

# 8<sup>th</sup> Grade Social Studies

Goal 9

Objectives 9.01, 9.03

Preservation vs. Utilization:

Cape Lookout, Cape Hatteras, & Other Parks

National Park Service  
Cape Lookout National Seashore  
Harkers Island, North Carolina



## **Table of Contents**

Overview of Pre-visit, On-site, and Post-visit Activities .....	2
NS Standard Course of Study Goals and Objectives Filled .....	5
<b>Pre-Site Visit</b>	
A Brief History of the National Parks .....	6
National Parks in America Activity .....	9
<b>On-Site Visit</b>	
Superintendent for a Day Activity .....	10
Preservation vs. Utilization Debate Activity .....	11
Preservation vs. Utilization Debate Data Sheet .....	12
Evaluating Sources for Research .....	14
<b>Post-Site Visit</b>	
Post-Visit Knowledge Assessment .....	16
“America’s Best Idea” Viewer’s Guide .....	18
Additional Resources .....	20

# Preservation vs. Utilization

## Overview

### Description:

The learner will be able to:

- Describe the similarities and differences between the Preservation Conservationist and Utilitarian Conservationist philosophies and form an opinion about their own National Park stewardship philosophy
- Understand and describe the historical debate between these two philosophies at the beginning of the National Park movement
- Using Cape Lookout National Seashore and Cape Hatteras National Seashores as examples formulate a cohesive, knowledgeable position for or against one of these philosophies.
- Using examples from policy issues currently being debated within the Cape Lookout National Seashore communities acquire a knowledge base for their opinions
- Decide which, if any, philosophy has “won out” over the other or if we are still debating these in today’s world and specifically at Cape Lookout National Seashore

Group Size: 2-20

Time: 45-50 minutes per class visit for on- and pre-site visit activities

On-site activity covers a five (5) day session

Location: Classroom

### Pre-Site Visit Activities: TEACHER COMPLETED

Knowledge Assessment (in post-site materials)

National Parks Introduction

- Split students in groups of 2-3 and give each group a “National Park System Map and Guide”
- Have them read “A Brief History of the National Parks”
- Hand out the “National Parks in America Activity” and have the groups brainstorm answers to the questions (some are fact and some are opinion, these are marked)
- Use the discussion points below to guide students through the materials

## Discussion Points

- How many different designations are there for National Parks? (listed above the map)
  - Why do you think we have all these different titles?
  - What makes a park a National Seashore? National Scenic Trail? National Monument?
- What makes Saint Croix Island (Maine) different from all the other National Parks? (Hint: Name)
- How many U.S. territories contain National Parks?
- Using the scale bar, determine the length of the boarder shared between NC and VA.

## Opinion Question Discussion Points

3) This question deals with a federal agency owning and operating tracks of land within a sovereign state's borders or across several states' borders. Consider:

- Federal laws conflicting with state laws and federal considerations over-riding a state's considerations—mineral rights, water rights, etc.
- Traditional local usage of land before it became federal property in conflict with current land usage
- The federal government responsible for funding the park rather than the state—all citizens take responsibility rather than only a few
- Federal government operating a park consistently with the same rules/regulations across several states rather than a hodge-podge of different states' regulations within the same park; consistency in park rules/regulations throughout all park units
- Ability to acquire, staff and protect large tracts of land on the federal level, etc.

5) This question deals with having a military organization in charge of a park. Consider:

- Tying up your military in park operations and therefore being unavailable for protecting the nation, having military troops trained for conflict trying to serve tourists on vacation—is this a good fit?
- Local population resentment at essentially being in what could be thought of as a state of “occupation,” would the Army have the experience/expertise to preserve and protect natural resources—how would they do it?

7) This question deals with the kind of parks first established in the east versus those in the west.

- The first eastern parks were small, usually of historic significance, not mineral-rich, lacking natural resources that could be used such as coal, oil, or land for grazing, or rivers to be dammed.

- Eastern parks, generally, lacked exploitable resources.
- The very nature of the western parks gave rise to the preservation and utilitarian mentalities.

There were too many natural riches open for exploitation without clear ownership by individuals.

8) This question deals with how the eastern parks were shaped more by history and people than by natural beauty as the western parks were.

- In the east parks tend to be smaller, closer to large population centers, closer together, founded on historical sites such as battlefields, war memorials, presidential birth sites, etc. or honor famous Americans,
- Western parks are large, at greater distances from each other, farther from population centers, and are founded on beauty scenery or scientific reasons—fossils, dinosaurs, etc.

