United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
Cape Cod National Seashore
99 Marconi Site Road
Wellfleet, MA 02667

IN REPLY REFER TO:

H30
xL3035

November 28, 2011

Brona Simon
State Historic Preservation Officer
Massachusetts Historical Commission
220 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125

RE: Demolition of Five North Beach Island Cottages in Chatham: Sampson-Bloomer, Crowell, Dubis, Pratt-Carroll, and Lumpkin Cottages

Dear Ms. Simon:

Pursuant to Sections 106 and 110 of the National Historic Preservation Act, Advisory Council regulations 36CFR 800, and the 2008 Servicewide Programmatic Agreement, we ask for your concurrence in our finding of no historic properties affected for demolition of five structures on North Beach Island, Chatham, owned by the National Park Service (NPS). Our correspondence on this matter with your office on September 9, 2011 requested concurrence on the demolition of six structures; however, one structure, the Crowell Shed, washed away during a storm on October 29-30.

On November 22, 2011 the Keeper of the National Register determined that the structures are not eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.

Sincerely,

George E. Price, Jr.
Superintendent

I concur with the above stated determination of no historic properties affected for the demolition of the Sampson-Bloomer, Crowell, Dubis, Pratt-Carroll, and Lumpkin cottages.

_____

Massachusetts State Historic Preservation Officer

Enclosure

cc: Katry Harris, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
Caroline D. Hall, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
John M. Fowler, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
Ken Salazar, U.S. Secretary of the Interior
Jon Jarvis, Director, National Park Service
Vick Knox, Associate Director, Park Planning, Facilities and Land, National Park Service
Wampanoag Tribe of Gay Head (Aquinnah)
Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe
Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe
National Trust for Historic Preservation
U.S. Senator John Kerry
U.S. Senator Scott Brown
U.S. Representative William Keating
State Representative Sarah Peake
State Senator Dan Wolf
Jill R. Goldsmith, Chatham Town Manager
Florence Selden, Chair, Chatham Board of Selectmen
Robert D. Oliver, Chairman, Chatham Historical Commission
Chatham Historical Society
Cape Cod National Seashore Advisory Commission
Ted Keon, Town of Chatham Director of Coastal Resources
Chatham Conservation Commission
Kirk Ranzetta, Cardno ENTRIX
William Hammatt
Robert Long, Town of Chatham North Beach Advisory Committee
Duane Landreth, Esq., LaTanzi, Spaulding & Landreth, P.C.
Loris VanLare
Christopher Lindquist
Donna and Gladys Lumpkin
Jean Allison Young
Roger and Susan Carroll
North Beach Island Residents (Brown/Smith Camp, Long Camp, Adams Camp, Gould/Schluter Camp, Carroll Camp, Dubis Camp, Bloomer Camp, Homer/Kelly Camp, Kaup/O'Connell Camp, Lumpkin Camp, Crowell Camp)
Naomi Turner, David Veach
Robin Dubis-Zibrat
Robert Crowell
Arthur Bloomer
Sally and Donald Gould, Jr.
R. Anzalone

United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
1849 C Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240

DETERMINATION OF ELIGIBILITY NOTIFICATION

National Register of Historic Places
National Park Service

Project Name: North Beach Island Cottages

Location: Barnstable County, Massachusetts **State:** Massachusetts

Request submitted by: Michael Caldwell, Deputy Regional Director, NERO, NPS

Date received: 11/4/2011 **Additional information received:**

Eligibility

Name of property	SHPO Opinion	Secretary of the Interior's opinion	Criteria
Sampson-Bloomer Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	
Crowell Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	
Crowell Shed Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	
Dubis Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	
Pratt-Carroll Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	
Lumpkin Cottage	Eligible	Not Eligible	

See attached Determination of Eligibility Notification for detailed comment.

Patrick Andrus
Keeper of the National Register

Date: 11/22/2011

United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
1849 C Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240

DETERMINATION OF ELIGIBILITY NOTIFICATION

National Register of Historic Places
National Park Service

Project Name: North Beach Island Cottages

Location: Barnstable County, Massachusetts **State:** Massachusetts

---

This Determination of Eligibility request is for five cottages and one shed (the Sampson-Bloomer, Crowell, Crowell Shed, Dubis, Pratt-Carroll, and Lumpkin cottages) located on North Beach Island in the Cape Cod National Seashore at Chatham, MA. All of the buildings are owned by the National Park Service. We have been informed by the Superintendent of the National Seashore that after the determination of eligibility request was submitted, the Crowell Shed was destroyed in a storm.

The five cottages were all constructed of new materials in 1992, replacing earlier buildings destroyed in the 1991 "No Name Storm." These nineteen year old buildings are not eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, either individually or collectively as a historic district, because they are not of exceptional importance as required by the National Register Criteria for Evaluation for properties achieving significance within the last fifty years.

The Massachusetts State Historic Preservation Officer in a letter of 10/7/2011, has suggested that two earlier National Register determinations of eligibility (the Dune Shacks of Peaked Hill Bars Historic District in Provincetown and the Mitchell River Bridge in Chatham) are relevant to the eligibility of the North Beach Island Cottages. The two determinations of eligibility cited are for properties with historic and architectural significance and are very different from the North Beach Island Cottages. In 1989, the Dune Shacks of Peaked Hill Bars Historic District was determined to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places under National Register Criteria A, B, and C for its role in American art, literature, and theater, for its association with the life of American poet Harry Kemp, and for its architectural importance for its significant concentration of a rare, fragile property type. The North Beach Island Cottages are not associated with significant events or people, and are not exceptionally important for architecture. The 2010 determination of eligibility for the Mitchell River Bridge in Chatham found that the thirty year old bridge, the last remaining single-leaf wooden drawbridge in Massachusetts (and perhaps in the entire United States), was of exceptional historic and engineering importance under National Register Criteria A and C and Criteria Consideration G. The cottages are not rare surviving examples of an important historic type of structure, nor are they of exceptional importance for history or architecture.