for a variety of uses, not necessarily directly related to Alcatraz themes. A diversity of visitor opportunities is available. Archeological features are actively explored and integrated into the visitor experience.

#### NATURAL RESOURCES:

Goal 9NaturalA:

**Focus natural resource management efforts on maintaining a sustainable population of colonial nesting seabirds and preserving important tide pools.**

Goal 9NaturalB:

**Improve the protection of the Island's natural resources by increasing educational and interpretive activities.**

Goal 9NaturalC:

**Treat the Island as an important component of the region's natural oceanic and coastal environment. Alcatraz serves**

as an indicator of the health of the Bay, where natural processes are encouraged and sustained (to the degree consistent with the retention of NHL status).

VISITOR ACCESS AND EXPERIENCE:

Goal 9VisitorA: *Visitor Access & Comfort*

Focus on improving visitor access and comfort by improving facilities and providing a diversity of visitor options.

*Possible Goals and Elements:*

- Could include food service on the island.
- Implies a water treatment facility that supports a full range of facility use.
- Rehabilitate Building 64 into a hotel.

Goal 9VisitorB: *Self-Discovery*

Provide minimal facilities and allow the visitor to explore and discover.

Goal 9VisitorC: *Island Biogeography/ An Island in the Bay*

The Island's position in the Bay is used to explain and demonstrate natural resource and cultural resource processes and constraints. [Suggested deleting]

Goal 9VisitorD: *Immersion in the Period of Significance*

Visitors are immersed in the character and activities of the period 1850-1962.

*Possible Goals and Elements:*

- Could bring the prison "alive".
- Could "man" the fortifications.

OTHER:

Goal9X: *The Island as a Model of Sustainability*

The Island is utilized as a showcase for green practices and sustainability efforts.

*Elements Common to All Alternatives:*

- The need to treat the structures, landscape features and archeological features on Alcatraz in a comprehensive fashion and in a manner consistent with

*the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*

- Be practical regarding building treatments. The park should consider treatments other than reuse and rehabilitation - such as preservation, restoration, reconstruction and removal - where rehabilitation is determined to be inappropriate, financially infeasible, or inconsistent with park values
- The need to balance visitor requirements with historic preservation, especially as it pertains to ADA access; all occupied structures must meet current fire, life/safety, seismic and ADA codes; concessions and other visitor amenities should be considered
- The use of partnerships, stewardship, and best management practices to manage historic resources
- The need for maintenance and operational solutions appropriate to the level of visitor use
- Develop ways to evaluate the compatibility and practicality of potential new uses - need philosophical "sideboards" on the range of allowable special park uses at Alcatraz
- Explore new revenue-generating uses, including special events, that are compatible with existing visitation and achieve resource management objectives

Yellow text = Language proposed by S. Haller, C. Kenkel, P. Scolari 03/02/07