### **On-Site Visit Activities: RANGER COMPLETED**

#### Day 1

Preservation Conservationist versus Utilitarian Conservationist Viewpoints

Park Superintendent Activity

Begin Research on Assigned Viewpoints

#### Day 2, Day 3, and Day 4

Continue Research on Viewpoints

Ask a Ranger

#### Day 5

Debate: Preserve or Use?

### **Post-Site Visit Activities: TEACHER COMPLETED**

Knowledge Assessment

America's Best Idea by Ken Burns – Introduction

- This introduction (50 minutes) to the 6 part (12 hour) film contains pieces from each of the parts
- You can skip past the opening dignitary comments to the film itself

## Preservation vs. Utilization

### Goals and Objectives

**NCSCOS Goal 9:** The learner will explore examples of and opportunities for active citizenship, past and present, at the local and state levels.

**Objective 9.01:** Describe contemporary political, economic, and social issues at the state and local levels and evaluate their impact on the community.

**Objective 9.03:** Describe opportunities for and benefits of civic participation.

## A Brief History of the National Parks

The story of how the National Parks began starts in 1832. An artist named George Catlin took a trip to the Dakotas. He thought the place was beautiful, but he worried about the effect of America’s westward expansion



Petrified Forest

on the Native Americans, the wildlife, and the wilderness. He thought it would be a great idea if some sort of government agency would protect them. He wanted all of us to be able to see and appreciate nature’s beauty, and he wanted to preserve these places for generations to come. He knew it would have to be a government agency because only the federal government could take on such a big project covering many states.

Catlin wrote and talked tirelessly to anyone who would listen, and finally 40 years after he’d first gone west the U.S. Congress made the Yellowstone Country a “pleasuring ground” for the people. Our first National Park was born. In fact, Yellowstone was the first National Park in any country in the world! The year was 1872.

Creating National Parks became quite a popular thing and Sequoia, Yosemite, Mt. Rainier, Crater Lake and Glacier all followed Yellowstone in becoming National Parks. If you look at a map of the United States you’ll see they were all in a particular part of the country. Their location in the west tells us something important about the early creation of National Parks. The preservation of nature was often accompanied by something else and that was the wish to promote tourism. During this time period, before cars and planes and buses, most people traveled by train.



Mount Rainier

Owners of the Western railroads lobbied Congress for many of the early National Parks. People wanted to see the parks, they needed a way to get to them and the railroads knew they’d make money by taking the people to the parks. Once people got to the parks they had to have somewhere to stay and so the railroads made even more money by building big rustic lodges for people to stay in.

By 1916 the Department of the Interior was in charge of 35 parks. With no agency to manage them, U.S. Army troops ended up operating Yellowstone and the California parks. Everyone involved with the parks agreed this was a bad idea. It wasn't the Army's job and the Army didn't want it either.



Yellowstone

Whenever people are involved in something they care about there usually are differing opinions on what should and shouldn't be done. Some people thought the parks should be preserved so they could be used in ways that would economically benefit the people of the United States. They wanted to use the parks for mining, and to graze cattle. They wanted to dam rivers and make reservoirs to both store water in and for making electricity. These people were called utilitarian conservationists.

Another large group of people thought the parks should be preserved and protected in their natural state for all time. They thought using the parks for mining, grazing cattle, and other utilitarian purposes would end up destroying them. The natural beauty and historic importance of the parks would be lost forever. They also recognized an economic benefit in keeping the parks pristine. They believed tourists, both national and international would pay to visit them. These people were called preservationist conservationists.

A wealthy Chicago businessman named Stephen Mather agreed with the preservationist conservationists. Mather had many powerful friends. He began a publicity campaign and even the National Geographic Society got involved. They wrote articles for a variety of magazines and as word got around, more people said, "Yes. Preserve and protect the natural beauty of the parks!"

In 1916 President Woodrow Wilson approved legislation creating a new organization to do just that. It would be called the National Park Service and it would be within the Department of the Interior under the Executive Branch of our government, the office of the President of the United States. Everyone was happy, BUT there was another problem.

The parks were in the West. As much as the railroads liked making money by bringing the people to the parks, in order for the parks to keep the support of Congress and benefit the most people, there would have to be more parks where there were more people.

It had been easier to make parks in the West. The scenery was spectacular. The land sparsely populated, and obtaining it had not been difficult.

To make parks in the East the government had to buy the land or convince people to donate it. That's what happened at Cape Lookout National Seashore. Some of the land was owned by the State of North Carolina and some by individuals. The State donated their land and the U.S. government bought the land owned by the people.



Rocky Mountain

There was another reason the National Park Service wanted to make parks in the East. There were a lot of historic sites. Even the Forest Service had historic parks. The military also had parks honoring places like battlefields and forts.

