

	Alternative 1- Connecting People	Alternative 2- Coastal Ecosystem Connection	Alternative 3- A Park of National Treasures	Alternative 4- Seamless Connections
Visitor Experience	Extended stay visitor experience			
- story to be told	Tell a range of stories that connects with a broad audience (all of the periods and resources); broadest array of delivery techniques	Focuses on natural resource significance; connecting humans and resources to Farrallones and other Bay resources; Alcatraz bird pops. as indicator of the health of the Bay; climate change, sea-level rise and ties to Alcatraz; Cultural resources would be described within the context of how humans used and affected the environment; historic immersion tells the primary story of the cell house; military location, manipulating and affecting the coastal ecosystem	Focuses on cultural resources and history (NHL), military period, federal penitentiary, Native Am., NPS period (secondary story of how natural reclamation has occurred); stories are directly related to NHL (inc. family life); current relevance to social issues; NR stories are related to the experience of living on the Island; immersion story is focused on federal penitentiary period	Focus on stories of coastal defense, maritime history, waterbird connections, public lands protection and management; elements of NR and CR management that cross boundaries; Ft. Baker and water transportation system (strategic defense triad); lighthouses and story of regional navigational aids
- what is the visitor doing, learning, seeing?	Many opportunities are present for self-selection by the visitor; island-wide; incl. NR and CR stewardship (volunteer);	Resource stewardship is the primary goal; all activities geared towards resource objectives (Earthwatch, ecotourism); outdoor classroom programming related to science, birds, marine env.; wildlife viewing opportunities (bird blinds, spotting scopes)	Visitor is walking in the footsteps of prisoner (Island residents); maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible (buildings, outdoor spaces); self-selection and guided opportunities	Learning how Alcatraz connects to other public lands management; study and learn about site characteristics while providing a portal into learning about regional resources;
- where does the experience begin?	Multiple modes of entry and travel	Primarily large boat arrival; guided kayak trips	Pier 4 (and maybe Warden Johnston boat)	Explore idea like “Bay area parks pass” that allows seamless entry (underserved audiences); connects to transportation hubs and portals
Visitor Services - what is required to meet the visitor experience?	Broadest opportunities for overnight accommodations; Camping for stewardship activities; hostel; meeting space for events and education; foodservice	Overnight accommodations directly related to high level of resource stewardship; Develop networks (packaged trips) to tell the story of the environment and impacts to the env.	Overnight accommodations and experiences related to how overnight occurred in the past (historical context); foodservice; restrooms	Develop networks (packaged trips) to tell the stories of coastal defense, maritime history, waterbird connections, public lands protection and management; restrooms; services and facilities are comparable between connected sites;
Visitor Access				
- circulation/roads	Utilize road on west side of Laundry bldg (tram route) or provide access through bldg.; no seasonal closure for birds or route through building at sensitive times; Cistern Path open to public for access between cell house and Laundry Bldg	Seasonal access; closures; controlled access during open times	Historic trails, roads, etc. reconnected for visitor experience; maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible	Same as 3, but with additional protection for bird habitat
- access to indoor spaces	Maximize use of spaces as part of vis. Exp.	Access with resource protection as priority; [Seasonal access; closures; controlled access during open times]	maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible (buildings); Built env. is evaluated to re-establish the highest level of cultural landscape integrity	maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible by using resources as they exist;
- access to outdoor spaces	Maximize access; Open year-round (Parade Ground, Agave Trail, Officer’s Row Gardens)	Seasonal access; closures; controlled access during open times; guided access within New zone; West road open for seasonal guided access only; tram remains as existing	maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible (outdoor spaces);	maximize use and experience of the Island as much as possible by using resources as they exist, with protection of birds
- access to programs	Provide greatest physical and programmatic access to a range of visitors	Provide alt. means of program access vs. extension of tram	Same as 1, plus goal is to provide physical access to primary spaces that tell key stories, if feasible; alt. means if not	Same as 1
Special Events	Provide greatest flexibility for special events,	Highly controlled and tied to (subordinate to)	Same as 2, but with focus on fundamental	Purpose needs to be tied to concept and theme