As time went by we had parks for recreation, scenic recreational motoring, for historic rivers, and monuments. Eventually, the National Park Service would grow to have near 400 units and 20+ title designations for protected areas; and that's as of 2009!



Grand Canyon

# National Parks in America

## Pre-Site Visit Activity

### Description:

Students will uncover the origins of the National Park Service and discuss how political factors shaped the fledgling agency.

### Materials:

National Park System Map and Guide  
A Brief History of the National Parks

### Directions:

1. Open your National Park System Map and Guide
2. As a group, familiarize yourselves with both sides of the map and what each side shows.
3. Read the handout called “A Brief History of the National Parks.”
4. Discuss in your groups the answers to the questions listed below.
5. Where you see a question marked with an **O** it indicates it is an opinion question.
  - Opinions can differ, but come to agreement within your group for a group position.
6. Where you see a question marked with an **F** it indicates it is a factual question for which there is a factual answer.
7. Write your answers on the back of this activity sheet.
8. Share your group’s opinions and facts in the general classroom discussion.

### Questions:

- Why did George Catlin want to create a National Park System? **F**
- Why did Catlin believe a federal government agency had to run a park system? **F**
- What do you think are the advantages and disadvantages to states of having a federal agency operate the parks within their borders? **O**
  - Name 3 advantages and 3 disadvantages.
- Why were Western railroad owners very enthusiastic about the creation of National Parks? **F**
- Why might it have been a bad idea to have U.S. Army Troops running the National Parks? **O**
  - Give 4 reasons for your answer.
- What were the core beliefs of a preservation conservationist and a utilitarian conservationist? **F**
- If the National Parks had first been created in the east, do you think these competing interests of utilitarian vs. preservation would have been the same? Why or Why not? **O**
- Give four ways in which parks in the west are different from parks in the east. **F**
- Which parks, eastern or western, should new parks emulate? **O**

## Superintendent for a Day

### On-Site Visit Activity

**Description:**

Students will act as the park Superintendent of a very large national park and make decisions about which activities are allowed and which are prohibited.

**Directions:**

1. Think about how each of these activities affects visitors and how it affects the park and its wildlife.
2. Check the appropriate box when you decide if you would allow or prohibit each activity.

Activity	Allow	Prohibit	Why or Why Not?
Camping			
Hiking			
Fishing			
Drinking			
Hunting			
Swimming			
Cutting Trees for Firewood			
Cooking			
Campfires			
Gathering Dead Wood for Campfires			
ATVs Off-Road			
Mountain Bikes			
Boating			
Picnicking			
Mining for Gold (designated areas)			
Using Metal Detectors			
Damming Streams (swimming holes)			
Digging for Shipwreck Artifacts			
Picking Flowers			
Harvesting Scallops			
Renting Cabins			
Motor Vehicles			
Recreational Vehicles			

## Preservation vs. Utilization Debate

### On-Site Visit Activity

**Description:**

Students will act as the park Superintendent of a very large national park and make decisions about which activities are allowed and which are prohibited.

**Directions:**

1. In groups of 2-3, select an issue of utilization vs. preservation.
2. Record your group’s information and your opinion on the issue on your Debate Data Sheet.
  - Each group member should have his/her own Debate Data Sheet.
3. Discuss this issue within your group using the sources at the end of this book as well as your own.
4. Identify AT LEAST five supporting facts from at least three different sources.
5. Explain how each detail/fact supports your position on the issue.
6. Each group member should have different supporting facts/details.
  - Think of this like a study group: you are working together to understand the issue, not working on a group project (or taking the test together).
7. Each person should present their position (one issue at a time, if multiple are researched).
8. Once everyone has given a presentation, open the floor for debate on the topic.

Requirement	Possible Points	Points Earned
Research Guide <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At least 5 facts listed</li> <li>• At least 3 sources cited</li> </ul>	30	
Demeanor <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Spoke clearly, slowly, loud enough to be heard</li> <li>• Listened attentively</li> <li>• Was polite/courteous</li> <li>• Was respectful/supportive</li> <li>• Did not monopolize the debate</li> <li>• Spoke well</li> <li>• Spoke with passion/excitement</li> </ul>	30	
Teamwork <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• During prep. was respectful, helpful, kind to teammates, and on-task</li> </ul>	30	
All work is legible, complete, and turned in on time	10	
<b>TOTAL</b>	100	

**Preservation vs. Utilization Debate**  
Data Sheet

<b>ISSUE:</b>
<b>OPINION:</b>

Source	Supporting Facts/Details	Explanation

<b>Source</b>	<b>Supporting Facts/Details</b>	<b>Explanation</b>

## Evaluating Sources for Research

When you are doing research it is important to examine potential sources carefully to ensure you are only using accurate information. This is especially true of internet research. Anyone can post anything on the internet, but just because a website says the moon is made of cheese and grass is made of candy does not make it true.