	Alternative 1- Connecting People	Alternative 2- Coastal Ecosystem Connection	Alternative 3- A Park of National Treasures	Alternative 4- Seamless Connections
	need not be tied to Alcatraz themes; accommodates large groups;	resource objectives; Required to have purpose or related theme (ecosystem, resource protection and management, sustainability);	CR and primary themes	(broader uses and additional users for special event space)
Resource Management	Stewardship opportunities that support resource objectives; maximum mgmt of bird waste in high visitor use areas; expands use of gull exclusions	Deliberate and focused integration of NR and CR mgmt in the New zone; cultural resources are stabilized to meet the minimum required for NHL status; maximizes citizen science; enhances docent program	Preservation philosophy is linked to interpret evolved history; artifacts brought back to Island and on display; Select resources are restored; veg, is managed for cultural landscape values	No restoration; rehab to support visitor services and interp. needs; preservation of existing CR
- bird management	Minimum viable pop. threshold (maintain 2 focal areas for Western gulls)	Protect waterbird colonies and allow for fluctuation of nesting locations within the New zone; habitat enhancements for nesting sites; manage bird pops. within the Evolved zone to allow for visitor access	Approach same as 1 except birds are managed to complement fundamental CR	Actively manage birds (protect in sensitive areas and deter in high use areas)
Self-Sufficiency & Revenue generation	Explores revenue generating activities that support resource protection and re-use	Revenue generating programs support stewardship program and activities (linked directly to the theme of the alt.)	Revenue activities tied to CR preservation and interpreting and experiencing history (linked directly to the theme of the alt.)	Activities could be independent or linked to broader connections that we are pursuing through partnerships
Sustainability	Maximize use, visibility, and interpretation of new green technologies in Diverse zone (showcased to the greatest extent)	Primarily in Ops zone; controlled education; Highly managed services and programs to minimize waste (bio-diesel, alt. fuels); integrate into green services and activities vs. technologies; compost toilets, healthy foods initiative; could include energy generation from water in Bay that is compatible with resource protection	Where appropriate, historic systems re-established to support sustainable practices and goals; evaluate sites for new green practices;	Pursue green activities in Ops zone and where appropriate in Evolved zone; combine with partner greening activities
Operations (staff and facilities)	More facilities (back of the house and dedicated space) and staff to support expanded access, programs, visitor services	Explores partnership opportunities to provide services and program delivery (active management and coordination by NPS staff)	Same as 1 (in secondary or less significant areas)	Same as 1
Range of uses for Buildings				
- Laundry Bldg.	Multi-purpose facility that supports large groups; rehabilitate for events, programs, conference space, restrooms, kitchen, exhibits; maximizes abilities to fund resource treatments (attention to adjacent Sensitive zone)	Use is highly controlled to avoid impacts to sensitive resources; access is seasonal only	Multi-purpose facility that supports historic preservation objectives (incl. space for interpretation, special events, and exhibits that tie to historic immersion concept)	Same as 1
- Model Industry Bldg.	Facility for park staff, maintenance operations	Optional rehab. with controlled access and use (could be used as ops. If managed)	Maintenance and ops. activities occur here similar to historic context	Same as 1
- Bldg. 64	Hospitality (food, overnight); possible A/V site; admin. offices; visitor interpretation and exhibits; post office (includes required infrastructure)	Multi-purpose facility that supports admin., visitor services (incl. snacks and catering), primary central facility for visitor services, restrooms, overnight accommodations	Uses allow diverse visitor opps; post office and general store; possible overnight accommodations (immersion experience); possible restored apartment; to accommodate admin. functions for NPS and partners	Broad range of day use activities; orientation to connected sites; admin. use; museum exhibits and collections
- Officer's Club	Stabilize and provide access while preserving as a ruin; test appropriate re-use options (desalination and/or café)	Stabilize and potential use for ops; green technology opportunities	Same as 1	Same as 1
- Main Prison Building (hospital)	Widest variety of access to historic areas	Same as alt 1; widest variety of access and	Same as 2, plus food service in kitchen and	Preservation of evolved condition compared to