Sources are often measured in their “strength.” Strong sources are based on solid research and evidence. Weak sources are based on opinions without any factual support. (Note: there is nothing wrong with opinion based sources as long as they support their opinions with facts.) The stronger your sources are the stronger your debate or essay will be.



### General Guidelines

#### Preliminary Evaluation

- Author – Who writes the information is *very* important to the strength of the source. An article on genetic diseases will carry more weight (be a stronger source) if it is written by a medical geneticist than if it is written by an engineer or a surgeon (even though this person is still a doctor). Look for information on the type of degree the author holds, generally at the bottom of the first page.
- Date – The importance of using recent sources varies with the subject. For example, an analysis of the American Revolution from 1920 will likely be similar to an analysis produced today. But, a paper on the history of computers will be very different today than if it was written even just 10 years ago. Since our understanding of things changes over time, it is generally best to work with recent sources.
- Published by – Well established publishers often analyze potential publications more before they are printed than smaller or newer publishing companies. Be aware, also, of the publishing organization’s bias (i.e. anti-government groups are unlikely to print that the government is doing a good job).
- Published in – Is this source on new laws published in one of the many law journals (i.e. *American Law Review* or *Law and Contemporary Problems*) or is published in a popular magazine? Those in the first group are much stronger sources than those in the second. Additionally, those published in established journals will be stronger than those published in those which are newer or less rigorously reviewed.

#### Content Evaluation

- Writing Style – A source written in academic style is stronger than a source written in personal/conversation style. This is especially true of academic subjects like psychology.

- Intended Audience – Sources written for colleagues (by chemists for chemists to review) are stronger than sources written for the general public. This is because other chemists will catch errors or false reports when the general public might not.
- Reasoning – Ask yourself: is this argument logical? “We should allow people to continue camp in the park because they are not damaging the land and it gives people a better appreciation for the environment” is a much better argument than “We should allow people to continue to camp in the park because I like to camp.”
- Reviews – Search for reviews of this source. What do other experts in the field think about this validity of these arguments? (This is a good reason to pick sources more than 2 years old.)

### Special Considerations for Web Sources

- Author – While printed materials almost always have an author or group of authors, many internet resources do not have this information. It is best to exclude sources with no author or established organization (like the American Red Cross or U.S. Geological Survey). Ask yourself: Why wouldn't the author want credit for this work?
- Sources Cited – Many strong internet publications will have a bibliography and cite these sources in the text. Once you verify that these sources exist (a library search engine helps), this goes a long way towards establishing the credibility of the source.
- Tone – Think about how these words would sound this was a speech. If you like, read the words out loud to yourself. Is the author upset or angry? It is often best to exclude sources which are written in an angry or upset tone because they are often based on emotion without any facts. However, if most or all of the other criteria for a strong source are met, it is okay to use a source with a weakness in tone. But, it is risky to use a claim from this type of source that is not supported in other sources. If you cannot find support for the claim, you can either mention this in your report or leave the claim out.
- Grammar and Spelling – Sources with poor grammar and spelling are much less likely to have been written by experts and were almost certainly not subject to a scholarly review. Do not use these sources.
- Comprehensive – Strong sources will acknowledge that there are other viewpoints and will address them in the paper or essay.



# Cape Lookout National Seashore Preserve OR Use

Circle one answer only.

Name \_\_\_\_\_

- A trip to this place inspired George Catlin to begin the long struggle to establish America's first National Park.  
the New Mexico territory                      the Dakotas                      Mt. Rainier                      the Mississippi River
- America's first National Park is-----  
Mt. Rushmore                      The Black Hills                      Yellowstone                      Denali
- All of the first National Parks were in the Mid-West.  
False                      True
- Which group of businessmen were particularly happy about the creation of National Parks?  
Saloon Keepers                      General Store Owners                      Western Railroad Owners  
Librarians
- Which group was the first to operate and manage the National Parks?  
California State Police league                      U.S. Army                      National Park Service                      Wildlife Service
- In order to gain Congress's continuing support for creating National Parks there had to be more parks in what part of the U.S.?  
Northern                      Southern                      Eastern                      Western
- As the fight over what to use the National Parks for started, 2 groups formed, they were-----  
Preserve/Protect                      Preservationists/Utilitarianists                      Democrats/Republicans                      Pros/Cons
- Consider the current issue of allowing the use of ORVs (off-road vehicles) at Cape Hatteras National Seashore. The fight over what to do with the National Parks never really ended.  
False                      True
- The reason visitors come to Cape Lookout National Seashore is to-----  
Get away from it all                      Relax                      Picnic                      See the Lighthouse  
All of above                      None of the above
- If you were asked to classify what kind of park Cape Hatteras National Seashore is, you would be correct if you said-----  
Utilitarian Conservationist                      Prohibitionist Conservationist                      Preservationist Conservationist
- If you had to tell someone which group best represented your viewpoint, would it be-----  
100% utilitarian conservationist                      50% preservation/50% utilitarian conservationist  
100% preservation conservationist



# “America’s Best Idea”

## Viewer’s Guide

**Description:**

This guide is designed to be used as students are watching the NPS screening version (56 minutes) of “The National Parks: America’s Best Idea” by Ken Burns.

1. How many acres are protected as National Parks?
  
2. In Europe, the grand places (parks and palaces) are owned by \_\_\_\_\_,  
but in America these places are owned by \_\_\_\_\_.
  
3. It has been said that you can’t be American without a genuine link to \_\_\_\_\_.
  
4. Who set into motion most of the conservation efforts that defined the 20<sup>th</sup> century?
  
5. What bird sanctuary was the first wildlife refuge?
  
6. What does the inscription in the arch over the entrance to Yellowstone N.P. say?
  
7. Kilauea (pronounced Kill-oh-way-ah) is the legendary home of what goddess?
  
8. Why were the Silverswords of Hawai’i threatened with extinction?
  
9. How much money was appropriated for the new Hawai’i National Park?

10. What was the annual salary of the first Rangers?
11. Claire Marie Hodge became the Park Service's first \_\_\_\_\_.
12. Name one of the "silly questions" the film mentioned Rangers are asked.
13. What couple in the film documented their extensive travels through the National Parks?
14. What replaced the car stickers as a means of "collecting" National Parks?
15. How many National Parks has photographer Tuan Luong visited?



**The fundamental idea behind the parks ... is that the country belongs to the people.  
Franklin D. Roosevelt**

Additional Resources:

“National Park System Map and Guide” from National Park Service

[http://www.pueblo.gsa.gov/cic\\_text/travel/parkserv/parkserv.htm](http://www.pueblo.gsa.gov/cic_text/travel/parkserv/parkserv.htm)

Includes map of the National Park System and a list of the parks.

“Evolution of an Idea” from National Park Service

<http://www.nps.gov/americasbestidea/templates/timeline.html>

Timeline of the parks (America’s best idea)

“Criteria for New National Parks” document

<http://planning.nps.gov/document/Criteria%20for%20New%20Parklands.pdf>

Information for debate.

“Park History: How the National Seashores Came to Be” by Kurt Repanshek

<http://www.nationalparkstraveler.com/2007/11/park-history-how-national-seashores-came-be2174>

Information for debate. Suggestion: focus on Cape Lookout and Cape Hatteras.

“To Graze or Not to Graze” by Ed Smith

[http://lomapieta.sierraclub.org/lp9912\\_Grazing.html](http://lomapieta.sierraclub.org/lp9912_Grazing.html)

Information for debate.

“Pillaged Preserves: Livestock in National Parks and Wilderness Areas” by Andy Kerr and Mark Salvo

[http://www.publiclandsranching.org/htmlres/wr\\_pillaged\\_preserves.htm](http://www.publiclandsranching.org/htmlres/wr_pillaged_preserves.htm)

Information for debate.

“Energy Corridors, Power Lines Threaten National Parkland” from the National Parks Conservation Association

[http://www.npca.org/media\\_center/fact\\_sheets/energy\\_corridors.html](http://www.npca.org/media_center/fact_sheets/energy_corridors.html)

Information for debate.

“More than 600 Turn Out to Hear about Looming Threat to Beach Access” by Jim and Ginny Luizer

<http://www.islandfreepress.org/2008Archives/03.28.2008-MoreThan600TurnOutForMeeting.html>

Information for debate.

“About 1,500 Rally to Save Off-Road-Vehicle Privileges in N.C.” by Catherine Kozak

<http://hamptonroads.com/2008/03/about-1500-rally-save-offroadvehicle-privileges>

Information for debate.

“Fact Sheet – ORV Use In Our National Parks” from Wildlands CPR

<http://www.wildlandscpr.org/fact-sheet-orv-use-our-national-parks>

Information for debate.