	Alternative 1- Connecting People	Alternative 2- Coastal Ecosystem Connection	Alternative 3- A Park of National Treasures	Alternative 4- Seamless Connections
wing and cell block)	(theatre, hospital, Citadel, A block); add visitor convenience facilities (restrooms)	programs with emphasis on evolved history of Island	dining room; re-establish historic uses where appropriate	restoring historic period/condition (rehab. to support and provide basic services);
- Guardhouse & Sally Port	Stabilize and provide access; rehab to support military era interpretation	Rehab. To support interp. of evolved history	Study and define tangible resources that tell story of military period and restore select portions to provide immersion experience; part of comprehensive assessment to tell story of military period	Stabilize and provide access; study in context of connected sites and how to tell regional story (treatment is appropriate); select restoration that best tells story of connections
- Power House	Utilize to tell story of Island's energy history; new facilities or infra. located at this site	Rehab. To support sustainability systems; visitor access is controlled for special tours only (in Ops. Zone)	Rehab. To support sustainability systems; use for some maintenance functions; visitor access is controlled for special tours	Same as 2

Basic visitor protection and EMS services

CHECK on whether zone maps match with table, especially where we state same as another alternative.

Alt 1 Decision Notes

Assuming the goal is to maintain minimum viable populations of waterbirds. There are 3 primary breeding areas for western gulls that were identified as important to maintaining the gull population through the BCM Strategy. The group decided that at a minimum maintain 2 of these breeding areas (these assumptions would need to be tested in the impact analysis). The Parade Ground and the Cistern support greater populations than the MI Plaza. We need to consider access decisions to the Parade Grounds and MI Plaza use, before deciding on whether path on east side of Cistern Area would be closed seasonally or open year round.

Red Zone vs. Yellow Zone on roads and trails:

Yellow implies resource value is very high; treatments are light on the land; doesn't allow for modification.

Red implies that circulation and connection is most important; allows for more change. Safety and high volume flow important.

Stairs to Rec. Yard: unsafe and not conducive to high volume. Recommend switching to red zone.

Add red zone on road to west of Laundry Building and connection on west road for tram providing island loop. This would be adjacent to the pink sensitive zone along the edge of the island—and may set up conflicts. Need to assess whether the tram would operate along this loop year round or only seasonally on the basis of impacts to waterbirds.

Kept Officer's Row as yellow zone to allow for restoration activities and protection of arch. resources; also allows for controlled visitor access

NE Perimeter Trail: leave as yellow zone, envisioned as low use and not fully accessible. Open for access, need to decide whether seasonal or year-round. This area still supports black-crowned night-herons.

Operations zone: MI Bldg./Power House/Quartermaster's Warehouse. This is area where these operations historically occurred and provides the necessary space. It also moves these operations to the periphery of the island, outside the highest use areas of the island from the dock to the Cell House. Also need to include for diverse access to north end under this alternative. Also note that operations has needs to connect with dock area.

Alt. 2 Decision Notes

Technical Corrections:

Extend operations zone to capture MI Building (this is actually a change—see rationale for operations zone above). Note that operations zone does not include the level of visitor access as in alt. 1. Need to define what minimum operations footprint is—so may not have all these building spaces filled.

Extend historic immersion zone on south end of Cell House complex.

Extend pink sensitive zone in marine further around south end of island.

Changes:

Building 64: Zoned red vs. brown. Uses need to be directly tied to resource stewardship and understanding fundamental values of resources on the island. Keeping brown may make it easier to make decisions based on appropriateness to resource/more control. Different from connecting people if brown.

Alt. 3 Decision Notes

Morgue should be included as historic immersion zone with Cell House complex.

Historic immersion for Guard Tower.

Small structures on landscape (e.g. fences, paths, fireboxes, Incinerator) could end up being important to the NHL and included the historic immersion zone.

Add operations zone same as 2 above.

Bldg. 64—leave as historic immersion.

Alt. 4 Decision Notes:

Add sensitive resource zone along cliffs/island periphery.

Brown zone doesn't extend into water at south end of island and dock and Power House.

Sensitive marine zone extends to 300' out from island.

Sensitive zone on SE of island and Agave Trail around to dock does not seem appropriate based on current night-heron use of area—convert to brown.

A lot like existing conditions; retooling visitor programs and services to make connections to other agencies, program services, and sites.